

# OPUS2

ScottishCovid-19Inquiry

Day 28

March 21, 2024

Opus2 - Official Court Reporters

Phone: 02045188448

Email: [transcripts@opus2.com](mailto:transcripts@opus2.com)

Website: <https://www.opus2.com>

1 Thursday, 21 March 2024  
 2 (9.45 am)  
 3 THE CHAIR: Good morning, Ms Bahrami. I apologise, I had  
 4 been expecting Mr Dunlop, which is not your fault, I'm  
 5 sure.  
 6 MS BAHRAMI: Good morning, my Lord. Yes, we have two  
 7 witnesses this morning, first the Scottish Intensive  
 8 Care Society followed by the British Medical  
 9 Association. Mr Dunlop will be taking evidence from the  
 10 British Medical Association.  
 11 THE CHAIR: My programme had it the other way around, which  
 12 is why I was a little taken aback. I'm very sorry.  
 13 I apologise. That doesn't matter. Right. Thank you.  
 14 DR BARBARA MILES (called)  
 15 THE CHAIR: Good morning, Dr Miles.  
 16 A. Good morning.  
 17 THE CHAIR: Everyone ready to go?  
 18 MS BAHRAMI: Yes, my Lord.  
 19 THE CHAIR: Please start.  
 20 MS BAHRAMI: Thank you.  
 21 Questions by MS BAHRAMI  
 22 MS BAHRAMI: Good morning, Dr Miles. Please could you start  
 23 by telling us a bit about your own background and about  
 24 the Scottish Intensive Care Society, including which  
 25 members which professionals sorry are members

1

1 of the society?  
 2 A. So the Scottish Intensive Care Society is a professional  
 3 society whose membership consists of medical  
 4 professionals and people who work in allied health  
 5 professions. So we have members that are doctors,  
 6 doctors in training, nurses, dieticians, pharmacists,  
 7 physiotherapists. Everybody who is a member has  
 8 a connection with the Scottish critical care community,  
 9 works within the Scottish critical care community, and  
 10 the society was founded in the early 1990s to represent  
 11 and promote the speciality of intensive care in Scotland.  
 12 Intensive care is a relatively new speciality. It didn't  
 13 exist before the it's less than 50 years old well,  
 14 60 years old and we try and promote community and  
 15 collaboration, education and represent our members as  
 16 required.  
 17 I am a doctor in intensive care medicine and  
 18 anaesthesia. I work within an intensive care unit in  
 19 Glasgow as a consultant and I have done for the last  
 20 20 years or so.  
 21 Q. Thank you very much.  
 22 I want to start at paragraph 24. There you say that  
 23 "NHS service delivery was significantly disrupted".  
 24 Are you referring there to intensive care services or  
 25 other services outwith intensive care or both?

2

1 A. Both really. So much of normalcy was disrupted. As our  
 2 intensive care and critical care provision expanded in  
 3 many areas, that meant alternate ways of working  
 4 working in places that we didn't normally work and using  
 5 a staff base of people who didn't normally work in  
 6 intensive care. And other aspects of healthcare were  
 7 disrupted as they paused, altered what they did. Some  
 8 services continued with remote working. Other places  
 9 shut down. A lot of the planned operating capacity shut  
 10 down during the first wave of COVID.  
 11 Q. Thank you. You do say that ICU capacity was expanded to  
 12 levels never seen before in this country. How were the  
 13 plans to expand intensive care viewed by you and  
 14 colleagues? Was it welcome news or were there concerns?  
 15 Was it positive disruption or was it concerning?  
 16 A. I think there had been plans most people had some  
 17 plans to deal with potential expansion around flu issues  
 18 and we have seen some various flu outbreaks over recent  
 19 years, but we had never, I think, planned or experienced  
 20 the rapid expansion that was required in some areas, and  
 21 so I don't think that most people's plans were well  
 22 formed for having to expand at the pace that was  
 23 required in the end. The support that was given for  
 24 expansion was welcome but there was trepidation also  
 25 because we were going, to some extent, into the unknown.

3

1 Q. Thank you. At paragraph 26 you state that:  
 2 "Island critical care units, whilst normally not  
 3 funded to provide level 3 care, provided some level 3  
 4 care during the pandemic."  
 5 Firstly, please, would you tell us what's meant by  
 6 a "funded level 3 care bed"?  
 7 A. So levels of care, as we use them in critical care, were  
 8 defined by in the UK were defined by the UK Intensive  
 9 Care Society some years ago. Level 3 care refers to  
 10 care that can only be delivered by an intensive care  
 11 unit. The normal recommended staffing levels for that  
 12 are a one to one trained critical care nurse per shift  
 13 looking after that one patient, that the care is  
 14 provided by some clinicians who have experience in  
 15 critical care, intensive care medicine, and there's  
 16 a supporting team of professionals, pharmacists,  
 17 physiotherapists, who also provide essential care for  
 18 that patient. The funding refers to the funding for  
 19 those staff. You can have an empty bed in a critical  
 20 care unit but without the staff funding to put a patient  
 21 in that bed and deliver that level of staffing.  
 22 Level 2 care is normally what we refer to as "high  
 23 dependency care". It's in the definitions that were  
 24 applied during the pandemic, that was support for  
 25 patients who had failing organ systems, say, for

4

1 example, respiratory failure or circulatory failure  
 2 one single system that required support and required  
 3 a higher or potentially required a higher level of  
 4 nursing than they might get on a ward area.  
 5 Traditionally , level 2 care has two nurses looking after  
 6 one patient per shift .  
 7 Q. Now, you said islands don't usually have this and they  
 8 would usually transfer patients to mainland intensive  
 9 care units. Was the funding of level 3 beds carried out  
 10 in an effort to reduce the spread of COVID?  
 11 A. In terms of they didn't get they produced they  
 12 provided some level 3 care because they had no choice at  
 13 the time because there was it was difficult initially  
 14 in the first wave to arrange flight transport because of  
 15 the concerns. Because of the concerns around infection  
 16 spreading and how to do a flight transport for a patient  
 17 with COVID, the transfers took a little bit longer than  
 18 normal and so they had to provide that care until they  
 19 could transfer a patient. They didn't get extra  
 20 funding. It wasn't a planned delivery of level 3 care.  
 21 Q. How were they able to staff those beds? Presumably they  
 22 wouldn't have had ICU nurses, ICU consultants, junior  
 23 doctors  
 24 A. Well, they always have to provide some degree of  
 25 stabilisation and support until the patient can be

5

1 transferred off the island, so they have that provision .  
 2 They have high dependency units and anaesthetic doctors  
 3 on site which hope usually provide the stabilisation  
 4 and care until the patient is transferred.  
 5 Q. Thank you. Were those professionals were they  
 6 present at a sufficient level to allay any concerns that  
 7 there might have been about staffing in those units or  
 8 was it just , you know, "This is what we have to do until  
 9 we can reach the next stage?"  
 10 A. I haven't asked that question directly of those boards.  
 11 I'd need to ask the question directly to be able to  
 12 answer that. But in the initial waves of the pandemic,  
 13 I don't think people were moving to island boards to  
 14 work.  
 15 Q. Thank you. Please could you tell us about the situation  
 16 in which ICU patients, both from islands and on the  
 17 mainland, would be transferred to a different ICU  
 18 pre pandemic and during the pandemic?  
 19 A. So in the I suppose in the late 2015 to 2020, most  
 20 of the time the patients were transferred from one board  
 21 or one hospital in one board to another because they  
 22 required specialist care that was only available in that  
 23 other centre. So, for example, if they required  
 24 specialist cardiothoracic care or they required  
 25 specialist neurosurgical care, they may need to move to

6

1 another hospital to have that care delivered.  
 2 We didn't commonly move patients because we had run  
 3 out of capacity to we had no empty bed in that unit.  
 4 During the pandemic some units did reach even under  
 5 their expanded footprint, reach capacity and some  
 6 patients were transferred to another health board or to  
 7 another hospital within their own health board because  
 8 there wasn't, at that moment, an empty bed for them to  
 9 be placed in.  
 10 Q. Now, the public might think that the transfer alleviates  
 11 pressure from the transferring hospital but in fact it  
 12 puts pressure on the staff base; is that right?  
 13 A. Yeah.  
 14 Q. Could you  
 15 A. It's not so say, for example, prior to in the  
 16 early 2000s, within the west of Scotland, we had  
 17 a transfer team which would move patients between  
 18 hospitals as required for intensive care transfers, and  
 19 that was outwith the staffing of the base hospitals.  
 20 When after some reorganisation that team was  
 21 disbanded that was the only team of its nature within  
 22 Scotland and it was disbanded in later years and it  
 23 doesn't exist anymore. So therefore transfers of any  
 24 nature, someone has to go with the patient and then  
 25 so therefore you are often taking if the sending

7

1 hospital has reached capacity, it may not have easily  
 2 spare staff identified to go with that patient and so it  
 3 often is difficult . And each transfer takes time, and  
 4 the issue for slightly more remote hospitals is it's  
 5 quite a long way to the other hospital and so to get  
 6 there and get back takes additional time. So the  
 7 sending hospital loses some of its staff when it's under  
 8 a degree of pressure to hopefully relieve some of that  
 9 pressure.  
 10 Q. Yes, in the longer term.  
 11 A. In the long term, but it does mean you cannot  
 12 realistically send four patients in half an hour to  
 13 another hospital.  
 14 Q. Firstly , I wonder how that requirement for staff was  
 15 met. How were the responsibilities in ICU the level  
 16 of care maintained while those staff were sent or was it  
 17 that  
 18 A. I think each individual area would have had to find its  
 19 own solution to that and so I can't as I haven't  
 20 asked about it in detail , I can't say what each  
 21 individual area did or the society can't say about what  
 22 each individual area did. But most people would look to  
 23 what was available within their hospital and try to come  
 24 to the best solution they could at the time to send the  
 25 most appropriate patient person and staff with the

8

1 patient whilst trying to maintain the best care they  
 2 could.  
 3 Q. For the others.  
 4 You mentioned pre pandemic transfer would have taken  
 5 place for specialist care. Where an ICU unit wasn't at  
 6 capacity or perhaps it was but it was thought that this  
 7 patient would be better in a different setting would  
 8 fare better in a different setting but the staff  
 9 capacity wasn't there, did hospitals have to make  
 10 difficult decisions about whether they could just try  
 11 to manage a patient in their own ICU and delay transfer  
 12 or ...?  
 13 A. Sorry, I'm not sure I understand your point.  
 14 Q. So, for example, you said that a patient might prior  
 15 to the pandemic, a reason for transfer would have been  
 16 that the patient requires specialist cardiology care,  
 17 for example, and that's better provided in a different  
 18 centre. During the pandemic, if there was such an  
 19 instance where it wasn't a concern about bed capacity  
 20 but, rather, this patient might do better in a different  
 21 centre but there was an issue with the staff base, were  
 22 those transfers delayed or did a difficult decision have  
 23 to be made about whether the care needed could somehow  
 24 be provided in that centre?  
 25 A. That's again that's not a question I've asked of our

1 membership so to answer that for the entirety of the  
 2 community I'd probably have to ask that directly  
 3 Q. Sure.  
 4 A. but possibly, but to what extent we would need to  
 5 ask more detail from the membership.  
 6 Q. Sure. Are you aware of how vehicle contamination  
 7 decontamination was dealt with and who carried out that  
 8 work?  
 9 A. No, but the for any patient that's had an infectious  
 10 organism within any environment in healthcare, there's  
 11 a lot of decontamination of that environment that takes  
 12 place before another member of the public or another  
 13 patient can utilise that area. So ambulances and  
 14 aeroplanes had to be decontaminated more than usual  
 15 after and that process takes longer. Who did it and how  
 16 they did it ...  
 17 Q. We'll ask another organisation. Thank you.  
 18 Now, we're aware that aerosol generating procedures  
 19 were particularly risky during the pandemic. How were  
 20 those performed in shared ICU bays? Were they performed  
 21 in shared bays?  
 22 A. Yes, so the aerosol generating procedures what was  
 23 defined as "aerosol generating procedures" during the  
 24 pandemic were performed throughout in various areas  
 25 of the hospital. They were performed in ICUs, theatres,

1 high dependencies, some wards, and there was various  
 2 guidance about what you could do where at various points  
 3 of the pandemic, which slightly changed through the  
 4 pandemic. If you had a if a patient with an  
 5 infectious organism like COVID was having an  
 6 aerosol generating procedure, they ideally should be  
 7 well, they were placed in a single isolation room and  
 8 once say, for example, an area had a number of  
 9 patients with the same organism, they may be placed in  
 10 a shared bay and then aerosol generating procedures be  
 11 performed within that shared bay, but the patients all  
 12 had the same disease. The issue with that was that if  
 13 you there may have been empty bays in that area but  
 14 you couldn't utilise them for patients that didn't have  
 15 that condition and so they had to remain empty.  
 16 Q. Yes.  
 17 A. So it didn't make sometimes it made placement of  
 18 patients quite difficult because there may be capacity  
 19 in one area but it couldn't be utilised because of the  
 20 infection risk.  
 21 Q. So that presumably put more pressure on planning  
 22 A. Yes.  
 23 Q. and utilising spaces?  
 24 A. Separating patient groups required more areas and more  
 25 adaptation of those areas than we would normally

1 require.  
 2 Q. Thank you. At paragraph 32 you state that green  
 3 surgical HDU beds were created for those isolating for  
 4 two weeks to prepare for elective surgery or procedures.  
 5 What's meant there by "elective surgery"?  
 6 A. "Elective" means planned surgery as opposed to emergency  
 7 surgery. I suppose the example would be, when you are  
 8 placed on a waiting list to have surgery and then when  
 9 your surgery is prepared, you know you're having it  
 10 you elect to have surgery as opposed to have it as an  
 11 emergency.  
 12 Q. Did elective surgeries continue throughout the pandemic  
 13 without interruption or did it depend on the type of  
 14 elective surgery?  
 15 A. So that's not exactly our focus of interest but in  
 16 terms of the Scottish Intensive Care Society. We look  
 17 after patients after elective surgery sometimes but some  
 18 surgery I think continued my impression is that  
 19 some most health boards attempted to continue  
 20 providing some kind of elective surgery but a lot of  
 21 elective surgery was paused. But cancer surgery, say,  
 22 for example, people did prioritise through the pandemic.  
 23 Health boards would be able to tell you how much they  
 24 paused their elective surgery.  
 25 Q. Okay. So I have a few questions following on from that,

1 but I think maybe the health boards might be more  
 2 appropriate. I suppose a question for you, though,  
 3 would be: how much say did intensive care clinicians  
 4 have over when elective surgeries should take place?  
 5 You know, as the pandemic went on, did you have an idea  
 6 of how much capacity there might be and were you able to  
 7 raise concerns if you thought that we might not have an  
 8 ICU bed available following surgery?  
 9 A. I think there were ongoing conversations between  
 10 different groups about this on a daily basis.  
 11 Generally, I think all clinicians and all healthcare  
 12 people are keen to allow surgery to progress because  
 13 it's helpful to the patient, but it is actually also  
 14 quite difficult to predict how much capacity will be  
 15 available on any daily basis because there's always  
 16 a level of unpredictability about emergency work. So,  
 17 yes so sometimes I think there were difficult  
 18 conversations around that, but there were conversations.  
 19 Q. Thank you. The next question again might be better  
 20 suited for the health board so please do say. In  
 21 paragraph 37 you've mentioned the erection of temporary  
 22 buildings, such as tents, partitions and so on, to deal  
 23 with isolation capacity issues. Do you have knowledge  
 24 of the ease with which these things were arranged, the  
 25 costs, how soon they were able to take place or

1 should I  
 2 A. I think you would get more detail from health boards  
 3 around this, but they were by definition they  
 4 happened after the first wave because it took some time.  
 5 Nothing happens in a week. So most of these the  
 6 temporary buildings and the tents happened after the  
 7 first wave but some of the additional ventilation and  
 8 partitions, they were temporary things that could be  
 9 installed more rapidly, so some of those may have  
 10 happened more rapidly.  
 11 Q. Do you think that they were more useful than  
 12 transferring patients to other hospitals?  
 13 A. Transferring patients to other hospitals would require  
 14 people in the other place to have capacity also and so  
 15 I think that was a very capacity varied through the  
 16 pandemic. It wasn't the the areas that came under  
 17 pressure in critical care were not the pressure was  
 18 not equal at equal points of the pandemic. So it came  
 19 differently through each wave and say, for example,  
 20 some parts of Scotland had far more capacity issues than  
 21 other parts, just as the COVID spread differently  
 22 through the country, so you'd have to examine capacity  
 23 issues around different ways in the pandemic and look at  
 24 what was it's quite a complicated question to answer  
 25 and would require quite a lot of analysis of

1 information.  
 2 Q. Thank you. At paragraph 38 you state that:  
 3 "Essential staff could not always access a mask that  
 4 fitted them, meaning that they could not work in all  
 5 environments."  
 6 What effect did that have on staff morale and  
 7 patient care?  
 8 A. So the supplies of FFP3 masks changed as we attempted to  
 9 source. We used more so we needed to order more and we  
 10 had different manufacturers and different types  
 11 arriving, and then you had to fit each staff member to  
 12 the new type of mask and, if the particular staff member  
 13 did not fit any of the masks you had available at the  
 14 time, they could not work in a place where they were  
 15 required to wear an FFP3 mask. So that essentially  
 16 meant occasionally some staff who had the skill set to  
 17 be working in that area could not work in that area and  
 18 potentially then other staff replaced them with lesser  
 19 skill sets.  
 20 Q. Was that quite frustrating for some, to not be able to  
 21 provide the care that they're so used to providing?  
 22 A. I think rostering had never been dependent on masks  
 23 prior to this situation. It wasn't I think it  
 24 affected different members differently and sometimes it  
 25 was more of an issue than others, but people worked

1 round it to find solutions. They had no choice.  
 2 Q. And so, through careful rostering, were the effects on  
 3 patient care mitigated?  
 4 A. That's not a question I can answer because I didn't ask  
 5 people that specifically. It's an issue that people  
 6 raised but they didn't always comment on the  
 7 consequence  
 8 Q. Okay. So there were concerns about that but they did  
 9 their best  
 10 A. Yes.  
 11 Q. to deal with the situation.  
 12 A. Hmm.  
 13 Q. Thank you. At paragraph 39 you state that drug supply  
 14 levels were problematic throughout the pandemic. Was  
 15 this do you know whether that was a national issue or  
 16 an international issue? Was there a global shortage?  
 17 A. Yes. So the requirement for certain drugs increased  
 18 dramatically throughout the world so therefore it was an  
 19 issue that applied to lots of countries and also  
 20 manufacturing became problematic, I gather, in some  
 21 areas because, if the plants shut down for whatever  
 22 reason, then the supply wasn't coming through. So there  
 23 was a significant increase in demand for certain  
 24 sedative agents for ICUs and muscle relaxants and some  
 25 drugs that help support people's blood pressure. We

1 needed to use them more and it was and many countries  
 2 needed to use them more, and so the distribution of  
 3 those to areas of need I think we had a national  
 4 allocation system throughout Scotland but, as I think  
 5 our pharmacy members have pointed out in their  
 6 submissions, the need varied through each wave because  
 7 there wasn't the same number of critical care patients  
 8 in each wave in each board, and so dividing solely by  
 9 the board size perhaps did not meet the need as well as  
 10 dividing by the number of patients in that critical care  
 11 unit at the time.  
 12 Q. How did clinicians manage or deal with this problem?  
 13 Did you have to consider substitute  
 14 A. Yes, so I think there were substitute drugs available,  
 15 substitute methods, so people did what they could with  
 16 substitution and alternative agents.  
 17 Q. Did that have quite an impact on, again, staff morale?  
 18 A. In times of pressure, it takes up I think less head  
 19 space to use stuff that you're more familiar with. To  
 20 have to use stuff that you're less familiar with, that  
 21 isn't your normal practice, especially when you're  
 22 working with people a lot of people that are new to  
 23 the area because they've come in to provide you with  
 24 support, it probably would have been easier if we had  
 25 been able to stick to our normal drugs and our normal

1 practice more, but if you don't have that drug, you have  
 2 to make do with what you can substitute. And some of  
 3 the substitutes are equally valid drugs. They're just  
 4 not what you would normally use in routine practice.  
 5 Q. In terms of trying to prevent that in future, I take it  
 6 that it would be very difficult because you wouldn't  
 7 know what might be needed in the event of a future  
 8 pandemic or the numbers or individual conditions or  
 9 do you think there is a case for stockpiling certain  
 10 drugs?  
 11 A. There might I mean, that's a conversation that  
 12 happens quite there's quite a lot of ongoing drug  
 13 shortages now because of the various issues in the  
 14 world.  
 15 Q. Yes.  
 16 A. But you can have that on a national basis but then  
 17 the issues some of these issues, as you've touched  
 18 on, were international. So I'm not sure that's within  
 19 our scope to solve that problem but I think it possibly  
 20 is an area that could do with some examination.  
 21 Q. Thank you. You go on in the next paragraph to talk  
 22 about the shortage of fluids for renal replacement  
 23 therapy for continuous filtration and that some units  
 24 had to make more use of haemodialysis where they may not  
 25 have used that. Is the first method preferable to the

1 second and, if it is, why is that?  
 2 A. So I'd say "preferable" is probably not the right word.  
 3 "Usual" would be the right  
 4 Q. Okay.  
 5 A. Most intensive care units in the UK use continuous  
 6 filtration as their method of renal replacement therapy.  
 7 You can use haemodialysis, it's what renal units use for  
 8 the majority of cases, but they're not and there are  
 9 some intensive care units that use haemodialysis as  
 10 their routine care, but if most units are using  
 11 continuous filtration and then they can't do that and  
 12 they're far less familiar with haemodialysis and the  
 13 equipment involved and the technique, to switch between  
 14 one to the other is quite a significant learning hurdle.  
 15 Usually making that switch would involve a lot of  
 16 training and familiarisation with staff that would take  
 17 place over weeks to months, if not years, and some  
 18 people had to make that switch quite rapidly.  
 19 Q. Yes. So that was the main issue? Rather than  
 20 necessarily an effect on patient care  
 21 A. No.  
 22 Q. It was, again, staffing and resources and training?  
 23 A. And education and familiarity.  
 24 Q. Now, moving on to hospital oxygen, is oxygen created  
 25 using oxygen concentrators in hospitals or is it taken

1 from cylinders that are delivered or a combination?  
 2 A. So it's not normally delivered with oxygen  
 3 concentrators, although some of those were used in some  
 4 hospitals during the pandemic. Oxygen in a hospital is  
 5 usually delivered in a tank to a vacuum insulated  
 6 evaporator, a big tank that sits out the back somewhere  
 7 in the hospital, and it provides supply to a pipeline.  
 8 So most big hospitals have one of these tanks or more  
 9 than one of these tanks.  
 10 But the supply of oxygen to a hospital is what the  
 11 hospital would normally expect to have for its normal  
 12 capacity, for what it would normally do. In common with  
 13 the drug supplies, if you think of oxygen as a drug,  
 14 having to have so much more delivery, you are not  
 15 normally resourced to have that much more delivery, and  
 16 so some hospitals were using much more of their oxygen  
 17 than they would normally and the tank can only deliver  
 18 a certain amount of oxygen at a certain rate, and so  
 19 people were worried that they were going to reach the  
 20 limits of their oxygen supply and started thinking about  
 21 what they would do if that happened.  
 22 Q. Yes. To your knowledge, did it ever impact patient  
 23 care?  
 24 A. Not to my knowledge, but it is something as we could  
 25 tell from talking to our members, it is something

1 that it was discussed more than had ever been  
 2 discussed before.  
 3 Q. So another factor that was adding to the mental strain  
 4 on clinicians?  
 5 A. I think it was if the the more we converted  
 6 a lot of hospitals used some anaesthetic machines as  
 7 ventilators during the initial waves of the pandemic to  
 8 allow them to have enough ventilators to manage the  
 9 demand. Anaesthetic ventilators are usually run,  
 10 driven, by oxygen supply. It helps them go up and down,  
 11 deliver gas to patients. A lot of hospitals converted  
 12 those machines to run on air supply because they were  
 13 concerned that that extra oxygen utilisation would  
 14 denude their supplies.  
 15 Q. So difficult decisions had to be made to prioritise  
 16 A. So there you can the anaesthetic machines can run  
 17 on air. They just don't normally because on the long  
 18 term it's better for them to run on oxygen. So they  
 19 function effectively running on air, but that was work  
 20 that was done to preserve the oxygen supplies for  
 21 delivery to patients that might need extra oxygen in  
 22 wards and other parts of the hospital, in other ICUs.  
 23 Q. Thank you. Now, you state that staff with no training  
 24 or experience in critical care were redeployed from  
 25 other areas to ICU and HDU, and of course this meant

1 that they required additional support and additional  
 2 training. Did critical care clinicians have concerns  
 3 about this redeployment and was it helpful or efficient  
 4 to redeploy staff?  
 5 A. I think so in order to have expanded critical care  
 6 capacity as you have a set staff base of experienced  
 7 clinicians in a critical care or intensive care or high  
 8 dependency unit, if you wished to expand the capacity,  
 9 the only options are to ask for the help of colleagues  
 10 from other areas to help maintain a staff base or you  
 11 try and staff those extra numbers of beds with the staff  
 12 base you already have, which means you have we were  
 13 talking about there usually we have one critical care  
 14 nurse looking after one intensive care patient per  
 15 shift. If you then want to double your intensive care  
 16 numbers, if you don't get extra staff, you'll have one  
 17 critical care nurse looking after two or three, and that  
 18 has an impact on care in itself. So most areas ask for  
 19 the help of other colleagues as more people being better  
 20 than stretching the staff base to having the normal  
 21 staff base looking after extended numbers of patients.  
 22 Q. I suppose I'm thinking about the level of training and  
 23 support that a new person, a new nurse, for example,  
 24 might need, so whether that would take an experienced  
 25 nurse away from her allocated or his allocated bed for

1 longer, you know, while they support this person.  
 2 A. Yeah.  
 3 Q. So whether effectively one member of staff is being  
 4 split between two beds to support  
 5 A. Yes, it's not a perfect solution.  
 6 Q. But it was the only solution?  
 7 A. It's there's no immediate way of providing training  
 8 to someone within a few weeks' period that doesn't  
 9 involve the support of some of the existing staff, but  
 10 that's probably preferential to having the existing  
 11 staff base look after extended numbers of patients.  
 12 Say, for example even the very sick intensive  
 13 care patient, say, for example, we have to sometimes  
 14 we managed patients in intensive care with severe levels  
 15 of respiratory failure by turning them over so that they  
 16 are instead of lying on their back, they're lying on  
 17 their front. That takes a team of six to eight people.  
 18 So if you have more patients but you have kept your  
 19 original staff base, you then don't have the numbers of  
 20 people just to do that.  
 21 Q. Yes. Thank you. Do you think that something I don't  
 22 know if this is feasible. Do you think that something  
 23 that could potentially be done to prepare for future  
 24 would be that non critical care staff are given in  
 25 more typical times given critical care training and that

1 that is periodically refreshed so that, if they're  
 2 called upon in an emergency situation, whether it's  
 3 a pandemic or other emergency, that they could more  
 4 readily step into the role?  
 5 A. Yes, so I think various areas talked about that at  
 6 various stages of the pan but that requires resource  
 7 to train staff. It takes resource to allow staff to be  
 8 released to be trained it takes resource and so  
 9 you're taking the trainers away from what they are  
 10 normally working in and the staff to be trained away  
 11 from what they're normally working in, and currently  
 12 that may be problematic, but so I think it would  
 13 require some investment.  
 14 Q. Thank you. At paragraph 46 you say that both the  
 15 redeployed and core critical care staff found working in  
 16 ICU during COVID difficult and some have suffered  
 17 long term effects. Can you please tell us about those  
 18 long term effects?  
 19 A. I think from we asked that question specifically of  
 20 the membership when we were preparing the original  
 21 response to the Inquiry's questions. There was quite  
 22 a spread of effects. It varied per individual. But  
 23 I suppose the comments to pull out, so people were  
 24 concerned about their own health, their families'  
 25 health. Especially in the first wave, the pandemic was

1 an unknown quantity of what was going to happen to you  
2 and therefore what might happen to your family. There  
3 was stress and burn out. I think people felt  
4 overwhelmed at times by what they had gone through and  
5 some people felt they couldn't continue working in  
6 critical care afterwards.

7 So after the first wave of the pandemic, most  
8 critical care units started to see a loss of their staff  
9 base more there's always some turnover of staff base  
10 in any area, but there was an increase in that and, as  
11 a result, a lot of critical care units lost a lot of  
12 experience and so we can replace staff and we can  
13 recruit new staff but building up those years of  
14 experience takes time, and so most critical care  
15 a lot of critical care units in Scotland reporting  
16 seeing that they now have a less experienced staff base  
17 with a different degree of skill mix and that affects  
18 ongoing education needs and provision of care on a daily  
19 basis. And why some of those experienced nurses  
20 decide and clinicians and doctors and other  
21 professionals decided to move on is complex, I think,  
22 but the waves of the pandemic probably prompted some  
23 people to make that decision.

24 Q. Yes, because I was going to come on to this later but  
25 I'll ask you about it now. You state that, at

1 paragraph 56, the median reported loss in relation to  
2 nursing staff was 42.5% and in relation to consultant  
3 medical staff was 25%. These presumably have  
4 a significant impact on care being provided in ICU. Are  
5 hospital boards or others taking steps to try to  
6 mitigate this?

7 A. So I think all health boards are trying to maintain  
8 their staff base by recruiting new staff but and  
9 consultants. I think people are attempting to replace  
10 the consultant staff. I think later I may have referred  
11 to the fact that there's in previous submissions,  
12 there's not always the staff to replace one immediately  
13 and so sometimes there are vacancies which await  
14 filling.

15 It takes time for new staff to become as experienced  
16 in critical care as some of the staff that have left, so  
17 if there's a large number of staff leave at the same  
18 time, therefore it takes time to build that experience  
19 back up. And so there are people I think that want to  
20 work within critical care but perhaps less than there  
21 might once have been, and so I think this may not be  
22 critical care may not be the exception here. I don't  
23 know because I'm only speaking for the critical care  
24 community. But I'm not sure that recruitment is as easy  
25 in a lot of aspects of healthcare as it might once have

1 been.

2 Q. Thank you. Do you or the Scottish Intensive Care  
3 Society have views on how this might be prevented in  
4 future, this sudden departure?

5 A. So the Scottish Intensive Care Society and the Scottish  
6 Critical Care Delivery Group did a workforce survey in  
7 2020, trying to look at workforce factors that were  
8 influencing the retention and plans for retirement of  
9 consultant medical staff in the main. But workforce  
10 planning is quite a complex area that probably I think  
11 could do with more attention across healthcare.

12 Some of the issues that I think I refer to  
13 I think some of the pension issues that were affecting  
14 consultants have perhaps been alleviated since we sent  
15 out the survey to a degree, but, yeah, the we how  
16 to keep staff working in a high intensity environment  
17 that is physically quite demanding, has a lot of night  
18 work until they're 68 requires some thought, I think.

19 Q. You touched on the training of new staff. Before going  
20 back to where we were, I want to ask you about  
21 paragraph 58, where you say:

22 "Training of nursing students, medical students,  
23 nursing, allied health professionals and medical staff  
24 in training was adversely affected by the COVID 19  
25 pandemic."

1 Would you please expand on this, including why it  
2 was affected, the impact and how long the impact is  
3 expected to continue?

4 A. So I think so the best people to ask about the  
5 students would be the universities and the best people  
6 to ask about the medical health professionals would be  
7 NHS Education for Scotland.

8 Q. Okay.

9 A. But I think you could say that a lot of education stood  
10 down, so I think the members have reported that, you  
11 know, not all areas received medical students. Critical  
12 care students usually have medical and nursing students.  
13 Not all areas of Scotland retained medical and nursing  
14 students, so their exposure to critical care disappeared  
15 during waves of the pandemic.

16 Those in work, there wasn't the standard  
17 education that would run for people during work was  
18 suspended. Training courses were suspended, exams were  
19 suspended, and exposure to different aspects of  
20 healthcare changed a lot. So I think you would have  
21 more information about from NHS Education for  
22 Scotland, but many trainees doctors in training were  
23 sent outside their area of training during the initial  
24 waves of the pandemic to work and so weren't working in  
25 what they were supposed to be training in. So how long

1 that effect is likely to be ongoing, I couldn't really  
 2 comment on. It's not our area of expertise, but it has  
 3 affected all the people in training and in education at  
 4 that point. I think the medical profession or allied  
 5 health profession wouldn't be alone in that, I think.  
 6 Q. Thank you. Going back to paragraph 47, you say that  
 7 "there was a proliferation of both valid and false  
 8 information" following other countries sharing their  
 9 experiences. There, are you referring to information  
 10 being shared between clinicians or broadly across the  
 11 general population?  
 12 A. Actually I think I was looking at our responses from our  
 13 membership, and I'll read out one of them because  
 14 I think it encapsulates the answer to that. So:  
 15 "One of the biggest challenges responding to an  
 16 avalanche of data opinion, advice good and bad, while  
 17 having to rapidly learn how to treat a new disease,  
 18 there was a proliferation of self appointed experts,  
 19 questionable sciences and in some cases downright fake  
 20 news driven by the rapid news agenda of the internet [as  
 21 read]."  
 22 I think other people have commented that some of  
 23 that news and some of that information led to some very  
 24 difficult conversations with patients and families about  
 25 some of this information that was not true.

29

1 Q. Thank you. Also in paragraph 47 you say that, where  
 2 staff disagreed with the rationale for guidance  
 3 changes you say that staff at sometimes didn't  
 4 understand the rationale for guidance changes. Where  
 5 that was the case, were they able to voice their  
 6 concerns and put forward their thoughts on what was  
 7 preferable or better?  
 8 A. Put forward their thoughts to who?  
 9 Q. Anybody. Was there anybody available to hear  
 10 clinicians' voices?  
 11 A. So most of a lot of the guidance that was coming out  
 12 around policy was coming nationally, so I suppose, as is  
 13 common, the individual clinician on the floor doesn't  
 14 always immediately get feedback to national level of  
 15 guidance.  
 16 Q. Yes.  
 17 A. So staff, I think, fed back their queries to their local  
 18 teams. I couldn't comment on whether they we haven't  
 19 asked our members did they feel that that is a comment  
 20 they made, but they didn't comment what they did about  
 21 it.  
 22 THE CHAIR: Might some assistance be given to you by  
 23 something you were looking at in a slightly different  
 24 context a moment or two ago? Paragraph 58 [sic] is your  
 25 reporting of, I think, questions you asked staff or

30

1 fellow clinicians. I don't have it in front of me at  
 2 the moment but it's coming up. I think it said that 30%  
 3 of clinicians in your speciality I've got the wrong  
 4 paragraph. It must be, yes, 59, I apologise.  
 5 "30% of members who replied to the '... Members  
 6 Consultation ...' felt that critical care views were not  
 7 adequately considered by [the] Scottish Government in  
 8 the COVID 19 response."  
 9 Does that by and large answer the question you were  
 10 posed, Doctor?  
 11 A. Yes, I think the question that was put to the society  
 12 was that question, critical care views which views  
 13 were not specified, and so we asked the question as it  
 14 was posed and that's what they answered.  
 15 THE CHAIR: Yes, I can see that. So a significant number,  
 16 30%  
 17 A. Yes.  
 18 THE CHAIR: of those that answered expressed criticism,  
 19 reservations, in relation to the degree of consultation  
 20 that your branch of the profession was given?  
 21 A. Yes.  
 22 THE CHAIR: Thank you.  
 23 MS BAHRAMI: Thank you, my Lord.  
 24 What would have happened if a clinician ignored  
 25 guidance they viewed as being inappropriate or less

31

1 appropriate in favour of something they regarded in  
 2 their clinical judgment as being preferable?  
 3 A. It depends what guidance you were referring to. So  
 4 there was guidance about patient placement, management  
 5 of infection control, guidance on therapies. So there  
 6 was various streams of guidance. If a clinician didn't  
 7 feel comfortable with the particular infection control  
 8 advice, PPE advice if you I don't think many  
 9 people would have disregarded the current advice  
 10 because but again that is an operational situation in  
 11 individual areas that we haven't I haven't got any  
 12 detail on and I'd be supposing what happened as opposed  
 13 to knowing.  
 14 Q. Sure. Would that have affected again staff morale or  
 15 the pressure on people in people's minds, having to  
 16 do something that they didn't understand the basis  
 17 for  
 18 A. Fully understand the rationale? Yeah, I  
 19 Q. and didn't agree with perhaps?  
 20 A. I think there's any guidance usually has a rationale.  
 21 It's sometimes I think we don't the rationale isn't  
 22 always as well communicated as it might be. But rapidly  
 23 changing information and rapidly changing guidance is  
 24 difficult for people to keep up with, and when you're  
 25 and there may have been valid reasons for that to

32

1 happen, but the rapidly changing advice meant that it  
 2 was difficult for anybody to know what was the current  
 3 guidance at that point. If it was different two weeks  
 4 ago and it's now different and it will be different in  
 5 another two weeks, it can be difficult to know what  
 6 you're supposed to be doing at that moment in time  
 7 because it takes time to distribute information to staff  
 8 members. We usually change guidance over a period of  
 9 time, distribute that information to the staff members  
 10 and we make sure that everybody understands it, but  
 11 speed of change was rapid and trying to make sure that  
 12 everybody was abreast of the current situation was  
 13 difficult.

14 Q. Yes, thank you. In paragraph 48 you say that:  
 15 "Lack of family visits and the lack of face to face  
 16 communication caused injury to patients and families and  
 17 staff."

18 Can you explain what you mean there by "injury" and  
 19 how it affected patients and staff?

20 A. So when critical care staff care for a patient,  
 21 a patient is part of a unit usually. You're not  
 22 a separate individual; you're part of a family group,  
 23 part of a social structure. Because of the nature of  
 24 critical care, there's a lot of family presence, a lot  
 25 of involvement with the family, and if the patient is

33

1 very unwell and unable to communicate, much of the  
 2 staff's time is spent communicating with the family. We  
 3 learn about the patient from their family and the  
 4 patients need their family to support them at a time of  
 5 great stress for them.

6 To have no family presence was difficult. Staff  
 7 have never worked in an environment where there is no  
 8 family member present to tell them or talk to about the  
 9 patient, and communicating on a telephone is not the  
 10 same as communicating face to face. All the non-verbal  
 11 cues of communication, all the are lost. So having  
 12 conversations in intensive care and critical care is  
 13 often difficult. It's a time of great stress to the  
 14 patient and the family and support and considerate  
 15 communication face to face is our normal practice. To  
 16 have to do that by telephone was distressing. It was  
 17 distressing for the families, it was distressing for the  
 18 patients, it was distressing for the staff.

19 And having patients at the end of their life not  
 20 being able to have their family around them in the same  
 21 way was distressing for staff because that's not the  
 22 journey at the end of life that they would like to have  
 23 given to the patient and not what the patient wanted and  
 24 not what the family wanted either. So that was I think  
 25 one of the areas that all staff groups found most

34

1 challenging.

2 Q. What was visitation like in PICU and NICU, so the  
 3 paediatric and neonatal intensive care units? Was that  
 4 similarly affected? Were parents able to stay with  
 5 children? Were siblings allowed?

6 A. So the NICU I can't comment on because we did ask  
 7 some questions of the paediatric intensive care  
 8 community. We are mainly an adult intensive care  
 9 society. We do have some links with the paediatric  
 10 community in Scotland so we asked them some questions.

11 The visiting guidance changed throughout the  
 12 pandemic and changed there was some national guidance  
 13 and there was health board guidance on this and it  
 14 varied through the pandemic. My recollection would be  
 15 that paediatrics, because they if there was a child,  
 16 generally speaking, parents or a parent at least was  
 17 more likely to be able to be present, but how that  
 18 changed through the pandemic you would be able to look  
 19 at as you track the national visiting guidance from  
 20 NHS Scotland.

21 Q. Do you know so parents would have been allowed to  
 22 visit?

23 A. I believe so.

24 Q. Do you know whether there would have been any beds for,  
 25 for example, breast feeding mothers to be able to

35

1 spend you know, to be able to feed on demand?

2 A. I that is not a question that we asked of our  
 3 society. So there will be people that can tell you the  
 4 answer to that but I think it's not us.

5 Q. Sure. Thank you. You say at paragraph 48 that  
 6 sometimes a stark choice had to be presented to families  
 7 with regards to visiting their loved one at the end of  
 8 life or attending a funeral. Was this required by the  
 9 guidance and did clinicians have to have this  
 10 conversation with patients with families? Sorry.

11 A. Yes. So if your family member was at that point within  
 12 an environment that required a level of personal  
 13 protection equipment, to deem that you had not been  
 14 a COVID contact, I think, staff, in order to go into  
 15 that environment, would need to be wearing full PPE.  
 16 That was not always available in all areas to patients'  
 17 family members visiting, so if they went into that area  
 18 when the patient was sadly at the end of their life to  
 19 visit their family member, they would be deemed to be  
 20 a COVID contact and the advice at that point was that  
 21 they would go home and isolate. And if the funeral  
 22 occurred during that period of isolation, then the  
 23 advice would have been at that point that they should  
 24 not attend the funeral.

25 THE CHAIR: You have 15 minutes left, Ms Bahrami.

36

1 MS BHRAMI: Thank you, my Lord.  
 2 You mentioned at paragraph 52 that staffing  
 3 pressures meant that staff did not always feel they  
 4 could deliver the quality of care they would aspire to  
 5 pre pandemic. Did this impact the levels of staff  
 6 leaving and did it impact people's morale and ability to  
 7 carry on during the pandemic, also affecting absence  
 8 levels perhaps?  
 9 A. I think it did impact staff. I think we can see from  
 10 our response that it did impact some staff morale. Most  
 11 clinicians want to deliver the best care that they can  
 12 under all circumstances, but under some circumstances  
 13 you can't deliver the care care was not entirely as  
 14 it would be normally. Say, for example, if you were  
 15 working with an expanded staff group, with people that  
 16 had kindly come to help you out in your time of need but  
 17 they didn't have that experience, so that's not it's  
 18 providing care but it's not providing care to the  
 19 standard that you would normally provide the care and  
 20 that was difficult for people. Yes, I think that may  
 21 have contributed to some I think we can see that in  
 22 the responses, that that may have contributed to some  
 23 people deciding that they wanted to move on.  
 24 Q. At paragraph 60 you mentioned that an end of life policy  
 25 can help ensure pain and distressing symptoms endured by

1 patients dying in ICU can be addressed. How could or  
 2 should this have been achieved?  
 3 A. So the context of that is I that's in the statement,  
 4 a response to a question that we asked of the society.  
 5 We have as a quality indicator for Scottish Intensive  
 6 Care Society Scottish critical care units, we have  
 7 one of the quality indicators in that all of those units  
 8 should have an end of life policy for those reasons.  
 9 The annual audit of the Scottish Intensive Care Society  
 10 Audit Group, which is published annually, has that  
 11 documented, who or who does not have an end of life  
 12 policy as a quality indicator. I believe that the vast  
 13 majority, if not nearly universally, critical care units  
 14 across Scotland do have an end of life policy. What  
 15 that it's not mandated what that that policy is  
 16 the same as the unit next door, but that they should  
 17 have one, and that's the detail of what the quality  
 18 indicator says could potentially be addressed in the  
 19 end of life policy that that unit has adopted.  
 20 Q. To what extent was it followed during the pandemic? Was  
 21 there enough time for these policies to be amended and  
 22 tailored and to be followed or were there periods where  
 23 it just hadn't been possible to follow that best  
 24 practice?  
 25 A. The end of life is individual for all patients and

1 should always be tailored to an individual patient's  
 2 circumstances. There's guidance from the GMC on  
 3 treating patients at the end of life, and this touches  
 4 upon when you should or should not have discussions with  
 5 patients and DNACPR and anticipatory care plans. To  
 6 find out what happened in individual areas would be  
 7 in detail would be a separate piece of work. I think  
 8 the main comment that the membership had about end of  
 9 life was the lack of family presence at the end of life.  
 10 That was what they feel was the most challenging for  
 11 them.  
 12 Q. Was that difficult both for staff and for patients?  
 13 A. Oh, I think it was difficult for patients, family and  
 14 staff.  
 15 Q. Did clinicians feel that they had to step into that role  
 16 where family weren't present?  
 17 A. So I think when family can't be present, I think all  
 18 clinicians feel the patient will not be alone at the end  
 19 of their life. But, yes, I think a staff member being  
 20 the only person present at the end of a patient's life  
 21 is not what the staff or the family or the patient would  
 22 usually hope for or aspire to.  
 23 Q. Was some sort of counselling available to clinicians who  
 24 had to be in that situation?  
 25 A. It occasionally happens under normal circumstances, so

1 sometimes somebody has no family, sometimes somebody's  
 2 family is on the other side of the world, but it  
 3 certainly happened more during the pandemic.  
 4 Counselling, I think most there was people comment  
 5 in their submission that there was at times some degree  
 6 of psychological support available, but it wasn't  
 7 necessarily available in the middle of the first wave  
 8 but became more available later on.  
 9 Q. Thank you. You mentioned CPR. Can you please comment  
 10 on the appropriateness of use of CPR in an ICU setting,  
 11 given the condition of the typical patient requiring  
 12 intensive care?  
 13 A. So there are some patients in intensive care units that  
 14 have a DNACPR complete, but not by no means all  
 15 patients in intensive care units. I think it's an  
 16 individual discussion and decision depending on the  
 17 circumstances of that individual patient's journey and  
 18 wishes.  
 19 Intensive care units, we'd like to have every  
 20 patient survive when they are admitted to an intensive  
 21 care unit but not every patient does survive, so we  
 22 recognise that some patients will sadly not survive  
 23 their intensive care admission. If a patient is dying  
 24 in intensive care without a do not resuscitate order,  
 25 we, the staff, will feel that they have to start CPR on

1 that patient, and so the when a patient is dying,  
 2 that's not necessarily of benefit to that patient or  
 3 particularly a dignified end to their life . So when  
 4 a patient is actively dying, a do not resuscitate order  
 5 will be completed so that that patient does not we do  
 6 not start doing resuscitation on a patient that that  
 7 will not be of benefit to them. So it will be  
 8 appropriate on occasion but it's not appropriate for all  
 9 patients.  
 10 Q. Just to be clear, when it's not appropriate, that's  
 11 because there is another there's something else going  
 12 on with the patient that, even if you were to  
 13 resuscitate their breathing and circulation, that that  
 14 would cause death, for example, a brain haemorrhage, so  
 15 it's not appropriate  
 16 A. So you're saying that it's not appropriate for some  
 17 patients because you're asking why it's not  
 18 appropriate for some patients?  
 19 Q. Yes. I just want to clarify that in case  
 20 A. So some patients not all conditions are reversible  
 21 and so some patients will sadly die of their underlying  
 22 condition. There are some conditions that are fatal  
 23 despite our best attempts, and under those  
 24 circumstances if the patient has a cardiac or  
 25 pulmonary arrest, resuscitation will not potentially

41

1 won't sometimes will not be successful and on other  
 2 occasions will not be of overall benefit to the patient  
 3 because they will still die of their underlying  
 4 condition. So these are the conversations that we have  
 5 with patients and family, depending on the  
 6 circumstances, around the individual circumstances of  
 7 that particular patient's condition.  
 8 Q. Thank you. The final thing I want to ask you about is  
 9 extra corporeal membrane oxygenation or ECMO. This is  
 10 a service that you say is provided in Aberdeen. How  
 11 many ECMO machines are there in Aberdeen?  
 12 A. I don't know.  
 13 Q. Okay.  
 14 A. You could ask that of NHS Grampian.  
 15 Q. Okay. Thank you. Is the geographical location of that  
 16 problematic? Is having this centre in Aberdeen  
 17 sufficient or would it be preferable to have, resources  
 18 allowing, more centres, especially in a pandemic time?  
 19 A. So the service in Aberdeen commenced after a national  
 20 planning exercise in 2020, so there was a lot of  
 21 discussion about that and those issues at the time, some  
 22 of which is probably still on you could refer to in  
 23 part of the planning exercise I'm not I think that,  
 24 as I don't have within our membership, there would be  
 25 some views on that which would you could ask that as

42

1 a separate question and get a variety of opinions. So  
 2 I think we didn't ask the membership how many ECMO  
 3 beds they think there should be or whether they  
 4 should more ECMO should have been provided. I think  
 5 some members commented that they thought that perhaps  
 6 some more could have been provided during the pandemic  
 7 within Glasgow Edinburgh, further within the central  
 8 belt. How practical that would have been, I don't know,  
 9 but it is a comment that some of the members made.  
 10 Q. Because presumably, given the issues with transfers,  
 11 transferring people to Aberdeen would have  
 12 A. Yes, I think the one exception to the transfer  
 13 circumstances is that, when a patient is accepted for  
 14 ECMO, the ECMO team will come down and collect the  
 15 patient because of the requirement to start the ECMO in  
 16 the referring centre and then bring them back.  
 17 Q. And, finally, is paediatric ECMO also carried out in  
 18 Aberdeen or do paediatric units have their own  
 19 A. The main the paediatric intensive care units are in  
 20 Edinburgh and Glasgow  
 21 Q. Yes.  
 22 A. so I think I'm not absolutely certain, but  
 23 I would I think that that is carried out in Glasgow  
 24 and Edinburgh, but, again, you could confirm that with  
 25 the appropriate health boards.

43

1 Q. Great. Thank you very much. Is there anything we  
 2 haven't covered that you would like to comment on at  
 3 this point or highlight?  
 4 A. I think generally people felt that the pandemic we've  
 5 never expanded critical care services to that extent  
 6 before and the expansion wouldn't have been possible  
 7 without many other parts of the healthcare service, many  
 8 other professional groups that all came and kindly gave  
 9 to us their assistance but there isn't an unlimited  
 10 amount of expansion of critical care that can be  
 11 delivered.  
 12 Without staff is the issue more than equipment.  
 13 Equipment is certainly required, but without the  
 14 knowledgeable staff and experienced staff to operate  
 15 that equipment, there's a finite amount of expansion  
 16 that can be achieved. And I think as a society we  
 17 expressed our concerns that four times expansion was not  
 18 feasible, as was part of the Scottish Government's plans  
 19 at one point that that would not have been feasible  
 20 with the staff base that we had.  
 21 Q. Yes. Would that in terms of not being feasible,  
 22 do you mean it would have impacted patient care?  
 23 A. It would have impacted patient care. So if you haven't  
 24 got in order for intensive care to be effective, you  
 25 actually have to treat the patients in intensive care.

44

1 Just parking them in an intensive care unit doesn't  
 2 achieve the end points that the patient or the staff are  
 3 looking for. So you do need a level of staff in order  
 4 to effectively treat the patient, so, yes, it would have  
 5 adversely affected patient care.  
 6 MS BAHRAMI: Thank you very much.  
 7 THE CHAIR: Yes, thank you very much indeed, Dr Miles.  
 8 I appreciate that. 11.15. Thank you.  
 9 (10.59 am)  
 10 (A short break)  
 11 (11.17 am)  
 12 THE CHAIR: Good morning, Mr Dunlop.  
 13 MR DUNLOP: Good morning, my Lord. I have one witness this  
 14 morning, Dr Kennedy. For the benefit of your record,  
 15 his reference of the organisational statement is  
 16 SCI WT0424 000001.  
 17 THE CHAIR: Good. Right, thank you.  
 18 DR IAIN KENNEDY (called)  
 19 THE CHAIR: Good morning, Dr Kennedy.  
 20 A. Good morning, Lord Brailsford.  
 21 THE CHAIR: I think we're ready to go. When you're ready,  
 22 Mr Dunlop.  
 23 MR DUNLOP: Thank you, my Lord.  
 24 Questions by MR DUNLOP  
 25 MR DUNLOP: Good morning, Dr Kennedy. Could you provide the

45

1 Inquiry with your full name, please?  
 2 A. Yes, I am Dr Iain Kennedy.  
 3 Q. Thank you. You've provided the Inquiry with an  
 4 organisational statement on behalf of the  
 5 British Medical Association in Scotland. If I'm  
 6 correct what would I call it? Would I call it the  
 7 English division or the English and Welsh division?  
 8 I appreciate that they're involved in the UK Inquiry.  
 9 How would I distinguish between could you explain to  
 10 us essentially what's the difference between the  
 11 BMA Scotland office and the BMA offices that are based  
 12 in London?  
 13 A. Yes, so the BMA covers all four nations so  
 14 Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales and England, and the  
 15 BMA is the overarching organisation, but we have  
 16 devolved nations within the BMA, obviously Scotland,  
 17 Northern Ireland and Wales. So BMA Scotland is  
 18 regarded is always called a devolved nation.  
 19 Q. Am I correct that there are BMA is involved in the  
 20 UKI proceedings as well?  
 21 A. I'm not sure about that.  
 22 Q. Could you tell me, how does the BMA sit alongside other  
 23 medical organisations that we may hear evidence from,  
 24 such as the royal colleges? How does that sit alongside  
 25 those?

46

1 A. Okay, so the BMA and the BMA in Scotland is a trade  
 2 union and it's a professional body. We have 17,000  
 3 members and, to give you an example, 3,000 of them would  
 4 be GPs. So we're quite different to the other  
 5 professional bodies in that we are larger, we have a far  
 6 greater membership and we also have a democratic mandate  
 7 to negotiate terms and conditions on behalf of all  
 8 doctors.  
 9 Many of these other bodies represent a small group  
 10 of doctors and including overseas doctors. The BMA in  
 11 Scotland represents, well, six branches of  
 12 practice: consultants, GPs, staff and associate  
 13 specialists, junior doctors, who will soon be called  
 14 "resident doctors", medical students and also retired  
 15 members, although the retired members committee is  
 16 a pan UK committee. There isn't a Scottish retired  
 17 members committee.  
 18 Q. Okay. Thank you. Whilst I appreciate you're here today  
 19 speaking on behalf of the BMA Scotland, what's your  
 20 particular specialism?  
 21 A. So I am a general practitioner. I have a special  
 22 interest in occupational medicine, so I work as a GP in  
 23 Inverness. We have four GP practices, Riverside in  
 24 Inverness, which has 10,000 patients, mainly a deprived  
 25 part of Inverness. We also have a smaller practice in

47

1 Inverness called "Dunedin", with about 2,500 to 3,000  
 2 patients; and we also have Foyers Medical Practice,  
 3 Loch Ness and Strathnairn, which is by the banks of  
 4 Loch Ness, obviously, and that's about 1,000 patients in  
 5 the rural hinterland; and Cromarty Medical Practice on  
 6 the Black Isle. So my organisation, Riverside Highland  
 7 Medical Group, has a mixture of urban and rural GP  
 8 practices.  
 9 Q. Thank you. Looking at the organisational statement at  
 10 paragraphs 1 and 2, you explain what positions you hold  
 11 within the BMA Scottish Council and GP committee  
 12 presently. Is it fair to say that you've sought  
 13 assistance of colleagues in the preparation of this  
 14 organisational statement?  
 15 A. Yeah, that's right. I became chair of BMA Scottish  
 16 Council in August 2022 and, during the time of the  
 17 pandemic, I was medical director of Highland Local  
 18 Medical Committee, which is affiliated to the BMA.  
 19 I was an ordinary member of Scottish Council, I was  
 20 a member of BMA Council across the four nations and  
 21 a member of the UKGP committee and a member of the GP  
 22 committee, but I wasn't close to the action, as it were,  
 23 in terms of decision making. I was very much an  
 24 ordinary member then.  
 25 Q. Can I take you to paragraph 17 of your statement which

48

1 is headed "Key issues and impacts for doctors". At  
 2 paragraph 17 of your statement, you identify that there  
 3 was a lack of appropriate PPE and risk assessments. Can  
 4 you tell me, in terms of particularly given your  
 5 awareness from the BMA, can you tell me whether there  
 6 was a difference in the lack of or adequacy of PPE  
 7 within different sectors of the medical profession,  
 8 whether that be primary care or secondary care?  
 9 A. Yes. So PPE was a significant issue for my members in  
 10 general practice and in hospitals and we were very  
 11 concerned about the adequacy of protection. In simple  
 12 terms, I'm talking about the fact that we were given  
 13 fluid resistant surgical masks, so the paper masks that  
 14 the general public would be very familiar with wearing  
 15 too, rather than respiratory protective equipment such  
 16 as FFP3.  
 17 Now, I've been surprised actually, speaking to  
 18 hospital colleagues, that even in the hospitals, in the  
 19 general medical and surgical wards, they were generally  
 20 using just using the surgical masks, and the FFP3  
 21 masks that we probably all should have had were reserved  
 22 for those in intensive care units and doing so called  
 23 aerosol generating procedures. So there was a complete  
 24 lack of adequate PPE in terms of respiratory protective  
 25 equipment in general practice and a relative lack in the

49

1 hospital sector.  
 2 Q. At that time, at the beginning of the outbreak or at the  
 3 beginning of lockdown in March 2020, was there  
 4 a difference between the way PPE was procured in primary  
 5 and in secondary care? So, for instance, I think we  
 6 heard evidence that hospitals secured the NHS secured  
 7 PPE for the hospitals. Is that your understanding or  
 8 can you comment on that?  
 9 A. So I'm a little unsure how PPE was procured, but I'm  
 10 assuming that my practice manager and nurses would have  
 11 done that in the usual way via the health board. So  
 12 I think general practices were procuring PPE through  
 13 health board structures.  
 14 Q. Well, if you're not familiar, I'm not going to ask you  
 15 to speculate.  
 16 Did the BMA do anything in terms of the concerns  
 17 that its members had in relation to lack of PPE?  
 18 A. Yes. My predecessor, who was chair of BMA Scotland at  
 19 the time, and the former national director of the BMA in  
 20 Scotland, so effectively the chief executive of the BMA  
 21 in Scotland, were in regular contact with the  
 22 Government, I think almost on a daily basis at the start  
 23 of the pandemic and certainly at least weekly  
 24 thereafter, and they made regular representation on  
 25 behalf of members about the inadequate PPE.

50

1 Q. And was anything done in light of those representations?  
 2 A. Not to the satisfaction of my predecessor or our  
 3 members.  
 4 Q. And why what was done and what was unsatisfactory?  
 5 A. I think the fundamental problem was that there was  
 6 a lack of recognition that COVID was an airborne disease  
 7 and, you know, we in the BMA referred to "droplet  
 8 dogma", which meant that fundamentally the wrong sort of  
 9 PPE, respiratory protective equipment, was supplied to  
 10 us. You know, the surgical masks that I've referred to  
 11 are good at preventing droplets going from healthcare  
 12 worker to patient but they do absolutely nothing in  
 13 terms of preventing air coming to the doctor. If I'm  
 14 wearing my mask, when I breathe, the air comes in round  
 15 the edges, it doesn't come through the mask, so the  
 16 fluid resistant surgical masks were relatively useless  
 17 in terms of protecting doctors and other healthcare  
 18 workers from COVID.  
 19 Q. Was that explained to the Scottish Government by the  
 20 BMA?  
 21 A. I believe it was on a number of times.  
 22 Q. In paragraph 19 of your statement, you also identify  
 23 that PPE was not always suitable due to not properly  
 24 fitting. The issue with PPE not properly fitting, did  
 25 that impact on particular groups of people more than

51

1 others that were working in medical care?  
 2 A. Yes. It's widely recognised that PPE has been designed  
 3 for the male body, for male heads, faces and bodies and  
 4 for white male heads, faces and bodies. So groups that  
 5 had particular difficulty were women, and women more  
 6 regularly reported to us that they had failed  
 7 fit testing for PPE, but also ethnic minority groups,  
 8 particularly those with beards and those with head  
 9 coverings, had greater difficulty with getting suitably  
 10 fitted PPE.  
 11 Q. You mentioned there "failed fit testing". Can you tell  
 12 us what fit testing is and what the consequences are if  
 13 someone fails a fit testing?  
 14 A. So I've never had a fit test myself so I can only go by  
 15 what people tell me, but I'm assuming that they go into  
 16 a room with somebody who actually fits a mask to their  
 17 face and checks that it fits, but I've never seen it  
 18 being done.  
 19 Q. Do you know what the consequences are if someone fails  
 20 a fit testing of a mask? Does that mean that they have  
 21 to use unsuitable masks or are they taken off their  
 22 duties? Do you know what the consequences are?  
 23 A. I can't say with authority what the consequences are.  
 24 Q. Just dealing with the fitting that didn't do you know  
 25 if the BMA did anything about the fact that what

52

1 you're telling us, that the masks were predominantly  
 2 made for males did they do anything about that?  
 3 A. Well, we fed that back first of all, we surveyed our  
 4 members and we surveyed our members regularly and we  
 5 shared that information with the Government both at  
 6 Scottish level and UK level, so we certainly shared that  
 7 information, but I'm not sure of what the outcome was of  
 8 us sharing that information.  
 9 Q. You deal with this at paragraph 19 of your statement.  
 10 I'll maybe just read it out:  
 11 "The impacts of the pandemic were not felt equally,  
 12 for healthcare staff or patients. UK wide data from BMA  
 13 surveys indicate that ethnic minority doctors more  
 14 commonly had to work without PPE, felt worried or  
 15 fearful about speaking out, and felt risk assessments  
 16 had been ineffective."  
 17 Can I just deal with those maybe on a point by point  
 18 basis? I think you've explained was it the beards,  
 19 was that the sole difference? You say that they have to  
 20 work without PPE. Was it simply beards or was there  
 21 anything else that impacted?  
 22 A. So numerous surveys done by the BMA demonstrate that  
 23 those in ethnic minorities and disabled groups and women  
 24 are more fearful generally in speaking up in the NHS in  
 25 Scotland. So there's a general theme there, not just

53

1 with COVID and not just with PPE, that those groups feel  
 2 more fearful and that, if they do raise concerns, that  
 3 they will receive some form of negative treatment. So  
 4 our ethnic minority members and disabled members did  
 5 tell us that more so that they felt their risk  
 6 assessments were inadequate, so they were more likely to  
 7 say their risk assessments were inadequate and they were  
 8 more likely to report ill fitting or failing a fit test.  
 9 The exact reasons, beyond being female and having  
 10 a female face, beards and head coverings, I'm unable to  
 11 comment beyond those areas.  
 12 Q. You may not be able to answer this question, but you  
 13 said that there was a perception that the risk  
 14 assessments were inadequate. I was going to ask you in  
 15 what respects. Is that because the risk assessments  
 16 were generic, without making specific provision for  
 17 people with different shaped faces?  
 18 A. What members have told us is it was more the outcome of  
 19 the risk assessment, so they would identify something  
 20 with the risk assessment but the appropriate action was  
 21 not thereafter taken, and that led to some of our  
 22 members calling it a "tick box exercise".  
 23 Q. So the risk assessments were undertaken but then they  
 24 weren't followed through on; is that essentially  
 25 A. That's what some of our members have told us.

54

1 Q. Thank you. Whose responsibility would it be to follow  
 2 through on those risk assessments ensure that what  
 3 those risks assessments identified was done?  
 4 A. Well, under the Health and Safety at Work Act 1974, it  
 5 would be the employer's responsibility. So in hospitals  
 6 it would be the health board. In general practices,  
 7 where the majority are independent contractors like  
 8 myself, it would fall upon the employer, being me, the  
 9 GP partner.  
 10 Q. I'll move on to a topic, long COVID. At paragraph 18  
 11 and later at paragraph 41 you mention doctors suffering  
 12 from long COVID. Can you tell me generally, during the  
 13 period from March 2022 to the end of 2022, what  
 14 treatment was available for people receiving sorry,  
 15 people that were suffering from long COVID?  
 16 A. So there is no specific test for long COVID, which we  
 17 all understand to be COVID symptoms that go beyond  
 18 four weeks so there's no specific test. There's  
 19 a broad range of symptoms in long COVID and there's no  
 20 specific treatment. There's not a tablet or medicine  
 21 that we can use to treat long COVID.  
 22 Q. We might hear evidence that initially there was some  
 23 scepticism in relation to long COVID. In your opinion  
 24 has that been overcome, that scepticism?  
 25 A. Yes, and I think it's regarded as a syndrome that

55

1 affects many parts of the body. So it affects the  
 2 cardio vascular system, the respiratory system,  
 3 neurological, psychological and general symptoms. So  
 4 there's a broad range of symptoms with long COVID but  
 5 a recognised syndrome. But the two most commonly  
 6 reported symptoms are fatigue and brain fog.  
 7 Q. And sorry in your role in the BMA, are you still  
 8 practising as a GP  
 9 A. Yes. I practise every week in Inverness and all doctors  
 10 who work for the BMA are still practising doctors.  
 11 Q. Do you have patients coming in who have suffered from  
 12 long COVID or are suffering?  
 13 A. Yes, but not many. I can think possibly of maybe just  
 14 two that have mentioned long COVID while they've been in  
 15 about other things. I haven't actually dealt with  
 16 a patient that came in saying, "I'd like to discuss  
 17 long COVID", but I do have one or two patients and  
 18 I know of some doctors.  
 19 Q. You might not be able to assist us with the next  
 20 question, but do you have a view on the availability and  
 21 adequacy of treatment for long COVID?  
 22 A. Yes. As I indicated, there's not a specific test for  
 23 long COVID and there's not a specific treatment, so the  
 24 role of the doctor really is to exclude other causes of  
 25 fatigue, brain fog and the other general symptoms that

56

1 patients with long COVID get. So our role is to exclude  
 2 the other causes and then we would generally direct  
 3 patients with long COVID to rehabilitation services, so  
 4 they would generally see physiotherapists and  
 5 occupational therapists rather than a doctor because, by  
 6 the time we have given a diagnosis of long COVID, there  
 7 at the moment isn't a role for the doctor. But, of  
 8 course, as evidence changes, it may be that there would  
 9 require to be a doctor led service. But at the moment  
 10 it tends to be rehabilitation through physios and OTs.  
 11 Q. And when did that commence, do you know?  
 12 A. I remember it commencing quite early on, so a few months  
 13 I think into the pandemic, because I remember there was  
 14 quite a lot of debate about where long COVID services  
 15 would be hosted; would they be hosted in general  
 16 practice, would they be hosted in hospitals. So that  
 17 discussion happened quite early on in the pandemic, if  
 18 I remember correctly.  
 19 Q. Thank you. Moving on to paragraph 21, you say that  
 20 governments in the UK were not always providing clear  
 21 and adequate guidance on issues such as infection  
 22 control, shielding and the delivery of healthcare. This  
 23 particular Inquiry isn't is more interested in what  
 24 was happening within Scotland. When you say "the UK" as  
 25 in "the UK", do you include the Scottish Government?

1 A. Yes.  
 2 Q. Was the BMA raising concerns that its members had with  
 3 the Scottish Government about any lack of clarity in the  
 4 guidance?  
 5 A. Yes, continuously, on a daily basis at Scottish level  
 6 and definitely at UK level. My experience was there was  
 7 a lot of information coming in to our inboxes on a daily  
 8 basis, probably far too much information, to be honest,  
 9 but there were a number of occasions where the guidance  
 10 was completely lacking and the BMA lobbied the  
 11 Government on a number of occasions to produce guidance  
 12 on various aspects.  
 13 Q. You've said a couple of times there it was done on  
 14 a daily basis. Was that through groups that somebody  
 15 sat on or was that a mailbox or some form of dialogue,  
 16 a bridge, between the BMA and the Scottish Government?  
 17 Can you explain actually in practice how that daily  
 18 communication took place?  
 19 A. Yeah, so the communication took place predominantly  
 20 through my predecessor, the chair, and the national  
 21 director, and they did that via Teams meetings and also  
 22 by direct email communication. The relationships  
 23 with between the BMA in Scotland and the  
 24 Scottish Government are very good. There are lots of  
 25 communication channels. We don't always agree on things

1 but we always meet and the communication channels are  
 2 cordial.  
 3 Q. Do you know who that was with within the  
 4 Scottish Government? Was that the Chief Medical  
 5 Officer? Was it a civil servant? Do you know who the  
 6 communication line was with?  
 7 A. Yeah, so it would have been between the national  
 8 director and civil servants at the Scottish Government  
 9 Health Directorate. I think our national director would  
 10 have had direct communications with the Chief Medical  
 11 Officer and certainly my predecessor had direct  
 12 communications with the Chief Medical Officer on  
 13 a regular basis.  
 14 Q. Thank you. Moving on to paragraph 22 and I won't  
 15 take you through every paragraph but you identify  
 16 some relevant issues early on in your organisational  
 17 statement. You identify that there was a significant  
 18 impact on doctors' mental health and you explain that.  
 19 What I'm interested in knowing is whether or not the  
 20 pandemic had a significant impact on people who weren't  
 21 working in the medical profession, if it affected their  
 22 mental health. Can you assist us with that?  
 23 A. When you say "people not working in the medical  
 24 profession"  
 25 Q. Sorry, people in the street essentially; the every day

1 man or woman.  
 2 A. Yes, there's no doubt, having dealt with patients and  
 3 continuing to deal with patients, that the pandemic had  
 4 a massive impact on the population's mental health.  
 5 Increased levels of anxiety and depression,  
 6 significantly higher levels of psychological disease and  
 7 a huge impact on children as well.  
 8 Q. Were there any groups in society who were  
 9 disproportionately affected that you're aware of?  
 10 A. Yes, so I think the inequalities in Scotland came to the  
 11 fore and those who were more vulnerable came to the  
 12 fore. Early on the BMA identified well, the first  
 13 ten deaths of doctors in the UK all were from minority  
 14 ethnic groups, so we know that black Africans,  
 15 South East Asians, those from the Indian sub continent  
 16 and Filipinos were much more likely to be affected. We  
 17 also know that men and older men were more likely to be  
 18 affected. And paradoxically, with long COVID, it tended  
 19 to be females, I think in the sort of 40 to 55 age  
 20 group.  
 21 But in terms of the impact of COVID on the  
 22 population, there's no doubt that those in deprived  
 23 areas were much more markedly affected, living in  
 24 smaller accommodation, more crowded housing and less  
 25 able to access healthcare and particularly less able to

1 accessthe new remote ways of consulting.  
 2 Q. Okay, and I think there you were talking about COVID  
 3 generally. If I was to ask you about mental health in  
 4 particular, did that and we appreciate that there  
 5 were people that were shielding and so forth were  
 6 there particular people within society who were more  
 7 their mental health was more adversely affected than  
 8 others as a result of the pandemic? If you can't answer  
 9 the question, I don't want to press you on something  
 10 that  
 11 A. Yeah, what information I can give you is that I know in  
 12 those patients who were already known to the mental  
 13 health services, large groups of them completely had  
 14 their follow up stopped, so the existing people with  
 15 mental health problems no longer had any ongoing contact  
 16 with the service, and I think that was because a lot of  
 17 the psychiatrists were redeployed.  
 18 Q. As a GP, if someone came to you with mental health  
 19 issues prior to March 2020 and somebody came to you  
 20 in April 2020, was there a difference in the services  
 21 that would have been available to somebody?  
 22 A. Yes, and the main difference would be that the patients  
 23 were getting seen remotely by secondary care. But  
 24 I have to say that during the pandemic itself, we or  
 25 I certainly did not see a lot of patients presenting

61

1 with mental health problems. It's later on, as the  
 2 pandemic progressed, that people came in and now that  
 3 they're coming in. So I think the mental health  
 4 problems stayed at home, as it were, and were hidden,  
 5 and those patients weren't accessing the Health Service  
 6 like they would have done in the past.  
 7 Q. And with mental health obviously certain diseases are  
 8 degenerative and get worse over time if not treated. Is  
 9 that the same with mental health?  
 10 A. Yes, that's definitely the same with mental health. You  
 11 know, the longer a mental health condition goes  
 12 untreated, the more difficult it is to treat and the  
 13 longer is the recovery. In fact we're seeing patients  
 14 that haven't yet recovered.  
 15 Q. You deal with you've already spoken about this. At  
 16 paragraph 47 you identify that the pandemic had  
 17 a disproportionate affect on ethnic minorities,  
 18 including doctors, and that those minorities felt they  
 19 were less able to raise concerns about issues at work.  
 20 Do you know why that is, the reasoning behind it, the  
 21 background to why they felt less able to raise concerns?  
 22 A. Yes. So certainly the groups that told us they found it  
 23 more difficult to raise concerns were black Africans,  
 24 South East Asians, Filipinos, those that were most at  
 25 risk and those with disabilities and those with in

62

1 the shielding groups, clinically extremely vulnerable.  
 2 Now, I think it's fair to say that these problems  
 3 existed pre pandemic so would have been exacerbated by  
 4 the pandemic. These members always tell us that it is  
 5 far more difficult for them to speak up and they are  
 6 more likely to be dealt with unfavourably.  
 7 Q. Is there something that can be done about that that  
 8 you're aware of?  
 9 A. There is. You know, for example, the BMA in Scotland  
 10 has a the Scottish Race Equality Forum, where we meet  
 11 and we share concerns from our ethnic minority groups  
 12 and we feed that information to both within the BMA  
 13 and to Government. So certainly our organisation is  
 14 much more diverse than it's ever been before and issues  
 15 around discrimination are commonly spoken about and  
 16 we're trying to do our best to improve the working  
 17 environment for those groups.  
 18 Q. Moving on to paragraph 52, you say in paragraph 52 that  
 19 there were significant shortcomings in relation to  
 20 healthcare settings, including infection control,  
 21 guidance and PPE. And at paragraph 53 you go on to say  
 22 that the Government and agencies refused to take on  
 23 board what the BMA was saying. Again, you've told us  
 24 about the daily contact, but is it the same points that  
 25 are being made on a daily basis in terms of infection

63

1 control?  
 2 A. Yes, I go back to what I said about droplet dogma and  
 3 this lack of acceptance that COVID was an airborne  
 4 disease and therefore fundamentally the infection  
 5 protection control guidance was wrong and remains wrong.  
 6 Specifically there's an onus still within the IPC  
 7 infection protection control guidance for employees  
 8 to raise concerns and to request the proper respiratory  
 9 protective equipment, FFP3 masks or similar, whereas we  
 10 believe that guidance should be changed and it should  
 11 follow the Health and Safety at Work Act 1974, where the  
 12 onus is on the employer to risk assess and provide the  
 13 proper respiratory protective equipment.  
 14 As I've said repeatedly, the fluid resistant  
 15 surgical masks are completely inadequate for protecting  
 16 healthcare workers from COVID and we should have all  
 17 been provided with FFP3 or similar. So we were not  
 18 protected from what is an occupational disease and the  
 19 BMA believes that COVID should be classified as an  
 20 occupational disease.  
 21 THE CHAIR: Can I interject there  
 22 MR DUNLOP: Yes, of course, my Lord.  
 23 THE CHAIR: Dr Kennedy, you used the word at the beginning  
 24 of that answer or the words of "droplet dogma"; quite  
 25 strong language actually. This may seem rather an

64

1 obvious point, but you are the representatives of the  
 2 medical profession, put in its most broad sense, in  
 3 Scotland and you tell us in your evidence that you were  
 4 giving guidance essentially from the outset of the  
 5 pandemic and on a very regular basis which and I'm  
 6 cutting it short but basically advised the Government  
 7 that their view in relation to the method of  
 8 transmission of COVID and, as a consequence, the  
 9 provision of appropriate PPE was incorrect again very  
 10 strong language, not nuanced at all just telling them  
 11 it's wrong.

12 Given the strength of both the language you've used  
 13 in your answer today and indeed the advice you  
 14 apparently gave to the Government, can you tell me was  
 15 there any and this went on for a long time, as  
 16 I understand it. Indeed persists to this day have  
 17 you been given a reasoned explanation why something you  
 18 were asserting was your view was correct and their view  
 19 was incorrect have you been given a reasoned  
 20 explanation of why their view was correct and you were  
 21 incorrect by inference?

22 A. So, Lord Brailsford, the people that I've spoken to  
 23 within the BMA and the experts within the BMA advised me  
 24 that the fundamental problem was that the Government was  
 25 taking Public Health advice rather than occupational

1 medicine advice. So the experts in PPE are not  
 2 Public Health doctors, they are occupational physicians,  
 3 and our most eminent expert in occupational medicine at  
 4 UK level was excluded from the necessary advisory group.  
 5 I forget its name. But had we followed Health and  
 6 Safety at Work Act 1974 guidance and occupational  
 7 medicine guidance rather than Public Health guidance,  
 8 I believe the Government or governments would have come  
 9 to a different conclusion.

10 THE CHAIR: Very helpful answer. Thank you very much  
 11 indeed.

12 MR DUNLOP: Thank you, my Lord. Just one further question  
 13 that follows on from that: was the BMA providing advice,  
 14 whether that be scientific papers or guidance was it  
 15 providing data to the Scottish Government to demonstrate  
 16 your point?

17 A. On the specific area

18 Q. On the specific point that it was an airborne disease.  
 19 I think what you said is you're saying that your  
 20 position or the BMA's position was that it was an  
 21 airborne disease. I'm wondering whether that simply was  
 22 an email saying "We think it's an airborne disease" or  
 23 whether you were providing the Scottish Government with  
 24 documentary submissions that supported what you were  
 25 saying.

1 A. Yeah, so I've read a number of papers recently where,  
 2 you know, data has been provided since, but I'm not sure  
 3 at the time if data was being provided or whether it was  
 4 opinion. I'm not sure about that.

5 Q. If it was opinion, was there professional opinion being  
 6 given and the reasons for that professional opinion?

7 A. Yes, at the highest level, yeah, within the BMA, our  
 8 experts.

9 Q. You state in paragraph 53 and you're dealing with the  
 10 point that the IPC guidance did not reflect the reality  
 11 of how COVID was transmitted the IPC guidance that  
 12 was being issued, was that from the Scottish Government?

13 A. I think that's at UK level and I think the  
 14 Scottish Government followed the UK guidance.

15 Q. I can appreciate the difficulty with the masks, but in  
 16 paragraph I think you say in you talk about the  
 17 compliance with health and safety legislation. Would it  
 18 be fair to say that a health board could impose  
 19 irrespective of what the guidance said, putting aside  
 20 PPE but could a GP practice or a health board  
 21 essentially impose upon itself a higher standard than  
 22 the guidance required?

23 A. So I was sitting in bronze command in NHS Highland at  
 24 the time and I was there in my capacity as professional  
 25 secretary of the GP sub committee. My experience of

1 that bronze command was, in the initial weeks, it was  
 2 very positive. We pulled together and changed the way  
 3 we delivered healthcare services very effectively.

4 As the weeks and months went by, I would say we got  
 5 into more command and control structure and there was  
 6 a huge reluctance to do anything at all that went away  
 7 from central Government advice, so I certainly saw no  
 8 evidence of any health board demonstrating flexibility  
 9 or a willingness to do anything that wasn't a "Once for  
 10 Scotland approach." I would say that the culture in  
 11 Scotland is very much to follow central Government  
 12 advice.

13 Q. Just for our benefit, you talk about bronze control.  
 14 I think we've heard talk about gold, I'm not sure if  
 15 I've seen silver yet, but can you explain to us what  
 16 bronze control is?

17 A. Yeah, so I think it was called "bronze command".

18 Q. Sorry, bronze command.

19 A. So I think in bronze so in that group it was primary  
 20 care predominantly, so there would have been maybe  
 21 two GPs, dentists, nurses, community nurses, pharmacists  
 22 and primary care managers, and then and the deputy  
 23 medical director, who was a GP, led that group, and then  
 24 he reported into silver command, where there was another  
 25 deputy medical director, and I think gold command would

1 be the chief executive of the board and the medical  
 2 director .  
 3 Q. And above that was there a silver  
 4 A. So there's bronze, silver , sort of associate medical  
 5 director level, and gold, chief executive medical  
 6 director , yeah.  
 7 Q. We've discussedPPE, but the organisational statement  
 8 comesonto it at paragraph 59 and I just want to ask  
 9 a couple of questions about using PPE that was out of  
 10 date. It may be explained by others who are giving  
 11 evidencethat PPE has an expiry date but it was tested  
 12 to see if that expiry date essentially was premature.  
 13 Did the BMA have a view on the testing of PPE which had,  
 14 on the face of it , expired?  
 15 A. Yes. I think I can give you sort of two facets of  
 16 that part of the pandemic. So I remember, you know,  
 17 seeing the pictures , particularly on social media, of  
 18 date labels being stuck on to packagesof PPE which  
 19 could be peeled off and showedthe previous date. That  
 20 certainly causeda lot of alarm to our members. It made  
 21 them feel that they were using outdated PPE. It also  
 22 made them feel in some way that they were expendable.  
 23 So there was a lot of anxiety at the time and anger from  
 24 our members at the time.  
 25 However, I've heard more recently from some of my

1 senior colleagues in the BMA at UK level that they were  
 2 actually involved in that decision . So they became  
 3 aware that there was stockpiles of PPE that was about to  
 4 go out of date, so the advice given, including from my  
 5 BMA colleagues in London, was to test 10% of the PPE  
 6 and, if it was meeting standards, then it was okay to  
 7 redate them. So the BMA actually had a role in leading  
 8 to that outcome.  
 9 Q. Were there any regional differences in the availability  
 10 or suitability of PPE? I'm just wondering if it was  
 11 concentrated in the central belt or if there was  
 12 a greater shortage in the central belt. Were there any  
 13 differences regionally within Scotland?  
 14 A. I'm not aware of any regional differences, but I do  
 15 recall the GP committee making representation about  
 16 a somewhat haphazard supply of PPE. It was a bit  
 17 mysterious about when PPE was going to arrive and the  
 18 PPE was often changing and we often saw a reduction in  
 19 quality of the PPE, particularly around aprons, and, you  
 20 know, sometimes we would be using eye protection, other  
 21 times we'd be using visors. So there were quite a lot  
 22 of changes, particularly at the start , and supplies  
 23 would suddenly arrive and big boxes would suddenly  
 24 appear in my practice. So it was all a bit mysterious.  
 25 Q. You say big boxes arrived. How would the supplier of

1 that PPE know what was required within a particular  
 2 practice?  
 3 A. So I don't know, but my assumption was that it was all  
 4 done centrally through primary care managersand the  
 5 practice managers.  
 6 Q. Okay. You also discusspoor training in the use of PPE.  
 7 Whose responsibility would it be to train the wearersof  
 8 PPE?  
 9 A. So drawing on my own experience,there's two places  
 10 where I was taught to use PPE: one, in my medical  
 11 practice, our lead doctor would make sure that he was  
 12 abreast of all the advice and we had group tutorials and  
 13 they were videoed and shared with people who weren't in  
 14 during the day. So we did our in house training; and  
 15 when I worked at the COVID assessmentcentre in  
 16 Inverness, I was trained to don and doff, put on and  
 17 take off , my PPE by a senior nurse.  
 18 Q. Moving away from PPE, at paragraph 69 you start to  
 19 discuss the reporting of COVID infections of medical  
 20 staff . You say at paragraph 69:  
 21 "Alongside deficiencies with risk assessmentand  
 22 other protections in the workplace, many employersalso  
 23 failed to report Covid 19 ... of staff via RIDDOR ...  
 24 despite it being a legal requirement."  
 25 When you talk about "workplace", are you simply

1 talking about medical or are you talking about the  
 2 population as a whole?  
 3 A. I think, from my memory of reading that paragraph  
 4 before, we were talking about healthcare settings  
 5 because I think RIDDOR is about occupational diseases,  
 6 so COVID being an occupational disease.  
 7 Q. Did the BMA then do anything about that that you're  
 8 aware of?  
 9 A. Yeah, I don't recall what we did then. I know that we  
 10 still call for COVID 19 to be classified as an  
 11 occupational disease.  
 12 Q. And is it an occupational disease now?  
 13 A. I think at the moment it's not.  
 14 Q. It 's not. And you say that that reporting may also  
 15 assist staff , with long COVID developed as a result of  
 16 an infection acquired at work, seeking compensation.  
 17 A. Yeah, I think  
 18 Q. Sorry, the question I was going to ask is: do you know  
 19 that where COVID is identified on a sicknessabsence, is  
 20 there a distinction drawn, to your knowledge, between  
 21 long COVID and COVID?  
 22 A. I don't know because I don't work with anyone that has  
 23 long COVID so I've not seen a sicknessabsence record  
 24 with long COVID, so I don't know.  
 25 Q. At paragraph 70 you identify that risk assessments were

1 not being carried out in relation to whether medical  
 2 staff were at increased risk of contracting COVID or,  
 3 where risk assessments would be carried out, the  
 4 mitigation measures were not being implemented and that  
 5 the BMA raised this with the director general of Health  
 6 and Social Care. I think you mentioned you discussed  
 7 that earlier in your evidence. Do you know if there was  
 8 anything done as a result of raising that?  
 9 A. I don't know.  
 10 Q. You may not be able to answer my next question, then,  
 11 but you also identify and I appreciate other people  
 12 have contributed to the organisational statement but  
 13 the organisational statement also identifies that the  
 14 capacity of regular testing in Scotland or the lack  
 15 of I think is probably the better way to put it  
 16 was also raised with the director general. I'm just  
 17 wondering if you're aware of the outcome of that.  
 18 A. Again, I'm not aware of the outcome, but testing has  
 19 been a significant concern for us.  
 20 Q. In what respect?  
 21 A. The complete inadequacy of testing at the start of the  
 22 pandemic. So I wasn't being tested for COVID,  
 23 healthcare workers weren't being tested regularly for  
 24 COVID, so therefore we did not know, when we were going  
 25 into work, whether we were carriers we know now that

1 a lot of what we call "COVID spreaders" were  
 2 asymptomatic. So doctors and other healthcare workers  
 3 could have been going into work, inadvertently taking  
 4 COVID in with them, and we just didn't know and we  
 5 weren't therefore able to keep people away from the  
 6 workplace who were potentially COVID positive.  
 7 The same applies to patients as well. So in terms  
 8 of control measures, that source control, being able to  
 9 keep patients away from healthcare settings who were  
 10 COVID positive and being able to keep the workforce away  
 11 from healthcare settings who were COVID positive, was  
 12 hampered by the fact that we were not testing people,  
 13 and I assume that that was because of a lack of testing  
 14 kits.  
 15 Q. Okay. I suppose two questions. Was that raised with  
 16 anyone senior within the Scottish Government or another  
 17 agency?  
 18 A. I believe it was repeatedly.  
 19 Q. Okay, and what were the BMA asking for?  
 20 A. Well, they were certainly asking for regular testing of  
 21 healthcare workers.  
 22 Q. And to put that into practical terms, what would that  
 23 require? Testing kits to be provided?  
 24 A. Yes, that's right, so that people could test before they  
 25 went into work.

1 Q. And do you know the reason why testing kits weren't  
 2 being provided to healthcare staff?  
 3 A. I think it was simply to do with lack of availability,  
 4 lack of supply. They were being reserved for  
 5 positive or patients with symptoms.  
 6 Q. Is that at a particular dealing with the lack of  
 7 testing kits, is that concentrated at a particular  
 8 moment? The Inquiry is concerned with the period from  
 9 2020 to the end of 2022, the lack of testing. Is that  
 10 concentrated to a particular period of time during that  
 11 period?  
 12 A. I think the biggest concern would have been around about  
 13 the March 2020 to April/May period. That's when we  
 14 would have most concern about the lack of testing.  
 15 Q. I'll ask you to move forward to paragraph 120, please,  
 16 of the statement. You identify that the pandemic  
 17 increased staff shortages due to various factors,  
 18 including illness and medical staff being deployed to  
 19 high need services. Has this led to a backlog or has  
 20 this contributed to the backlog that we read about in  
 21 the papers almost daily?  
 22 A. Yeah, absolutely. Pre pandemic we had staff shortages.  
 23 We know that, in our hospitals, at least one in twelve  
 24 hospital consultant posts were vacant and we know that  
 25 between 2013 and 2019 GP numbers in Scotland flatlined.

1 There was a promise in around 2018 that there would be  
 2 800 more GPs produced and we know that that hasn't  
 3 happened. So we started from a very under resourced NHS  
 4 with staff shortages and also a shortage of beds and  
 5 inadequate facilities, and then so it was the worst  
 6 time to have the pandemic. And when the pandemic came,  
 7 yes, it had a huge impact on the workforce. First of  
 8 all we identified clinically extremely vulnerable people  
 9 within our workforce and, for example, in my own  
 10 practice, one doctor and one nurse then could not see  
 11 patients face to face at all and largely worked from  
 12 home, so they were largely removed from the workplace,  
 13 and, similarly, that would have happened across the  
 14 hospitals.  
 15 And, of course, every time somebody caught COVID in  
 16 the workplace and became COVID positive, they would  
 17 automatically be off work for at least a week. So that  
 18 of course put huge pressure on the remaining doctors.  
 19 So, for example, in my own group of practices we now  
 20 have four practices. I think we had three at the  
 21 time that would mean that at short notice people  
 22 would have to be redeployed elsewhere. So we were  
 23 already way under resourced in terms of staff in  
 24 Scotland and it got much worse during the pandemic and  
 25 it has got worse since.

1 Q. Can I ask, in terms of the we've heard evidence about  
 2 the health professionals being under resourced prior to  
 3 the pandemic. I'm wondering if you can assist me. Is  
 4 there anything putting aside simply recruiting more  
 5 people, is there anything that, in your opinion, could  
 6 have been done to enable patients more patients to  
 7 have been seen during the pandemic other than recruiting  
 8 more healthcare staff? Is there anything that could  
 9 have been done differently?  
 10 A. Well, retrospectively we perhaps could have divided  
 11 patients into and this would have depended upon  
 12 proper testing on those who were COVID positive, who  
 13 had COVID, and those who were not. If we had the  
 14 adequate facilities and the adequate staff, we could  
 15 then perhaps have continued to deliver long term  
 16 condition management, chronic disease management, in  
 17 general practice and also perhaps we could have  
 18 continued to deliver elective, planned hospital care if  
 19 we had separate systems. But I think in reality we did  
 20 not have the staff to be able to do that. But in future  
 21 that would, I think, be a better way of doing things and  
 22 then we wouldn't have this massive backlog that we have.  
 23 We know that, prior to the pandemic well,  
 24 March 2020 there were 335,000 people on waiting lists  
 25 in Scotland, both for hospital, inpatient and

1 outpatient, and December 2023, that figure has risen to  
 2 680,000 on waiting lists.  
 3 Q. Not just the increased waiting lists. Are there people  
 4 who, had they received treatment earlier for whatever  
 5 condition they were suffering from, wouldn't have  
 6 deteriorated? Is that a fair comment?  
 7 A. Yeah, and that's a common finding amongst general  
 8 practitioners, that patients' conditions have worsened,  
 9 and I'm thinking particularly of orthopaedic conditions,  
 10 people's hips and knees. But also the population has  
 11 become generally deconditioned, staying at home more,  
 12 gained weight, and some long term conditions haven't  
 13 been managed as well as they might have been had the  
 14 ongoing long term condition management continued.  
 15 Q. It may be an obvious question, but if a condition has  
 16 deteriorated, does that mean that more extensive  
 17 treatment will be required normally?  
 18 A. It does, but one of the bigger concerns is sometimes the  
 19 anaesthetist will not regard the patient fit for  
 20 surgery. So people who might have had surgery  
 21 pre pandemic are no longer fit enough to have their  
 22 surgery.  
 23 Q. I'll come on to screening later this morning or later  
 24 this afternoon perhaps. In terms of screening for  
 25 cancer, in your opinion, during the pandemic period

1 from, say, March 2020 to the end of December 2022 and  
 2 it may be different throughout that period was the  
 3 cancer screening available for people adequate?  
 4 A. So, from memory, I believe we stopped cervical screening  
 5 for I may get this wrong, but I think from memory it  
 6 was about six months. It may have been a year. So in  
 7 an ideal world, of course, we would want to have  
 8 continued to do that screening, so it wasn't adequate  
 9 because screening works and obviously we'd like to have  
 10 continued to do it, but it was stopped.  
 11 I think all healthcare professionals would have  
 12 agreed with that decision, that screening should be  
 13 stopped so that we could concentrate our resources on  
 14 the sick, but for those individuals who would be  
 15 receiving cervical screening, for example, or  
 16 mammograms, I'm sure that that would have been a huge  
 17 concern and an understandable concern for them.  
 18 Q. As a GP you deal with this in your statement at  
 19 paragraph 131 you talk about the demand on general  
 20 practice and so forth. I just wonder I suppose this  
 21 is more your evidence as a GP rather than your position  
 22 within the BMA but can you assist us: in terms of  
 23 other than cancer, what screenings would have normally  
 24 been available during the early stages of the pandemic  
 25 which weren't available and what were the consequences

1 of that or tests? Maybe I'll not just say  
 2 screenings; tests medical testing.  
 3 A. So we do tests obviously when we're looking for  
 4 particular diseases or patients come in with symptoms  
 5 and we're trying to drill down and find out what the  
 6 root of those symptoms are. So these tests would have  
 7 continued. You know, we moved very rapidly to mainly  
 8 telephone consultations and doctors and other healthcare  
 9 professionals are very comfortable with telephone  
 10 consultations. We've been doing them for 20 years or  
 11 more and it's quite easy for us to pick up when we need  
 12 to see a patient face to face and when we need to  
 13 investigate. So my practice, in terms of investigating  
 14 and doing tests, didn't change, and I would imagine that  
 15 would be similar for most doctors across the country.  
 16 Q. What about the impact on any maternity services,  
 17 antenatal fertility treatment? Was there an impact on  
 18 that in GP practices? I'm particularly interested in  
 19 GP practices.  
 20 A. So maternity services have moved out of general practice  
 21 in Scotland for many years. I no longer see pregnant  
 22 women for their pregnancy. That's all dealt with by  
 23 midwives. So I don't know the answer. I would assume  
 24 a lot more was done by telephone and by video.  
 25 Q. And fertility treatment, is that anything that GPs would

1 ever get involved in, even at the early I don't know  
 2 if there's testing and so forth at the early stages?  
 3 A. Yes, we get very involved at the start and I would  
 4 imagine that most of that would have stopped. I think  
 5 that would have been one of the areas that we would have  
 6 advised patients, "We cannot deal with that at the  
 7 moment".  
 8 Q. What about addiction services?  
 9 A. Again, I see a lot of patients with addictions. My  
 10 impression is that people with addictions stayed away.  
 11 In fact I believe that the pandemic will have inevitably  
 12 worsened many addictions because people working from  
 13 home it's much easier to conceal an addiction and for  
 14 an addiction to exacerbate if you don't have to turn up  
 15 and be seen by colleagues. So I think I could say  
 16 anecdotally that I saw less people presenting with  
 17 addictions and, again, the addiction services, I would  
 18 imagine, dealt with many more people remotely rather  
 19 than face to face, and it's so important to see people  
 20 with addictions face to face because you learn a lot  
 21 from the body language.  
 22 Q. Just dealing with the movement from in person to remote  
 23 consultation and you deal with this at I think  
 24 paragraph 132 of the organisational statement, and  
 25 within your organisational statement there's a useful

1 discussion on I suppose the shortcomings in the  
 2 IT equipment and the infrastructure in GP practices.  
 3 But I just wonder if you can help us, were there  
 4 particular groups of patients who were perhaps more at  
 5 a disadvantage when there was a move to remote  
 6 consultations, perhaps people that didn't have the  
 7 equipment or didn't know how to use the equipment? Did  
 8 you identify that there were particular groups of people  
 9 who were disadvantaged by that new method of working?  
 10 A. Yes. It's quite interesting when we talk about remote  
 11 consultations because I think the public thinks that  
 12 means a huge variety of modes of remote consultation.  
 13 In reality, 99% are done by telephone.  
 14 But we did, including myself, start doing video  
 15 consultations, but we very quickly found out that video  
 16 consultations were time consuming, difficult for the  
 17 patients to set up, difficult for the doctors to set up,  
 18 and often you would see a patient and bring them in  
 19 anyway because even a rash is difficult to diagnose over  
 20 video. So I think video consultations, although pushed  
 21 by the Government, are not really found by many  
 22 healthcare professionals, particularly GPs, as not [sic]  
 23 being that useful. Although in the Highlands, for  
 24 remote patients, there is a role.  
 25 [Redacted], who is a researcher at

1 Oxford University, has done a lot of research in this  
 2 area and she did a presentation to the annual  
 3 representative meeting of the BMA, and what she showed  
 4 was that remote consultations, particularly video  
 5 consultations, widens inequalities. So particularly for  
 6 people with disabilities and immediately autism  
 7 springs to mind video consultation is not  
 8 particularly good for dealing with people with that sort  
 9 of disability, but also the elderly and, again, ethnic  
 10 minority groups, those who need translators. So video  
 11 consultations definitely widen inequalities. And  
 12 I remember dealing with a patient who had a background  
 13 in IT and she couldn't even sort her video consultation  
 14 with me. It was quite amusing at the time and we  
 15 I think I ended up speaking to her on the phone.  
 16 Q. I think we've all been there at some point over the last  
 17 few years.  
 18 At paragraph 141 of your statement you then touch on  
 19 the health of children and I wonder if I could ask  
 20 you and I suppose these questions are also geared or  
 21 principally geared towards you, with your experience,  
 22 having been a practising GP for so long. Can you tell  
 23 me, in terms of the pandemic, did that, that you're  
 24 aware of, have any impact on the safeguarding of  
 25 children? Is that something that, as a GP, you would be

1 involved in or medical say, for instance, medical  
 2 appointments in relation to potential foster care  
 3 placements, is that something that as a GP you've  
 4 experienced?  
 5 A. So I have experience of safeguarding as a GP and of  
 6 doing fostering medicals and I'm trying to think of  
 7 those experiences during the pandemic. I know for sure  
 8 that fostering medicals stopped during the pandemic and,  
 9 in terms of safeguarding, I certainly was aware of  
 10 widespread acknowledgement that there was an increase in  
 11 domestic violence which would inevitably impact on  
 12 children. So, you know, with parents being in the home,  
 13 I think relationships certainly suffered for some  
 14 families during the pandemic. I can't remember anything  
 15 specifically said about safeguarding but I think it  
 16 would be reasonable to make the assumption that there  
 17 would have been a worsening of safeguarding incidents.  
 18 Q. Thank you. We'll hear from social work departments in  
 19 due course in evidence in any event, which they may  
 20 have more with respect, they may deal with it more on  
 21 a daily basis.  
 22 In terms of looked after children and young people,  
 23 my understanding is that they normally have an annual  
 24 medical arranged through the local authority with  
 25 a general practitioner. I don't know if that's

1 something you've ever dealt with.  
 2 A. No, that's something that definitely doesn't happen.  
 3 There definitely isn't an annual medical with GPs done.  
 4 I've been a GP in my practice for 23 years. I think  
 5 I can maybe remember doing one medical. So if those  
 6 medicals are done, they're done elsewhere and I'm not  
 7 sure who does them.  
 8 Q. Thank you. Moving forward to paragraph 156, you tell us  
 9 that the BMA published guidance "in the absence of clear  
 10 and adequate guidance" from the Government. Can you  
 11 assist me, when you're talking about inadequate  
 12 guidance, is that from the UK Government, the  
 13 Scottish Government or is it both?  
 14 A. It would be both, and I think it's fair to say that  
 15 generally the Scottish Government would have followed  
 16 the UK guidance.  
 17 Q. Okay. Was this guidance published throughout the  
 18 pandemic period that we're interested in, from 2020 to  
 19 2022, or was it a one off publication on a particular  
 20 topic or was it updated as matters developed?  
 21 A. So the BMA was regularly producing guidance in various  
 22 areas where they felt that the guidance was inadequate  
 23 or where the Government had chosen not to put out  
 24 guidance.  
 25 Q. I just have a few more questions for you, Doctor. At

1 paragraph 160 you discuss the engagement with the  
 2 Scottish Government throughout the pandemic and I think  
 3 you use words like "regular" and "supportive". I'm just  
 4 wondering if there was over the past hour we've heard  
 5 evidence that the Scottish Government, particularly in  
 6 relation to whether it was an airborne disease, haven't  
 7 always agreed. I'm just wondering, is that when you  
 8 say that the Scottish Government were that the  
 9 meetings were regular and supportive, in what respect?  
 10 A. So I know that the relationship between our national  
 11 director, who is not a doctor, and the Government was  
 12 very good. I've seen a list of about six different  
 13 regular meetings that she attended. So I know that the  
 14 relationship was good and the lines of communication  
 15 were kept open. And also I know that my predecessor was  
 16 involved probably in the majority of those meetings and  
 17 there would be no problem with the chair of the BMA  
 18 speaking, for example, with the Chief Medical Officer.  
 19 And certainly at the start of the pandemic, I think  
 20 relationships were good.  
 21 Q. I don't want to put words in your mouth, but it strikes  
 22 me from some of the things I'm reading I appreciate  
 23 that what you're saying is the lines of communication  
 24 were good, but I'm just wondering whether you're saying,  
 25 ultimately, that things were being done

1 notwithstanding that there was somebody that you could  
 2 speak to in the Scottish Government, were things being  
 3 done to the satisfaction of BMA Scotland at least?  
 4 A. So it's quite common for the BMA not to be happy with  
 5 Government decisions and it's quite common for us to  
 6 disagree. I think it's fair to say there were a number  
 7 of issues throughout the pandemic that the BMA in  
 8 Scotland disagreed with the Scottish Government on and  
 9 with the Chief Medical Officer on, and my understanding  
 10 is that the four chief medical officers across the four  
 11 nations kept to a single line of advice, and it might be  
 12 that Scotland was following the advice of the other  
 13 three nations at a pan UK level and that we, the BMA in  
 14 Scotland, were not able to influence that  
 15 decision making in a way that we would have liked to  
 16 have done.  
 17 Q. Finally, in the last two pages of the organisational  
 18 statement you detail BMA Scotland's recommendations and  
 19 we have those in evidence. I'm just wondering if  
 20 there's anything which I either haven't mentioned today  
 21 or have mentioned that you would like to clarify, if  
 22 there's anything this is an opportunity essentially  
 23 if there's anything further you would like to add in  
 24 your evidence today.  
 25 A. So I think the key thing to emphasise is that we need

1 a better resourced NHS. If we started from a bad  
 2 position, and I'm particularly thinking about workforce  
 3 and also about estates, and that affected ventilation  
 4 and our ability to see patients. I think I've  
 5 emphasised that healthcare workers were inadequately  
 6 protected. We didn't have the right control measures in  
 7 place at source, you know, with ventilation through the  
 8 pathways and with the receptors, us, the healthcare  
 9 workers. We didn't focus enough on inequalities and  
 10 vulnerable people and we didn't get safeguarding right.  
 11 We didn't safeguard the mental health of the workforce  
 12 nor did we protect doctors from long COVID and nor did  
 13 we protect the training I haven't spoken much about  
 14 the impact on junior doctors but their training  
 15 certainly suffered.  
 16 I'd also like to say a little bit about the culture.  
 17 We do have a cultural problem in the NHS in Scotland  
 18 still, where doctors and other healthcare workers don't  
 19 feel confident about speaking up and raising concerns.  
 20 We still have a blame culture. We still have a rather  
 21 command and control culture in the NHS in Scotland, and  
 22 that's not good for patients because we don't feel able  
 23 to speak up so much about patient safety.  
 24 And, finally, my final point would be we didn't  
 25 focus enough on recovery. Right now the NHS in Scotland

1 is in the worst position that I can remember it in terms  
 2 of staffing and in terms of our estates. We started the  
 3 pandemic 1 million £1 billion behind in maintenance  
 4 and we've now got a complete cessation on capital  
 5 projects, so we needed to have kept money aside or to  
 6 have put resources into the recovery phase of the  
 7 pandemic.  
 8 MR DUNLOP: Thank you, Doctor. May I just take this  
 9 opportunity also to thank you for participating in the  
 10 Inquiry and preparing such a comprehensive  
 11 organisational statement on behalf of your organisation.  
 12 It's very much appreciated and the Inquiry requires  
 13 bodies like yours to participate to work.  
 14 My Lord, I have no further questions and there are  
 15 no further witnesses this afternoon.  
 16 THE CHAIR: No. I was aware of that. Thank you. No, all  
 17 that remains for me to do is to thank Dr Kennedy as well  
 18 and thank the BMA for their full assistance in this very  
 19 large statement which you've prepared. So thank you.  
 20 A. Thank you, my Lord.  
 21 THE CHAIR: I think all I have to say therefore is that it's  
 22 slightly unusual tomorrow I'm just checking my  
 23 timetable because I think we're starting at now, I'm  
 24 told on my I don't know if you know the answer to  
 25 this, Mr Dunlop, but I've got as usual tomorrow starting

1 at 9.45. My recollection is that, because of trying to  
 2 condense work into a shorter period tomorrow, we're  
 3 starting at 9.30. Can you confirm that?  
 4 MR DUNLOP: That's my understanding as well. My Lord, I'll  
 5 certainly check with those that certainly will know  
 6 without any doubt, but my understanding was there was to  
 7 be an earlier start to accommodate Mr Macaskill and  
 8 thereafter Ms Hedge.  
 9 THE CHAIR: That's what I thought as well. So I think,  
 10 ladies and gentlemen, we're starting at 9.30 tomorrow  
 11 morning, but until then, thank you all.  
 12 MR DUNLOP: Thank you, my Lord.  
 13 (12.27 pm)  
 14 (The hearing adjourned until  
 15 Friday, 22 March 2024 at 9.30 am)  
 16  
 17  
 18  
 19  
 20  
 21  
 22  
 23  
 24  
 25

1 INDEX  
 2 DR BARBARA MILES (called) .....1  
 Questions by MS BAHRAMI .....1  
 3 DR IAIN KENNEDY (called) .....45  
 Questions by MR DUNLOP .....45  
 4  
 5  
 6  
 7  
 8  
 9  
 10  
 11  
 12  
 13  
 14  
 15  
 16  
 17  
 18  
 19  
 20  
 21  
 22  
 23  
 24  
 25



converted(2) 21:5,11  
 cordial(1) 59:2  
 core(1) 24:15  
 corporeal(1) 42:9  
 correct(4) 46:6,19 65:18,20  
 correctly(1) 57:18  
 costs(1) 13:25  
 couldnt(6) 11:14,19 25:5  
 29:1 30:18 83:13  
 council(4) 48:11,16,19,20  
 counselling(2) 39:23 40:4  
 counsels(3) 16:19 17:1 29:8  
 country(3) 3:12 14:22 80:15  
 couple(2) 58:13 69:9  
 course(7) 21:25 57:8 64:22  
 76:15,18 79:7 84:19  
 courses(1) 28:18  
 covered(1) 44:2  
 coverings(2) 52:9 54:10  
 covers(1) 46:13  
 covid(55) 3:10 5:10,17 11:5  
 14:21 24:16 27:24  
 36:14,20 51:6,18 54:1  
 55:10,12,15,16,17,19,21,23  
 56:4,12,14,17,21,23  
 57:1,3,6,14 60:18,21 61:2  
 64:3,16,19 65:8 67:11  
 71:15,19  
 72:6,15,19,21,23,24  
 73:2,22,24 74:1,4 76:15  
 77:13 88:12  
 covid19(3) 31:8 71:23 72:10  
 covidpositive(5) 74:6,10,11  
 76:16 77:12  
 cpr(3) 40:9,10,25  
 created(2) 12:3 19:24  
 critical(40) 2:8,9 3:2  
 4:2,7,12,15,19 14:17  
 17:7,10 21:24  
 22:2,5,7,13,17 23:25 24:15  
 25:6,8,11,14,15  
 26:16,20,22,23 27:6  
 28:11,14 31:6,12 33:20,24  
 34:12 38:6,13 44:5,10  
 criticism(1) 31:18  
 cromarty(1) 48:5  
 crowded(1) 60:24  
 cues(1) 34:11  
 cultural(1) 88:17  
 culture(4) 68:10  
 88:16,20,21  
 current(3) 32:9 33:2,12  
 currently(1) 24:11  
 cutting(1) 65:6  
 cylinders(1) 20:1

D

daily(12) 13:10,15 25:18  
 50:22 58:5,7,14,17  
 63:24,25 75:21 84:21  
 data(5) 29:16 53:12 66:15  
 67:2,3  
 date(6) 69:10,11,12,18,19  
 70:4  
 day(2) 65:16 71:14  
 deal(12) 3:17 13:22 16:11  
 17:12 53:9,17 60:3 62:15  
 79:18 81:6,23 84:20  
 dealing(6) 52:24 67:9 75:6  
 81:22 83:8,12  
 dealt(7) 10:7 56:15 60:2  
 63:6 80:22 81:18 85:1  
 death(1) 41:14  
 deaths(1) 60:13  
 debate(1) 57:14  
 december(2) 78:1 79:1  
 decide(1) 25:20  
 decided(1) 25:21  
 deciding(1) 37:23  
 decision(5) 9:22 25:23  
 40:16 70:2 79:12  
 decisionmaking(2) 48:23  
 87:15  
 decisions(3) 9:10 21:15 87:5  
 deconditioned(1) 78:11  
 decontaminated(1) 10:14

decontamination(2) 10:7,11  
 deem(1) 36:13  
 deemed(1) 36:19  
 deficiencies(1) 71:21  
 defined(3) 4:8,8 10:23  
 definitely(5) 58:6 62:10  
 83:11 85:2,3  
 definition(1) 14:3  
 definitions(1) 4:23  
 degenerative(1) 62:8  
 degree(6) 5:24 8:8 25:17  
 27:15 31:19 40:5  
 delay(1) 9:11  
 delayed(1) 9:22  
 deliver(8) 4:21 20:17 21:11  
 37:4,11,13 77:15,18  
 delivered(7) 4:10 7:1  
 20:1,2,5 44:11 68:3  
 delivery(7) 2:23 5:20  
 20:14,15 21:21 27:6 57:22  
 demand(4) 16:23 21:9 36:1  
 79:19  
 demanding(1) 27:17  
 democratic(1) 47:6  
 demonstrate(2) 53:22 66:15  
 demonstrating(1) 68:8  
 dentists(1) 68:21  
 denude(1) 21:14  
 departments(1) 84:18  
 departure(1) 27:4  
 depend(1) 12:13  
 depended(1) 77:11  
 dependencies(1) 11:1  
 dependency(3) 4:23 6:2  
 22:8  
 dependent(1) 15:22  
 depending(2) 40:16 42:5  
 depends(1) 32:3  
 deployed(1) 75:18  
 depression(1) 60:5  
 deprived(2) 47:24 60:22  
 deputy(2) 68:22,25  
 designed(1) 52:2  
 despite(2) 41:23 71:24  
 detail(7) 8:20 10:5 14:2  
 32:12 38:17 39:7 87:18  
 deteriorated(2) 78:6,16  
 developed(2) 72:15 85:20  
 devolved(2) 46:16,18  
 diagnose(1) 82:19  
 diagnosis(1) 57:6  
 dialogue(1) 58:15  
 didnt(27) 2:12 3:4,5 5:11,19  
 7:2 11:14,17 16:4,6  
 30:3,20 32:6,16,19 37:17  
 43:2 52:24 74:4 80:14  
 82:6,7 88:6,9,10,11,24  
 die(2) 41:21 42:3  
 dieticians(1) 2:6  
 difference(6) 46:10 49:6  
 50:4 53:19 61:20,22  
 differences(3) 70:9,13,14  
 different(21) 6:17  
 9:7,8,17,20 13:10 14:23  
 15:10,10,24 25:17 28:19  
 30:23 33:3,4,4 47:4 49:7  
 66:9 79:2 86:12  
 differently(4) 14:19,21  
 15:24 77:9  
 differentshaped(1) 54:17  
 difficult(26) 5:13 8:3  
 9:10,22 11:18 13:14,17  
 18:6 21:15 24:16 29:24  
 32:24 33:2,5,13 34:6,13  
 37:20 39:12,13 62:12,23  
 63:5 82:16,17,19  
 difficulty(3) 52:5,9 67:15  
 dignified(1) 41:3  
 direct(4) 57:2 58:22  
 59:10,11  
 directly(3) 6:10,11 10:2  
 director(13) 48:17 50:19  
 58:21 59:8,9 68:23,25  
 69:2,5,6 73:5,16 86:11  
 directorate(1) 59:9  
 disabilities(2) 62:25 83:6

disability(1) 83:9  
 disabled(2) 53:23 54:4  
 disadvantaged(1) 82:5  
 disadvantaged(1) 82:9  
 disagree(1) 87:6  
 disagreed(2) 30:2 87:8  
 disappeared(1) 28:14  
 disbanded(2) 7:21,22  
 discrimination(1) 63:15  
 discuss(4) 56:16 71:6,19  
 86:1  
 discussed(4) 21:1,2 69:7  
 73:6  
 discussion(4) 40:16 42:21  
 57:17 82:1  
 discussion(1) 39:4  
 disease(15) 11:12 29:17  
 51:6 60:6 64:4,18,20  
 66:18,21,22 72:6,11,12  
 77:16 86:6  
 diseases(3) 62:7 72:5 80:4  
 disproportionate(1) 62:17  
 disproportionately(1) 60:9  
 disregarded(1) 32:9  
 disrupted(3) 2:23 3:1,7  
 disruption(1) 3:15  
 distinction(1) 72:20  
 distinguish(1) 46:9  
 distressing(6)  
 34:16,17,17,18,21 37:25  
 distribute(2) 33:7,9  
 distribution(1) 17:2  
 diverse(1) 63:14  
 divided(1) 77:10  
 dividing(2) 17:8,10  
 division(2) 46:7,7  
 dnacpr(2) 39:5 40:14  
 doctor(11) 2:17 31:10 51:13  
 56:24 57:5,7 71:11 76:10  
 85:25 86:11 89:8  
 doctor(s)(1) 57:9  
 doctors(30) 2:5,6 5:23 6:2  
 25:20 28:22  
 47:8,10,10,13,14 49:1  
 51:17 53:13 55:11  
 56:9,10,18 59:18 60:13  
 62:18 66:2 74:2 76:18  
 80:8,15 82:17 88:12,14,18  
 documentary(1) 66:24  
 documented(1) 38:11  
 does(11) 8:11 31:9 38:11  
 40:21 41:5 46:22,24 52:20  
 78:16,18 85:7  
 doesnt(7) 1:13 7:23 23:8  
 30:13 45:1 51:15 85:2  
 doff(1) 71:16  
 dogma(3) 51:8 64:2,24  
 doing(9) 33:6 41:6 49:22  
 77:21 80:10,14 82:14 84:6  
 85:5  
 domestic(1) 84:11  
 don(1) 71:16  
 done(25) 2:19 21:20 23:23  
 50:11 51:1,4 52:18 53:22  
 55:3 58:13 62:6 63:7 71:4  
 73:8 77:6,9 80:24 82:13  
 83:1 85:3,6,6 86:25  
 87:3,16  
 dont(31) 3:21 5:7 6:13 18:1  
 21:17 22:16 23:19,21  
 26:22 31:1 32:8,21  
 42:12,24 43:8 58:25 61:9  
 71:3 72:9,22,22,24 73:9  
 80:23 81:1,14 84:25 86:21  
 88:18,22 89:24  
 door(1) 38:16  
 double(1) 22:15  
 doubt(3) 60:2 22:90:6  
 down(7) 3:9,10 16:21 21:10  
 28:10 43:14 80:5  
 downright(1) 29:19  
 dr(13) 1:14,15,22  
 45:7,14,18,19,25 46:2  
 64:23 89:17 91:2,3  
 dramatically(1) 16:18  
 drawing(1) 71:9

drawn(1) 72:20  
 drill(1) 80:5  
 driven(2) 21:10 29:20  
 droplet(3) 51:7 64:2,24  
 droplets(1) 51:11  
 drug(5) 16:13 18:1,12  
 20:13,13  
 drugs(6) 16:17,25 17:14,25  
 18:3,10  
 due(3) 51:23 75:17 84:19  
 dunedin(1) 48:1  
 dunlop(15) 1:4,9  
 45:12,13,22,23,24,25  
 64:22 66:12 89:8,25  
 90:4,12 91:3  
 during(31) 3:10 4:4,24 6:18  
 7:4 9:18 10:19,23 20:4  
 21:7 24:16 28:15,17,23  
 36:22 37:7 38:20 40:3 43:6  
 48:16 55:12 61:24 71:14  
 75:10 76:24 77:7 78:25  
 79:24 84:7,8,14  
 duties(1) 58:22  
 dying(4) 32:1 40:23 41:1,4

E

earlier(3) 73:7 78:4 90:7  
 early(9) 2:10 7:16 57:12,17  
 59:16 60:12 79:24 81:1,2  
 ease(1) 13:24  
 easier(2) 17:24 81:13  
 easily(1) 8:1  
 easy(2) 26:24 80:11  
 ecmo(8) 42:9,11  
 43:2,4,14,14,15,17  
 edinburgh(3) 43:7,20,24  
 education(8) 2:15 19:23  
 25:18 28:7,9,17,21 29:3  
 effect(3) 15:6 19:20 29:1  
 effective(1) 44:24  
 effectively(5) 21:19 23:3  
 45:4 50:20 68:3  
 effects(4) 16:2 24:17,18,22  
 efficient(1) 22:3  
 effort(1) 5:10  
 eight(1) 23:17  
 either(2) 34:24 87:20  
 elderly(1) 83:9  
 elect(1) 12:10  
 elective(11)  
 12:4,5,6,12,14,17,20,21,24  
 13:4 77:18  
 else(2) 41:11 53:21  
 elsewhere(2) 76:22 85:6  
 email(2) 58:22 66:22  
 emergency(5) 12:6,11 13:16  
 24:2,3  
 eminent(1) 66:3  
 emphasise(1) 87:25  
 emphasised(1) 88:5  
 employees(1) 64:7  
 employer(2) 55:8 64:12  
 employers(2) 55:5 71:22  
 empty(5) 4:19 7:3,8  
 11:13,15  
 enable(1) 77:6  
 encapsulates(1) 29:14  
 end(16) 3:23 34:19,22  
 36:7,18 38:25  
 39:3,8,9,18,20 41:3 45:2  
 55:13 75:9 79:1  
 ended(1) 83:15  
 endoflife(5) 37:24  
 38:8,11,14,19  
 endured(1) 37:25  
 engagement(1) 86:1  
 england(1) 46:14  
 english(2) 46:7,7  
 enough(5) 21:8 38:21 78:21  
 88:9,25  
 ensure(2) 37:25 55:2  
 entirely(1) 37:13  
 entirety(1) 10:1  
 environment(7) 10:10,11  
 27:16 34:7 36:12,15 63:17

environments(1) 15:5  
 equal(2) 14:18,18  
 equality(1) 63:10  
 equally(2) 18:3 53:11  
 equipment(13) 19:13 36:13  
 44:12,13,15 49:15,25 51:9  
 64:9,13 82:2,7,7  
 erection(1) 13:21  
 especially(3) 17:21 24:25  
 42:18  
 essentially(2) 4:17 15:3  
 essential(8) 15:15 46:10  
 54:24 59:25 65:4 67:21  
 69:12 87:22  
 estates(2) 88:3 89:2  
 ethnic(8) 52:7 53:13,23 54:4  
 60:14 62:17 63:11 83:9  
 evaporator(1) 20:6  
 even(7) 7:4 23:12 41:12  
 49:18 81:1 82:19 83:13  
 evaporation(1) 20:6  
 ever(5) 20:22 21:1 63:14  
 81:1 85:1  
 every(5) 40:19,21 56:9  
 59:15 76:15  
 everybody(3) 2:7 33:10,12  
 everyday(1) 59:25  
 everyone(1) 1:17  
 evidence(15) 1:9 46:23 50:6  
 55:22 57:8 65:3 68:8 69:11  
 73:7 77:1 79:21 84:19 86:5  
 87:19,24  
 exacerbate(1) 81:14  
 exacerbated(1) 63:3  
 exact(1) 54:9  
 exactly(1) 12:15  
 examination(1) 18:20  
 examine(1) 14:22  
 example(21) 5:1 6:23 7:15  
 9:14,17 11:8 12:7,22 14:19  
 22:23 23:12,13 35:25  
 37:14 41:14 47:3 63:9  
 76:9,19 79:15 86:18  
 exams(1) 28:18  
 exception(2) 26:22 43:12  
 exclude(2) 56:24 57:1  
 excluded(1) 66:4  
 executive(3) 50:20 69:1,5  
 exercise(3) 42:20,23 54:22  
 exist(2) 2:13 7:23  
 existed(1) 63:3  
 existing(3) 23:9,10 61:14  
 expand(4) 3:13,22 22:8 28:1  
 expanded(6) 3:2,11 7:5 22:5  
 37:15 44:5  
 expansion(7) 3:17,20,24  
 44:6,10,15,17  
 expect(1) 20:11  
 expected(1) 28:3  
 expecting(1) 1:4  
 expendable(1) 69:22  
 experience(11) 4:14 21:24  
 25:12,14 26:18 37:17 58:6  
 67:25 71:9 83:21 84:5  
 experienced(8) 3:19 22:6,24  
 25:16,19 26:15 44:14 84:4  
 experiences(2) 29:9 84:7  
 expert(1) 66:3  
 expertise(1) 29:2  
 experts(4) 29:18 65:23 66:1  
 67:8  
 expired(1) 69:14  
 expiry(2) 69:11,12  
 explain(6) 33:18 46:9 48:10  
 58:17 59:18 68:15  
 explained(3) 51:19 53:18  
 69:10  
 explanation(2) 65:17,20  
 exposure(2) 28:14,19  
 expressed(2) 31:18 44:17  
 extended(2) 22:21 23:11  
 extensive(1) 78:16  
 extent(4) 3:25 10:4 38:20  
 44:5  
 extra(6) 5:19 21:13,21  
 22:11,16 42:9

extremely(2) 63:1 76:8  
 eye(1) 70:20

F

face(15) 34:10,10,15,15  
 52:17 54:10 69:14  
 76:11,11 80:12,12  
 81:19,19,20,20  
 faces(3) 52:3,4 54:17  
 facetoface(1) 33:15  
 facets(1) 69:15  
 faculties(2) 76:5 77:14  
 factor(1) 21:3  
 factors(2) 27:7 75:17  
 failed(3) 52:6,11 71:23  
 failing(2) 4:25 54:8  
 fails(2) 52:13,19  
 failure(3) 5:1,1 23:15  
 fair(6) 48:12 63:2 67:18  
 78:6 85:14 87:6  
 fake(1) 29:19  
 fall(1) 55:8  
 false(1) 29:7  
 familiar(5) 17:19,20 19:12  
 49:14 50:14  
 familiarisation(1) 19:16  
 familiarity(1) 19:23  
 families(7) 24:24 29:24  
 33:16 34:17 36:6,10 84:14  
 family(24) 25:2  
 33:15,22,24,25  
 34:2,3,4,6,8,14,20,24  
 36:11,17,19  
 39:9,13,16,17,21 40:1,2  
 42:5  
 far(5) 14:20 19:12 47:5 58:8  
 63:5  
 fare(1) 9:8  
 fatal(1) 41:22  
 fatigue(2) 56:6,25  
 fault(1) 1:4  
 favour(1) 32:1  
 fearful(3) 53:15,24 54:2  
 feasible(4) 23:22  
 44:18,19,21  
 fed(2) 30:17 53:3  
 feed(2) 36:1 63:12  
 feedback(1) 30:14  
 feel(12) 30:19 32:7 37:3  
 39:10,15,18 40:25 54:1  
 69:21,22 88:19,22  
 fellow(1) 31:1  
 felt(11) 25:3,5 31:6 44:4  
 53:11,14,15 54:5 62:18,21  
 85:22  
 female(2) 54:9,10  
 females(1) 60:19  
 fertility(2) 80:17,25  
 few(5) 12:25 23:8 57:12  
 83:17 85:25  
 fp3(6) 15:8,15 49:16,20  
 64:9,17  
 figure(1) 78:1  
 filipinos(2) 60:16 62:24  
 filling(1) 26:14  
 filtration(3) 18:23 19:6,11  
 final(2) 42:8 88:24  
 finally(3) 43:17 87:17 88:24  
 find(4) 8:18 16:1 39:6 80:5  
 finding(1) 78:7  
 finite(1) 44:15  
 first(12) 1:7 3:10 5:14  
 14:4,7 18:25 24:25 25:7  
 40:7 53:3 60:12 76:7  
 firstly(2) 4:5 8:14  
 fit(11) 15:11,13  
 52:7,11,12,13,14,20 54:8  
 78:19,21  
 fits(2) 52:16,17  
 fitted(2) 15:4 52:10  
 fitting(3) 51:24,24 52:24  
 flaired(1) 75:25  
 flexibility(1) 68:8  
 flight(2) 5:14,16  
 floor(1) 30:13  
 flu(2) 3:17,18

fluidresistant(3) 49:13  
 51:16 64:14  
 fluids(1) 18:22  
 focus(3) 12:15 88:9,25  
 fog(2) 56:6,25  
 follow(4) 38:23 55:1 64:11  
 68:11  
 followed(7) 1:8 38:20,22  
 54:24 66:5 67:14 85:15  
 following(4) 12:25 13:8 29:8  
 87:12  
 follows(1) 66:13  
 followup(1) 61:14  
 footprint(1) 7:5  
 fore(2) 60:11,12  
 forget(1) 66:5  
 form(2) 54:3 58:15  
 formed(1) 3:22  
 former(1) 50:19  
 forth(3) 61:5 79:20 81:2  
 forum(1) 63:10  
 forward(4) 30:6,8 75:15 85:8  
 foster(1) 84:2  
 fostering(2) 84:6,8  
 found(5) 24:15 34:25 62:22  
 82:15,21  
 founded(1) 2:10  
 four(9) 8:12 44:17 46:13  
 47:23 48:20 55:18 76:20  
 87:10,10  
 foyers(1) 48:2  
 friday(1) 90:15  
 front(2) 23:17 31:1  
 frustrating(1) 15:20  
 full(3) 36:15 46:1 89:18  
 fully(1) 32:18  
 function(1) 21:19  
 fundamental(2) 51:5 65:24  
 fundamentally(2) 5:18 64:4  
 funded(2) 4:3,6  
 funding(5) 4:18,18,20 5:9,20  
 funeral(3) 36:8,21,24  
 further(5) 43:7 66:12 87:23  
 89:14,15  
 future(5) 18:5,7 23:23 27:4  
 77:20

G

gained(1) 78:12  
 gas(1) 21:11  
 gather(1) 16:20  
 gaze(2) 44:8 65:14  
 geared(2) 83:20,21  
 general(19) 29:11 47:21  
 49:10,14,19 25:50:12  
 53:25 55:6 56:3,25 57:15  
 73:5,16 77:17 78:7 79:19  
 80:20 84:25  
 generally(11) 13:11 35:16  
 44:4 49:19 53:24 55:12  
 57:2,4 61:3 78:11 85:15  
 generic(1) 54:16  
 gentlemen(1) 90:10  
 geographical(1) 42:15  
 get(15) 5:4,11,19 8:5,6 14:2  
 22:16 30:14 43:1 57:1 62:8  
 79:5 81:1,3 88:10  
 getting(2) 52:9 61:23  
 give(3) 47:3 61:11 69:15  
 given(16) 3:23 23:24,25  
 30:22 31:20 34:23 40:11  
 43:10 49:4,12 57:6  
 65:12,17,19 67:6 70:4  
 giving(2) 65:4 69:10  
 glasgow(4) 2:19 43:7,20,23  
 global(1) 16:16  
 gmc(1) 39:2  
 goes(1) 62:11  
 going(14) 3:25 20:19  
 25:1,24 27:19 29:6 41:11  
 50:14 51:11 54:14 70:17  
 72:18 73:24 74:3  
 gold(3) 68:14,25 69:5  
 gone(1) 25:4  
 good(20) 1:3,6,15,16,22  
 29:16

45:12,13,17,19,20,25  
51:11 58:24 83:8  
86:12,14,20,24,88:22  
**government(37)** 31:7 50:22  
51:19 53:5 57:25  
58:3,11,16,24 59:4,8  
63:13,22 65:6,14,24  
66:8,15,23 67:12,14  
68:7,11 74:16 82:21  
85:10,12,13,15,23  
86:2,5,8,11 87:2,5,8  
**governments(3)** 44:18  
57:20 66:8  
**gp (23)** 47:22,23 48:7,11,21  
55:9 56:8 61:18 67:20,25  
68:23 70:15 75:25  
79:18,21 80:18,19 82:2  
83:22,25 84:3,5 85:4  
**gps (7)** 47:4,12 68:21 76:2  
80:8 82:22 85:3  
**grampian(1)** 42:14  
**great (3)** 34:5,13 44:1  
**greater (3)** 47:6 52:9 70:12  
**green (1)** 12:2  
**group (12)** 27:6 33:22 37:15  
38:10 47:9 48:7 60:20 66:4  
68:19,23 71:12 76:19  
**groups(20)** 11:24 13:10  
34:25 44:8 51:25 52:4,7  
53:23 54:1 58:14 60:8,14  
61:13 62:22 63:1,11,17  
82:4,8 83:10  
**guidance(46)** 11:2  
30:2,4,11,15 31:25  
32:3,4,5,6,20,23 33:3,8  
35:11,12,13,19 36:9 39:2  
57:21 58:4,9,11 63:21  
64:5,7,10 65:4 66:6,7,7,14  
67:10,11,14,19,22  
85:9,10,12,16,17,21,22,24

H

**hadnt (1)** 38:23  
**haemodialysis(4)** 18:24  
19:7,9,12  
**haemorrhage(1)** 41:14  
**half (1)** 8:12  
**hampered(1)** 74:12  
**haphazard(1)** 70:16  
**happen(4)** 25:1,2 33:1 85:2  
**happened(1)** 14:4,6,10  
20:21 31:24 32:12 39:6  
40:3 57:17 76:3,13  
**happening(1)** 57:24  
**happens(3)** 14:5 18:12  
39:25  
**happy(1)** 87:4  
**hasnt (1)** 76:2  
**havent (13)** 6:10 8:19 30:18  
32:11,11 44:2,23 56:15  
62:14 78:12 86:6 87:20  
88:13  
**having(14)** 3:22 11:5 12:9  
20:14 22:20 23:10 29:17  
32:15 34:11,19 42:16 54:9  
60:2 83:22  
**hdu (2)** 12:3 21:25  
**head (3)** 17:18 52:8 54:10  
**headed(1)** 49:1  
**heads(2)** 52:3,4  
**health (49)** 2:4 7:6,7  
12:19,23 13:1,20 14:2  
24:24,25 26:7 27:23 28:6  
29:5 35:13 43:25 50:11,13  
55:4,6 59:9,18 62:60:4  
61:3,7,13,15,18  
62:1,3,5,7,9,10,11 64:11  
65:25 66:5,2,7 67:17,18,20  
68:8 73:5 77:2 83:19 88:11  
**healthcare(29)** 3:6 10:10  
13:11 26:25 27:11 28:20  
44:7 51:11,17 53:12 57:22  
60:25 63:20 64:16 68:3  
72:4 73:23 74:2,9,11,21  
75:2 77:8 79:11 80:8 82:22  
88:5,8,18

**hear (4)** 30:9 46:23 55:22  
84:18  
**heard(5)** 50:6 68:14 69:25  
77:1 86:4  
**hearing(1)** 90:14  
**hedge(1)** 90:8  
**help (7)** 16:25 22:9,10,19  
37:16,25 82:3  
**helpful(3)** 13:13 22:3 66:10  
**helps(1)** 21:10  
**here (2)** 26:22 47:18  
**hidden(1)** 62:4  
**high (5)** 4:22 6:2 11:1 22:7  
27:16  
**higher(4)** 5:3,3 60:6 67:21  
**highest(1)** 67:7  
**highland(3)** 48:6,17 67:23  
**highlands(1)** 82:23  
**highlight(1)** 44:3  
**highneed(1)** 75:19  
**hinterland(1)** 48:5  
**hips(1)** 78:10  
**hmm (1)** 16:12  
**hold (1)** 48:10  
**home (6)** 36:21 62:4 76:12  
78:11 81:13 84:12  
**honest(1)** 58:8  
**hope (2)** 6:3 39:22  
**hopefully(1)** 8:8  
**hospital(22)** 6:21 7:1,7,11  
8:1,5,7,13,23 10:25 19:24  
20:4,7,10,11 21:22 26:5  
49:18 50:1 75:24 77:18,25  
**hospitals(20)** 7:18,19 8:4  
9:9 14:12,13 19:25  
20:4,8,16 21:6,11 49:10,18  
50:6,7 55:5 57:16 75:23  
76:14  
**hosted(3)** 57:15,15,16  
**hour(2)** 8:12 86:4  
**housing(1)** 60:24  
**however(1)** 69:25  
**huge (6)** 60:7 68:6 76:7,18  
79:16 82:12  
**hurdle(1)** 19:14

I

**iacn (3)** 45:18 46:2 91:3  
**icu (15)** 3:11 5:22,22 6:16,17  
8:15 9:5,11 10:20 13:8  
21:25 24:16 26:4 38:1  
40:10  
**icus(3)** 10:25 16:24 21:22  
**id (6)** 6:11 10:2 19:2 32:12  
56:16 88:16  
**idea (1)** 13:5  
**ideal(1)** 79:7  
**ideally(1)** 11:6  
**identified(5)** 8:2 55:3 60:12  
72:19 76:8  
**identifies(1)** 73:13  
**identify (10)** 49:2 51:22  
54:19 59:15,17 62:16  
72:25 73:11 75:16 82:8  
**ignored(1)** 31:24  
**ill (8)** 25:25 29:13 53:10  
55:10 75:15 78:23 80:1  
90:4  
**illfitting (1)** 54:8  
**illness(1)** 75:18  
**im (43)** 1:4,12 9:13 18:18  
22:22 26:23,24 42:23  
43:22 46:5,21 49:12  
50:9,9,14 51:13 52:15 53:7  
54:10 59:19 65:5 66:21  
67:2,4 68:14 70:10,14  
73:16,18 77:3 78:9 79:16  
80:18 84:6 85:6  
86:3,7,22,24 87:19 88:2  
89:22,23  
**imagine(3)** 80:14 81:4,18  
**immediate (1)** 23:7  
**immediately(3)** 26:12 30:14  
83:6  
**impact (22)** 17:17 20:22  
22:18 26:4 28:2,2

37:5,6,9,10 51:25 59:18,20  
60:4,7,21 76:7 80:16,17  
83:24 84:11 88:14  
**impacted(3)** 44:22,23 53:21  
**impacts(2)** 49:1 53:11  
**implemented(1)** 73:4  
**important (1)** 81:19  
**impose(2)** 67:18,21  
**impression(2)** 12:18 81:10  
**improve(1)** 63:16  
**inadequacy(1)** 73:21  
**inadequate(8)** 50:25  
54:6,7,14 64:15 76:5  
85:11,22  
**inadequately(1)** 88:5  
**inadvertently(1)** 74:3  
**inappropriate(1)** 31:25  
**inbox(es)(1)** 58:7  
**incidents(1)** 84:17  
**include(1)** 57:25  
**including(8)** 1:24 28:1 47:10  
62:18 63:20 70:4 75:18  
82:14  
**incorrect(3)** 65:9,19,21  
**increase(3)** 16:23 25:10  
84:10  
**increased(5)** 16:17 60:5  
73:2 75:17 78:3  
**independent(1)** 55:7  
**index(1)** 91:1  
**indian(1)** 60:15  
**indicate(1)** 53:13  
**indicated(1)** 56:22  
**indicator(3)** 38:5,12,18  
**indicators(1)** 38:7  
**individual(14)** 8:18,21,22  
18:8 24:22 30:13 32:11  
33:22 38:25 39:1,6  
40:16,17 42:6  
**individuals(1)** 79:14  
**ineffective(1)** 53:16  
**inequalities(4)** 60:10  
83:5,11 88:9  
**inevitably(2)** 81:11 84:11  
**infection(10)** 5:15 11:20  
32:5,7 57:21 63:20,25  
64:4,7 72:16  
**infections(1)** 71:19  
**infectious(2)** 10:9 11:5  
**inference(1)** 65:21  
**influence(1)** 87:14  
**influencing(1)** 27:8  
**information(16)** 15:1 28:21  
29:8,9,23,25 32:23 33:7,9  
53:5,7,8 58:7,8 61:11  
63:12  
**infrastructure(1)** 82:2  
**inhouse(1)** 71:14  
**initial (4)** 6:12 21:7 28:23  
68:1  
**initially(2)** 5:13 55:22  
**injury (2)** 33:16,18  
**inpatient(1)** 77:25  
**inperson(1)** 81:22  
**inquiry(7)** 46:1,3,8 57:23  
75:8 89:10,12  
**inquirys(1)** 24:21  
**key (2)** 49:1 87:25  
**installed(1)** 14:9  
**instance(3)** 9:19 50:5 84:1  
**instead(1)** 23:16  
**insulated(1)** 20:5  
**intensity(1)** 27:16  
**intensive(46)** 1:7,24  
2:2,11,12,17,18,24,25  
3:2,6,13 4:8,10,15 5:8 7:18  
12:16 13:3 19:5,9  
22:7,14,15 23:12,14 27:2,5  
34:12 35:3,7,8 38:5,9  
40:12,13,15,19,20,23,24  
43:19 44:24,25 45:1 49:22  
**interest (2)** 12:15 47:22  
**interested(4)** 57:23 59:19  
80:18 85:18  
**interest(1)** 82:10  
**interject (1)** 64:21  
**international(2)** 16:16 18:18

**internet (1)** 29:20  
**interruption(1)** 12:13  
**into (16)** 3:25 24:4 36:14,17  
39:15 52:15 57:13 68:5,24  
73:25 74:3 22:25 77:11  
89:6 90:2  
**inverness(6)** 47:23,24,25  
48:1 56:9 71:16  
**investigate(1)** 80:13  
**investigating(1)** 80:13  
**investment(1)** 24:13  
**involve(2)** 19:15 23:9  
**involved(8)** 19:13 46:8,19  
70:2 81:1,3 84:1 86:16  
**involvement(1)** 33:25  
**ipc (3)** 64:6 67:10,11  
**ireland(2)** 46:14,17  
**irrespective(1)** 67:19  
**island(3)** 4:2 6:1,13  
**islands(2)** 5:7 6:16  
**isle (1)** 48:6  
**isnt (7)** 17:21 32:21 44:9  
47:16 57:7,23 85:3  
**isolate (1)** 36:21  
**isolating(1)** 12:3  
**isolation(3)** 11:7 13:23  
36:22  
**issues(18)** 3:17 13:23  
14:20,23 18:13,17,17  
27:12,13 42:21 43:10 49:1  
57:21 59:16 61:19 62:19  
63:14 87:7  
**its (57)** 2:13 4:23 7:15,21  
8:4,7,7,18 13:13 14:24  
16:5 19:7 20:2,11 21:18  
23:5,7 24:2 29:2 31:2  
32:21 33:4 34:13 36:4  
37:17,18 38:15 40:15  
41:8,10,15,16,17 47:2  
50:17 52:2 55:25 58:2 62:1  
63:2,14 65:2,11 66:5,8  
72:13,14 80:11 81:13,19  
82:10 85:14 87:4,5,6  
89:12,21  
**itself (3)** 22:18 61:24 67:21  
**ive (16)** 9:25 31:3 49:17  
51:10 52:14,17 64:14  
65:22 67:1 68:15 69:25  
72:23 85:4 86:12 88:4  
89:25

J

**journey(2)** 34:22 40:17  
**judgment(1)** 32:2  
**junior(3)** 5:22 47:13 88:14

K

**keen (1)** 13:12  
**keep (5)** 27:16 32:24  
74:5,9,10  
**kennedy(6)** 45:14,18,19,25  
46:2 64:23 89:17 91:3  
**kept (4)** 23:18 86:15 87:11  
89:5  
**key (2)** 49:1 87:25  
**kids(1)** 74:23  
**kind (1)** 12:20  
**kindly(2)** 37:16 44:8  
**kits (3)** 74:14 75:1,7  
**knees(1)** 78:10  
**know(64)** 6:8 12:9 13:5  
16:15 18:7 23:1 22:26 23:  
28:11 33:2,5 35:21,24 36:1  
42:12 43:8 51:7,10  
52:19,22,24 56:18 57:11  
59:3,5 60:14,17 61:11  
62:11,20 63:9 67:2 69:16  
70:20 71:1,3 72:9,18,22,24  
73:7,9,24,25 74:4  
75:1,23,24 76:2 77:23  
80:7,23 81:1 82:7  
84:7,12,25 86:10,13,15  
88:7 89:24,24 90:5  
**knowing(2)** 32:13 59:19

**knowledge(4)** 13:23  
20:22,24 72:20  
**knowledgeable(1)** 44:14  
**known(1)** 61:12

L

**labels(1)** 69:18  
**lack (18)** 33:15,15 39:9  
49:3,6,24,25 50:17 51:6  
58:3 64:3 73:14 74:13  
75:3,4,6,9,14  
**lacking(1)** 58:10  
**ladies(1)** 90:10  
**language(4)** 64:25 65:10,12  
81:21  
**large (4)** 26:17 31:9 61:13  
89:19  
**largely(2)** 76:11,12  
**larger(1)** 47:5  
**last (3)** 2:19 83:16 87:17  
**late (1)** 6:19  
**later (8)** 7:22 25:24 26:10  
40:8 55:11 62:1 78:23,23  
**lead (1)** 71:11  
**leading(1)** 70:7  
**learn (3)** 29:17 34:3 81:20  
**learning(1)** 19:14  
**least (5)** 35:16 50:23 75:23  
76:17 87:3  
**leave (1)** 26:17  
**leaving(1)** 37:6  
**led (4)** 29:23 54:21 68:23  
75:19  
**left (2)** 26:16 36:25  
**legal (1)** 71:24  
**legislation(1)** 67:17  
**less(12)** 2:13 17:18,20 19:12  
25:16 26:20 31:25  
60:24 25 62:19,21 81:16  
**lesser(1)** 15:18  
**level (28)** 4:3,3,6,9,21,22  
63:2,14 65:2,11 66:5,8  
13:16 22:22 30:14 36:12  
45:3 53:6 58:5 56:6 66:4  
67:7,13 69:5 70:1 87:13  
**levels(9)** 3:12 4:7,11 16:14  
23:14 37:5 8 60:5,6  
**life (11)** 34:19 22 36:8,18  
38:25 39:3,9,9,19,20 41:3  
**light (1)** 51:1  
**like (14)** 11:5 34:22 35:2  
40:19 44:2 55:7 56:16 62:6  
79:9 86:3 87:21,23 88:16  
89:13  
**liked (1)** 87:15  
**likely(7)** 29:1 35:17 54:6,8  
60:16,17 63:6  
**limits (1)** 20:20  
**line (2)** 59:6 87:11  
**lines(2)** 86:14,23  
**links (1)** 35:9  
**list (2)** 12:8 86:12  
**lists(3)** 77:24 78:2,3  
**little (4)** 1:12 5:17 50:9  
88:16  
**living(1)** 60:23  
**lobbied(1)** 58:10  
**local(3)** 30:17 48:17 84:24  
**location(1)** 42:15  
**loch (2)** 48:3,4  
**lockdown(1)** 50:3  
**london(2)** 46:12 70:5  
**long (30)** 8:5,11 21:17  
28:2,25  
55:10,12,15,16,19,21,23  
56:4,12,14,17,21,23  
57:1,3,6,14 60:18 65:15  
72:15,21,23,24 83:22  
88:12  
**longer(9)** 5:17 8:10 10:15  
23:1 61:15 62:11,13 78:21  
80:21  
**longterm(5)** 24:17,18 77:15  
78:12,14  
**look (6)** 8:22 12:16 14:23  
23:11 27:7 35:18

**looked(1)** 84:22  
**looking(10)** 4:13 5:5  
22:14,17,21 29:12 30:23  
45:3 48:9 80:3  
**loses(1)** 8:7  
**loss(2)** 25:8 26:1  
**lost (2)** 25:11 34:11  
**lot (32)** 3:9 10:11 12:20  
14:25 17:22 18:12 19:15  
21:6,11 25:11,11,15 26:25  
27:17 28:9,20 30:11  
33:24,24 42:20 57:14 58:7  
61:16 25 69:20,23 70:21  
74:1 80:24 81:9,20 83:1  
**lots (2)** 16:19 58:24  
**loved(1)** 36:7  
**lying(2)** 23:16,16

M

**macaskill(1)** 90:7  
**machines(4)** 21:6,12,16  
42:11  
**mailbox(1)** 58:15  
**main (5)** 19:19 27:9 39:8  
43:19 61:22  
**mainland(2)** 5:8 6:17  
**mainly(3)** 35:8 47:24 80:7  
**maintain (3)** 9:1 22:10 26:7  
**maintained(1)** 8:16  
**maintenance(1)** 89:3  
**majority (4)** 19:8 38:13 55:7  
86:16  
**making(3)** 19:15 54:16  
70:15  
**male (3)** 52:3,3,4  
**males(1)** 53:2  
**mammograms(1)** 79:16  
**man (1)** 60:1  
**manager(3)** 9:11 17:12 21:8  
**managed(2)** 23:14 78:13  
**management(4)** 32:4  
77:16,16 78:14  
**manager(1)** 50:10  
**managers(3)** 68:22 71:4,5  
**mandate (1)** 47:6  
**mandated(1)** 38:15  
**manufacturers(1)** 15:10  
**manufacturing(1)** 16:20  
**many (16)** 3:3 17:1 28:22  
32:8 42:11 43:2 44:7,7  
47:9 56:1,13 71:22 80:21  
81:12,18 82:21  
**march (8)** 1:1 50:3 55:13  
61:19 75:13 77:24 79:1  
90:15  
**markedly(1)** 60:23  
**mask (7)** 15:3,12,15  
51:14,15 52:16,20  
**masks(14)** 15:8,13,22  
49:13,13,20,21 51:10,16  
52:21 53:1 64:9,15 67:15  
**massive(2)** 60:4 77:22  
**maternity (2)** 80:16,20  
**matter (1)** 1:13  
**matters (1)** 85:20  
**maybe (7)** 13:1 53:10,17  
56:13 68:20 80:1 85:5  
**mean (7)** 8:11 18:11 33:18  
44:22 52:20 78:21 78:16  
**meaning(1)** 15:4  
**means(4)** 12:6 22:12 40:14  
82:12  
**meant (8)** 3:3 4:5 12:5 15:16  
21:25 33:1 37:3 51:8  
**measures(3)** 73:4 74:8 88:6  
**media (1)** 69:17  
**median (1)** 26:1  
**medical(48)** 1:8,10 2:3 26:3  
27:9,22 28:6,11,12,13  
29:4 46:5 23 47:14  
48:2,5,7,17,18 49:7,19  
52:1 59:4,10,12,21,23 65:2  
68:23 25 69:1,4,5 71:10,19  
72:1 73:1 75:18 80:2  
84:1,1,24 85:3,5 86:14  
87:9,10

**medicals(3)** 84:6,8 85:6  
**medicine(7)** 2:17 4:15 47:22  
55:20 66:1,3,7  
**meet (3)** 17:9 59:1 63:10  
**meeting(2)** 70:6 83:3  
**meetings(4)** 58:21  
86:9,13,16  
**member(14)** 2:7 10:12  
15:11,12 23:3 34:8  
36:11,19 39:19  
48:19,20,21,21,24  
**members(35)** 1:25,25  
2:5,15 15:24 17:5 20:25  
28:10 30:19 31:5,5 33:8,9  
36:17 43:5,9 47:3,15,15,17  
49:9 50:17,25 51:3 53:4,4  
54:4,4,18,22,25 58:2 63:4  
69:20,24  
**membership(9)** 2:3 10:1,5  
24:20 29:13 39:8 42:24  
91:2  
**membrane(1)** 42:9  
**memory(3)** 72:3 79:4,5  
**men (2)** 60:17,17  
**mental (16)** 21:3 59:18,22  
60:4 61:3,7,12,15,18  
62:1,3,7,9,10,11 88:11  
**mention (1)** 55:11  
**mentioned(10)** 9:4 13:21  
37:2,24 40:9 52:11 56:14  
73:6 87:20,21  
**met (1)** 8:15  
**method (4)** 18:25 19:6 65:7  
82:9  
**methods(1)** 17:15  
**middle (1)** 40:7  
**midwives(1)** 80:23  
**mile (24)** 5:4 6:7 7:10  
9:14,20 13:1,6,7,19  
18:7,11 21:21 22:24 25:2  
26:21,25 27:3 30:22 32:22  
56:22 56:19 78:13,20  
87:11  
**miles (5)** 1:14,15,22 45:7  
91:2  
**million (1)** 89:3  
**mind (1)** 83:7  
**minds(1)** 32:15  
**minorities(3)** 53:23 62:17,18  
**minority (6)** 52:7 53:13 54:4  
60:13 63:11 83:10  
**minutes(1)** 36:25  
**mitigate (1)** 26:6  
**mitigated (1)** 16:3  
**mitigation(1)** 73:4  
**mix (1)** 25:17  
**mixture (1)** 48:7  
**modes(1)** 82:12  
**moment (9)** 7:8 30:24 31:2  
33:6 57:9 72:13 75:8  
81:7  
**money (1)** 89:5  
**months(4)** 19:17 57:12 68:4  
79:6  
**morale(5)** 15:6 17:2 32:14  
37:6,10  
**more (78)** 8:4 10:5,14  
11:21,24,24 13:1  
14:2,9,10,11,20 15:9,25  
17:1,2,19 18:1,24  
20:8,14,15,16 21:1,5 22:19  
23:18,2

20:8 22:18 25:7,14 30:11  
 34:25 37:10 39:10 40:4  
 56:5 62:24 65:2 66:3 75:14  
 80:15 81:4  
**mothers(1)** 35:25  
**mouth(1)** 86:21  
**move(8)** 6:25 7:2,17 25:21  
 37:23 55:10 75:15 82:5  
**moved(2)** 80:7,20  
**movement(1)** 81:22  
**moving(7)** 6:13 19:24 57:19  
 59:14 63:18 71:18 85:8  
**ms(12)** 1:3,6,18,20,21,22  
 31:23 36:25 37:1 45:6 90:8  
 91:2  
**much(25)** 2:21 3:1 12:23  
 13:3,6,14 20:14,15,16 34:1  
 44:1 45:6,7 48:23 58:8  
 60:16,23 63:14 66:10  
 68:11 76:24 81:13  
 88:13,23 89:12  
**muscle(1)** 16:24  
**must(1)** 31:4  
**myself(3)** 52:4 55:8 82:14  
**mysterious(2)** 70:17,24

---

**N**

**name(2)** 46:1 66:5  
**nation(1)** 46:18  
**national(12)** 16:15 17:3  
 18:16 30:14 35:12,19  
 42:19 50:19 58:20 59:7,9  
 86:10  
**nationally(1)** 30:12  
**nations(5)** 46:13,16 48:20  
 87:11,13  
**nature(3)** 7:21,24 33:23  
**nearily(1)** 38:13  
**necessarily(3)** 19:20 40:7  
 41:2  
**necessary(1)** 66:4  
**need(16)** 6:11,25 10:4  
 17:3,6,9 21:21 22:24 34:4  
 36:15 37:16 45:3 80:11,12  
 83:10 87:25  
**needed(6)** 9:23 15:9 17:1,2  
 18:7 89:5  
**needs(1)** 25:18  
**negative(1)** 54:3  
**negotiate(1)** 47:7  
**neonatal(1)** 35:3  
**ness(2)** 48:3,4  
**neurological(1)** 56:3  
**neurosurgical(1)** 6:25  
**never(7)** 3:12,19 15:22 34:7  
 44:5 52:14,17  
**news(4)** 3:14 29:20,20,23  
**next(6)** 6:9 13:19 18:21  
 38:16 56:19 73:10  
**nhs(13)** 2:23 28:7,21 35:20  
 42:14 50:6 53:24 67:23  
 76:3 88:1,17,21,25  
**nicu(2)** 35:2,6  
**night(1)** 27:17  
**noncritical(1)** 23:24  
**nonverbal(1)** 34:10  
**nor(3)** 51:2 88:12,12  
**normal(9)** 4:11 5:18  
 17:21,25 25:20 11 22:20  
 34:15 39:25  
**normalcy(1)** 3:1  
**normally(19)** 3:4,5 4:2,22  
 11:25 18:4  
 20:2,11,12,15,17 21:17  
 24:10,11 37:14,19 78:17  
 79:23 84:23  
**northern(2)** 46:14,17  
**nothing(2)** 14:5 51:12  
**notice(1)** 76:21  
**notwithstanding(1)** 87:1  
**nuanced(1)** 65:10  
**number(10)** 11:8 17:7,10  
 26:17 31:15 51:21 58:9,11  
 67:1 87:6  
**numbers(7)** 18:8  
 22:11,16,21 23:11,19

75:25  
**numerous(1)** 53:22  
**nurse(7)** 4:12  
 22:14,17,23,25 71:17  
 76:10  
**nurses(7)** 2:6 5:5,22 25:19  
 50:10 68:21,21  
**nursing(6)** 5:4 26:2  
 27:22,23 28:12,13

---

**O**

**obvious(2)** 65:1 78:15  
**obviously(5)** 46:16 48:4  
 62:7 79:9 80:3  
**occasion(1)** 41:8  
**occasionally(2)** 15:16 39:25  
**occasion(3)** 42:2 58:9,11  
**occupational(12)** 47:22 57:5  
 64:18,20 65:25 66:2,3,6  
 72:5,6,11,12  
**occurred(1)** 36:22  
**office(1)** 46:11  
**officer(5)** 59:5,11,12 86:18  
 87:9  
**officers(1)** 87:10  
**offices(1)** 46:11  
**often(6)** 7:25 8:3 34:13  
 70:18,18 82:18  
**oh(1)** 39:13  
**okay(14)** 12:25 16:8 19:4  
 28:8 42:13,15 47:1,18 61:2  
 70:6 71:6 74:15,19 85:17  
**old(2)** 2:13,14  
**older(1)** 60:17  
**once(4)** 11:8 26:21,25 68:9  
**oneoff(1)** 85:19  
**onetoone(1)** 4:12  
**ongoing(6)** 13:9 18:12  
 25:18 29:1 61:15 78:14  
**onto(1)** 69:8  
**onus(2)** 64:6,12  
**open(1)** 86:15  
**operate(1)** 44:14  
**operating(1)** 3:9  
**operational(1)** 32:10  
**opinion(8)** 29:16 55:23  
 67:4,5,5,6 77:5 78:25  
**opinions(1)** 43:1  
**opportunity(2)** 87:22 89:9  
**opposed(3)** 12:6,10 32:12  
**options(1)** 22:9  
**order(7)** 15:9 22:5 36:14  
 40:24 41:4 44:24 45:3  
**ordinary(2)** 48:19,24  
**organ(1)** 4:25  
**organisation(5)** 10:17 46:15  
 48:6 63:13 89:11  
**organisational(12)** 45:15  
 46:4 48:9,14 59:16 69:7  
 73:12,13 81:24,25 87:17  
 89:11  
**organisation(1)** 46:23  
**organism(3)** 10:10 11:5,9  
**original(2)** 23:19 24:20  
**orthopaedic(1)** 78:9  
**others(6)** 9:3 15:25 26:5  
 52:1 61:8 69:10  
**ots(1)** 57:10  
**outbreak(1)** 50:2  
**outbreaks(1)** 3:18  
**outcome(5)** 53:7 54:18 70:8  
 73:17,18  
**outdated(1)** 69:21  
**outpatient(1)** 78:1  
**outset(1)** 65:4  
**outside(1)** 28:23  
**outwith(2)** 2:25 7:19  
**over(9)** 3:18 13:4 19:17  
 23:15 33:8 62:8 82:19  
 83:16 86:4  
**overall(1)** 42:2  
**overarching(1)** 46:15  
**overcome(1)** 55:24  
**overseas(1)** 47:10  
**overwhelmed(1)** 25:4

**own(9)** 1:23 7:7 8:19 9:11  
 24:24 43:18 71:9 76:9,19  
**oxford(1)** 83:1  
**oxygen(15)** 19:24,24,25  
 20:2,4,10,13,16,18,20  
 21:10,13,18,20,21  
**oxygenation(1)** 42:9

---

**P**

**pace(1)** 3:22  
**packages(1)** 69:18  
**paediatric(6)** 35:3,7,9  
 43:17,18,19  
**paediatrics(1)** 35:15  
**pages(1)** 87:17  
**pain(1)** 37:25  
**pan(1)** 24:6  
**pandemic(72)** 4:4,24  
 6:12,18 7:4 9:15,18  
 10:19,24 11:3,4 12:12,22  
 13:5 14:16,18,23 16:14  
 18:8 20:4 21:7 24:3,25  
 25:7,22 27:25 28:15,24  
 35:12,14,18 37:7 38:20  
 40:3 42:18 43:6 44:4 48:17  
 50:23 53:11 57:13,17  
 59:20 60:3 61:8,24 62:2,16  
 63:4 65:5 69:16 73:22  
 75:16 76:6,6,24 77:3,7,23  
 78:25 79:24 81:11 83:23  
 84:7,8,14 85:18 86:2,19  
 87:7 89:3,7  
**panuk(2)** 47:16 87:13  
**paper(1)** 49:13  
**papers(3)** 66:14 67:1 75:21  
**paradoxically(1)** 60:18  
**paragraph(44)** 2:22 4:1 12:2  
 13:21 15:2 16:13 18:21  
 24:14 26:1 27:21 29:6  
 30:1,24 31:4 33:14 36:5  
 37:2,24 48:25 49:2 51:22  
 53:9 55:10,11 57:19  
 59:14,15 62:16  
 63:18,18,21 67:9,16 69:8  
 71:18,20 72:3,25 75:15  
 79:19 81:24 83:18 85:8  
 86:1  
**paragraphs(1)** 48:10  
**parent(1)** 35:16  
**parents(4)** 35:4,16,21 84:12  
**parking(1)** 45:1  
**part(7)** 33:21,22,23 42:3  
 44:18 47:25 69:16  
**participate(1)** 89:13  
**participating(1)** 89:9  
**particular(17)** 15:12 32:7  
 42:7 47:20 51:25 52:5  
 57:23 61:4,6 71:1  
 75:6,7,10 80:4 82:4,8  
 85:19  
**particularly(16)** 10:19 41:3  
 49:4 52:8 60:25 69:17  
 83:4,5,8 86:5 88:2  
**partitions(2)** 13:22 14:8  
**partner(1)** 55:9  
**parts(5)** 14:20,21 21:22  
 44:7 56:1  
**past(2)** 62:6 86:4  
**pathways(1)** 88:8  
**patient(67)** 4:13,18,20  
 5:6,16,19,25 6:4 7:24  
 8:2,25 9:1,7,11,14,16,20  
 10:9,13 11:4,24 13:13 15:7  
 16:3 19:20 20:22 22:14  
 23:13 32:4 33:20,21,25  
 34:3,9,14,23 23:36:18  
 39:18,21 40:11,20,21,23  
 41:1,1,2,4,5,6,12,24 42:2  
 43:13,15 44:22 23 45:2,4,5  
 51:12 56:16 78:19 80:12  
 82:18 83:12 88:23  
**patients(82)** 4:25 5:8  
 6:16,20 7:2,6,17 8:12  
 11:9,11,14,18 12:17  
 14:12,13 17:7,10 21:11,21

22:21 23:11,14,18 29:24  
 33:16 19 34:4,18,19  
 36:10,16 38:1,25  
 39:1,3,5,12,13,20  
 40:13,15,17,22  
 41:9,17,18,20,21 42:5,7  
 44:25 47:24 48:2,4 53:12  
 56:11,17 57:1,3 60:2,3  
 61:12,22,25 62:5,13 74:7,9  
 75:5 76:11 77:6,6,11 78:8  
 80:4 81:6,9 82:4,17,24  
 88:4,22  
**paused(3)** 3:7 12:21,24  
**peeled(1)** 69:19  
**pension(1)** 27:13  
**people(76)** 2:4 3:5,16 6:13  
 8:22 12:22 13:12 14:14  
 15:25 16:5,5 17:15,22,22  
 19:18 20:19 22:19  
 23:17,20 24:23 25:3,5,23  
 26:9,19 28:4,5,17 29:3,22  
 32:9,15,24 36:3  
 37:15,20,23 40:4 43:11  
 44:4 51:25 52:15 54:17  
 55:14,15 59:20,23,25  
 61:5,6,14 62:2 65:22 71:13  
 73:11 74:5,12,24 76:8,21  
 77:5,24 78:3,20 79:3  
 81:10,12,16,18,19 82:6,8  
 83:6,8 84:22 88:10  
**peoples(5)** 3:21 16:25 32:15  
 37:6 78:10  
**per(4)** 4:12 5:6 22:14 24:22  
**perception(1)** 54:13  
**perfect(1)** 23:5  
**performed(5)**  
 10:20,20,24,25 11:11  
**perhaps(13)** 9:6 17:9 26:20  
 27:14 32:19 37:8 43:5  
 77:10,15,17 78:24 82:4,6  
**period(12)** 23:8 33:8 36:22  
 55:13 75:8,10,11,13 78:25  
 79:2 85:18 90:2  
**periodically(1)** 24:1  
**periods(1)** 13:14  
**persists(1)** 65:16  
**person(4)** 8:25 22:23 23:1  
 39:20  
**personal(1)** 36:12  
**pharmacists(3)** 2:6 4:16  
 68:21  
**pharmacy(1)** 17:5  
**phase(1)** 89:6  
**phone(1)** 83:15  
**physically(1)** 27:17  
**physicians(1)** 66:2  
**physio(1)** 57:10  
**physiotherapist(3)** 2:7 4:17  
 57:4  
**pick(1)** 80:11  
**pictures(1)** 69:17  
**picu(1)** 35:2  
**piece(1)** 39:7  
**pipeline(1)** 20:7  
**place(10)** 9:5 10:12 13:4,25  
 14:14 15:14 19:17  
 58:18,19 88:7  
**placed(4)** 7:9 11:7,9 12:8  
**placement(2)** 11:17 32:4  
**placements(1)** 84:3  
**places(3)** 3:4,8 71:9  
**planned(5)** 3:9,19 5:20 12:6  
 77:18  
**planning(4)** 11:21 27:10  
 42:20,23  
**plannings(1)** 39:5  
**plans(6)** 3:13,16,17,21 27:8  
 44:18  
**plants(1)** 16:21  
**please(10)** 1:19,22 4:5 6:15  
 13:20 24:17 28:1 40:9 46:1  
 75:15  
**pm(1)** 90:13  
**pointbypoint(1)** 53:17  
**pointed(1)** 17:5  
**points(4)** 11:2 14:18 45:2

63:24  
**policies(1)** 38:21  
**policy(7)** 30:12 37:24  
 38:8,12,14,15,19  
**poor(1)** 71:6  
**population(4)** 29:11 60:22  
 72:2 78:10  
**populations(1)** 60:4  
**posed(2)** 31:10,14  
**position(5)** 66:20,20 79:21  
 88:2 89:1  
**positions(1)** 48:10  
**positive(3)** 3:15 68:2 75:5  
**possibly(2)** 38:23 44:6  
**potential(3)** 10:4 18:19 56:13  
**posts(1)** 75:24  
**potential(2)** 3:17 84:2  
**potentially(6)** 5:3 15:18  
 23:23 38:18 41:25 74:6  
**ppe(44)** 32:8 36:15  
 49:3,6,9,24  
 50:4,7,9,12,17,25  
 51:9,23,24 52:7,10  
 53:14,20 54:1 63:21 65:9  
 66:1 67:20  
 69:7,9,11,13,18,21  
 70:3,5,10,16,17,18,19  
 71:1,6,8,10,17,18  
**practical(2)** 43:8 74:22  
**practice(25)** 17:21 18:1,4  
 34:15 38:24 47:12,25  
 48:2,5 49:10,25 50:10  
 57:16 58:17 67:20 70:24  
 71:2,5,11 76:10 77:17  
 79:20 80:13,20 85:4  
**practices(9)** 47:23 48:8  
 50:12 55:6 76:19,20  
 80:18,19 82:2  
**practise(1)** 56:9  
**practising(3)** 56:8,10 83:22  
**practitioner(2)** 47:21 84:25  
**practitioners(1)** 78:8  
**predecessor(5)** 50:18 51:2  
 58:20 59:11 86:15  
**predict(1)** 13:14  
**predominantly(3)** 53:1  
 58:19 68:20  
**preferable(5)** 18:25 19:2  
 30:7 32:2 42:17  
**preferential(1)** 23:10  
**pregnancy(1)** 80:22  
**pregnant(1)** 80:21  
**premature(1)** 69:12  
**prepanidemic(6)** 6:18 9:4  
 37:5 63:3 75:22 78:21  
**preparation(1)** 48:13  
**prepare(2)** 12:4 23:23  
**prepared(2)** 12:9 89:19  
**preparing(2)** 24:20 89:10  
**presence(3)** 33:24 34:6 39:9  
**present(6)** 6:6 34:8 35:17  
 39:16,17,20  
**presentation(1)** 83:2  
**presented(1)** 36:6  
**presenting(2)** 61:25 81:16  
**presently(1)** 48:12  
**preserve(1)** 21:20  
**press(1)** 61:9  
**pressure(1)** 7:11,12 8:8,9  
 11:21 14:17,17 16:25  
 17:18 32:15 76:18  
**pressure(1)** 37:3  
**presumably(4)** 5:21 11:21  
 26:3 43:10  
**prevent(1)** 18:5  
**prevented(1)** 27:3  
**preventing(2)** 51:11,13  
**previous(2)** 26:11 69:19  
**primary(5)** 49:8 50:4  
 68:19 22 71:4  
**principally(1)** 83:21  
**prior(6)** 7:15 9:14 15:23  
 61:19 77:2,23  
**prioritise(2)** 12:22 21:15  
**probably(11)** 10:2 17:24  
 19:2 23:10 25:22 27:10

42:22 49:21 58:8 73:15  
 86:16  
**problem(6)** 17:12 18:19  
 51:5 65:24 86:17 88:17  
**problematic(4)** 16:14,20  
 24:12 42:16  
**problems(4)** 61:15 62:1,4  
 63:2  
**procedure(1)** 11:6  
**procedures(6)** 10:18,22,23  
 11:10 12:4 49:23  
**proceedings(1)** 46:20  
**process(1)** 10:15  
**procured(2)** 50:4,9  
**procuring(1)** 50:12  
**produce(1)** 58:11  
**produced(2)** 5:11 76:2  
**producing(1)** 85:21  
**profession(7)** 29:4,5 31:20  
 49:7 59:21,24 65:2  
**professional(7)** 2:2 44:8  
 47:2,5 67:5,6,24  
**professional(11)** 1:25 2:4  
 4:16 6:5 25:21 27:23 28:6  
 77:2 79:11 80:9 82:22  
**profession(1)** 2:5  
**programme(1)** 11:11  
**progress(1)** 13:12  
**progressed(1)** 62:2  
**projects(1)** 89:5  
**proliferation(2)** 29:7,18  
**promise(1)** 78:1  
**promote(2)** 2:11,14  
**prompted(1)** 25:22  
**proper(3)** 64:8,13 77:12  
**properly(2)** 51:23,24  
**protect(2)** 88:12,13  
**protected(2)** 64:18 88:6  
**protecting(2)** 51:17 64:15  
**protection(5)** 36:13 49:11  
 64:5,7 70:20  
**protections(1)** 71:22  
**protective(5)** 49:15,24 51:9  
 64:9,13  
**provide(10)** 4:3,17 5:18,24  
 6:3 15:21 17:23 37:19  
 45:25 64:12  
**provided(15)** 4:3,14 5:12  
 9:17,24 26:4 42:10 43:4,6  
 46:3 64:17 67:2,3 74:23  
 75:2  
**provides(1)** 20:7  
**providing(9)** 12:20 15:21  
 23:7 37:18,18 57:20  
 66:13,15,23  
**provision(5)** 3:2 6:1 25:18  
 54:16 65:9  
**psychiatrist(1)** 61:17  
**psychological(3)** 40:6 56:3  
 60:6  
**public(7)** 7:10 10:12 49:14  
 65:25 66:2,7 82:11  
**publication(1)** 85:19  
**published(3)** 38:10 85:9,17  
**pull(1)** 24:23  
**pulled(1)** 68:2  
**pulmonary(1)** 41:25  
**pushed(1)** 82:20  
**puts(1)** 7:12  
**putting(2)** 67:19 77:4

---

**Q**

**q(158)** 2:21 3:11 4:1 5:7,21  
 6:5,15 7:10,14 8:10,14  
 9:3,14 10:3,6,17  
 11:16,21 23 12:2 12:25  
 13:19 14:11 15:2,20  
 16:2,8,11,13 17:12,17  
 18:5,15,21 19:4,19,22,24  
 20:22 21:3,15,23 22:22  
 23:3,6,21 24:14 25:24  
 27:2,19 28:8 29:6  
 30:1,9,16 32:14,19 33:14  
 35:2,21 34 36:5 37:24  
 38:20 39:12,15,23 40:9

41:10,19 42:8,13,15  
 43:10,17,21 44:1,21  
 46:3,19,22 47:18 48:9,25  
 50:2,14 51:1,4,19,22  
 52:11,19,24 53:9 54:12,23  
 55:1,10,22 56:7,11,19  
 57:11,19 58:2,3  
 59:3,14,25 60:8 61:2,18  
 62:7,15 63:7,18 66:18  
 67:5,9,15 68:13,18 69:3,7  
 70:9,25 71:6,18  
 72:7,12,14,18,25 73:10,20  
 74:15,19,22 75:1,6,15 77:1  
 78:3,15,23 79:18 80:16,25  
 81:8,22 83:16 84:18  
 85:8,17,25 86:21 87:17  
**quality(6)** 37:4 38:5,7,12,17  
 70:19  
**quantity(1)** 25:1  
**queries(1)** 30:17  
**question(22)** 6:10,11 9:25  
 13:2,19 14:24 16:4 24:19  
 31:9,11,12,13 36:2 38:4  
 43:1 54:12 56:20 61:9  
 66:12 72:18 73:10 78:15  
**questionable(1)** 29:19  
**questions(14)** 1:21 12:25  
 24:21 30:25 35:7,10 45:24  
 69:9 74:15 83:20 85:25  
 89:14 91:2,3  
**quickly(1)** 82:15  
**quite(25)** 8:5 11:18 13:14  
 14:24,25 15:20 17:17  
 18:12,12 19:14,18 24:21  
 27:10,17 47:4 57:12,14,17  
 64:24 70:21 80:11 82:10  
 83:14 87:4,5

---

**R**

**race(1)** 63:10  
**raise(6)** 13:7 54:2  
 62:19,21,23 64:8  
**raised(4)** 16:6

recovered(1) 62:14  
 recovery(3) 62:13 88:25  
 89:6  
 recruit(1) 25:13  
 recruiting(3) 26:8 77:4,7  
 recruitment(1) 26:24  
 redacted(1) 82:25  
 redate(1) 70:7  
 redeploy(1) 22:4  
 redeployment(4) 21:24 24:15  
 61:17 76:22  
 redeployment(1) 22:3  
 reduce(1) 5:10  
 reduction(1) 70:18  
 refer(3) 4:22 27:12 42:22  
 reference(1) 45:15  
 referred(3) 26:10 51:7,10  
 referring(4) 2:24 29:9 32:3  
 43:16  
 refers(2) 4:9,18  
 reflect(1) 67:10  
 refreshed(1) 24:1  
 refused(1) 63:22  
 regard(1) 78:19  
 regarded(3) 32:1 46:18  
 55:25  
 regards(1) 36:7  
 regional(2) 70:9,14  
 regionally(1) 70:13  
 regular(9) 50:21,24 59:13  
 65:5 73:14 74:20 86:3,9,13  
 regularly(4) 52:6 53:4 73:23  
 85:21  
 rehabilitation(2) 57:3,10  
 relation(10) 26:1,2 31:19  
 50:17 55:23 63:19 65:7  
 73:1 84:2 86:6  
 relationship(2) 86:10,14  
 relationships(3) 58:22 84:13  
 86:20  
 relative(1) 49:25  
 relatively(2) 2:12 51:16  
 relaxants(1) 16:24  
 released(1) 24:8  
 relevant(1) 59:16  
 relieve(1) 8:8  
 reluctance(1) 68:6  
 remain(1) 11:15  
 remaining(1) 76:18  
 remains(2) 64:5 89:17  
 remember(8) 57:12,13,18  
 69:16 83:12 84:14 85:5  
 89:1  
 remote(9) 3:8 8:4 61:1  
 81:22 82:5,10,12,24 83:4  
 remotely(2) 61:23 81:18  
 removed(1) 76:12  
 renal(3) 18:22 19:6,7  
 reorganisation(1) 7:20  
 repeatedly(2) 64:14 74:18  
 replace(3) 25:12 26:9,12  
 replaced(1) 15:18  
 replacement(2) 18:22 19:6  
 replied(1) 31:5  
 report(2) 54:8 71:23  
 reported(5) 26:1 28:10 52:6  
 56:6 68:24  
 reporting(4) 25:15 30:25  
 71:19 72:14  
 represent(3) 2:10,15 47:9  
 representation(2) 50:24  
 70:15  
 representation(1) 51:1  
 representative(1) 83:3  
 representatives(1) 65:1  
 represents(1) 47:11  
 request(1) 64:8  
 require(6) 12:1 14:13,25  
 24:13 57:9 74:23  
 required(19) 2:16 3:20,23  
 5:2,2,3 6:22,23 7:18  
 11:24 15:15 22:1 36:8,12  
 44:13 67:22 71:1 78:17  
 requirement(4) 8:14 16:17  
 43:15 71:24  
 requires(4) 9:16 24:6 27:18

89:12  
 requiring(1) 40:11  
 research(1) 83:1  
 researcher(1) 82:25  
 reservations(1) 31:19  
 reserved(2) 49:21 75:4  
 resident(1) 47:14  
 resource(3) 24:6,7,8  
 resourced(1) 20:15  
 resources(4) 19:22 42:17  
 79:13 89:6  
 respect(3) 73:20 84:20 86:9  
 respects(1) 54:15  
 respiratory(8) 5:1 23:15  
 49:15,24 51:9 56:2 64:8,13  
 responding(1) 29:15  
 responded(4) 24:21 31:8  
 37:10 38:4  
 response(2) 29:12 37:22  
 responsibilities(1) 8:15  
 responsibility(3) 55:1,5 71:7  
 result(4) 25:11 61:8 72:15  
 73:8  
 resuscitate(3) 40:24 41:4,13  
 resuscitation(2) 41:6,25  
 retained(1) 28:13  
 retention(1) 27:8  
 retiral(1) 27:8  
 retired(3) 47:14,15,16  
 retrospectively(1) 77:10  
 reversible(1) 41:20  
 riddor(2) 71:23 72:5  
 risen(1) 78:1  
 risk(16) 11:20 49:3 53:15  
 54:5,7,13,15,19,20,23 55:2  
 62:25 71:21 72:25 73:2,3  
 riskasses(1) 64:12  
 risks(1) 55:3  
 risky(1) 10:19  
 riverside(2) 47:23 48:6  
 role(8) 24:4 39:15 56:7,24  
 57:1,7 70:7 82:24  
 room(2) 11:7 52:16  
 root(1) 80:6  
 rostering(2) 15:22 16:2  
 round(2) 16:1 51:14  
 routine(2) 18:4 19:10  
 royal(1) 46:24  
 run(6) 7:2 21:9,12,16,18  
 28:17  
 running(1) 21:19  
 rural(2) 48:5,7

S

sadly(3) 36:18 40:22 41:21  
 safeguard(1) 88:11  
 safeguarding(6) 83:24  
 84:5,9,15,17 88:10  
 safety(5) 55:4 64:11 66:6  
 67:17 88:23  
 same(11) 11:9,12 17:7  
 26:17 34:10,20 38:16  
 62:9,10 63:24 74:7  
 sat(1) 58:15  
 satisfaction(2) 51:2 87:3  
 saw(3) 68:7 70:18 81:16  
 saying(8) 41:16 56:16 63:23  
 66:19,22,25 86:23,24  
 scepticism(2) 55:23,24  
 sciences(1) 29:19  
 scientific(1) 66:14  
 sciwt042400001(1) 45:16  
 scope(1) 18:19  
 scotland(44) 2:11 7:16,22  
 14:20 17:4 25:15  
 28:7,13,22 35:10,20 38:14  
 46:5,11,14,16,17  
 47:1,11,19 50:18,20,21  
 53:25 57:24 58:23 60:10  
 63:9 65:3 68:10,11 70:13  
 73:14 75:25 76:24 77:25  
 80:21 87:3,8,12,14  
 88:17,21,25  
 scotlands(1) 87:18  
 scottish(40) 1:7,24 2:2,8,9  
 12:16 27:2,5,5 31:7

38:5,6,9 44:18 47:16  
 48:11,15,19 51:19 53:6  
 57:25 58:3,5,16,24 59:4,8  
 63:10 66:15,23 67:12,14  
 74:16 85:13,15 86:2,5,8  
 87:2,8  
 screening(8) 78:23,24  
 79:3,4,8,9,12,15  
 screenings(2) 79:23 80:2  
 second(1) 19:1  
 secondary(3) 49:8 50:5  
 61:23  
 secretary(1) 67:25  
 sector(1) 50:1  
 sectors(1) 49:7  
 secured(2) 50:6,6  
 sedative(1) 16:24  
 see(14) 25:8 31:15 37:9,21  
 57:4 61:25 69:12 76:10  
 80:12,21 81:9,19 82:18  
 88:4  
 seeing(3) 25:16 62:13 69:17  
 seeking(1) 72:16  
 seem(1) 64:25  
 seen(9) 3:12,18 52:17 61:23  
 68:15 72:23 77:7 81:15  
 86:12  
 selfappointed(1) 29:18  
 send(2) 8:12,24  
 sending(2) 7:25 8:7  
 senior(3) 70:1 71:17 74:16  
 sense(1) 65:2  
 sent(3) 8:16 27:14 28:23  
 separate(4) 33:22 39:7 43:1  
 77:19  
 separating(1) 11:24  
 servant(1) 59:5  
 servants(1) 59:8  
 service(7) 2:23 42:10,19  
 44:7 57:9 61:16 62:5  
 services(14) 2:24,25 3:8  
 44:5 57:3,14 61:13,20 68:3  
 75:19 80:16,20 81:8,17  
 set(4) 15:16 22:6 82:17,17  
 sets(1) 15:19  
 setting(3) 9:7,8 40:10  
 settings(4) 63:20 72:4  
 74:9,11  
 severe(1) 23:14  
 share(1) 63:11  
 shielding(3) 10:20,21 11:10,11  
 29:10 53:5,6 71:13  
 sharing(2) 29:8 53:8  
 shielding(3) 57:22 61:5 63:1  
 shift(3) 4:12 5:6 22:15  
 short(3) 45:10 65:6 76:21  
 shortage(4) 16:16 18:22  
 70:12 76:4  
 shortages(4) 18:13 75:17,22  
 76:4  
 shortcoming(2) 63:19 82:1  
 shorter(1) 90:2  
 should(19) 11:6 13:4 14:1  
 36:23 38:2,8,16 39:1,4,4  
 43:3,4,4 49:21  
 64:10,10,16,19 79:12  
 showed(2) 69:19 83:3  
 shut(3) 3:9,9 16:21  
 siblings(1) 35:5  
 sic(2) 30:24 82:22  
 sick(2) 23:12 79:14  
 sickness(2) 72:19,23  
 side(1) 40:2  
 significant(9) 16:23 19:14  
 26:4 31:15 49:9 59:17,20  
 63:19 73:19  
 significantly(2) 2:23 60:6  
 silver(4) 68:15,24 69:3,4  
 similar(3) 64:9,17 80:15  
 similarity(2) 35:4 76:13  
 simple(1) 49:11  
 since(3) 27:14 67:2 76:25  
 single(3) 5:2 11:7 87:11  
 sit(2) 46:22,24  
 site(1) 6:3  
 sits(1) 20:6

sitting(1) 67:23  
 situation(7) 6:15 15:23  
 16:11 24:2 32:10 33:12  
 39:24  
 six(4) 23:17 47:11 79:6  
 86:12  
 size(1) 17:9  
 skill(3) 15:16,19 25:17  
 slightly(4) 8:4 11:3 30:23  
 89:22  
 small(1) 47:9  
 smaller(2) 47:25 60:24  
 so-called(1) 49:22  
 social(4) 33:23 69:17 73:6  
 84:18  
 society(20) 1:8,24  
 2:1,2,3,10 4:9 8:21 12:16  
 27:3,5 31:11 35:9 36:3  
 38:4,6,9 44:16 60:8 61:6  
 sole(1) 53:19  
 solely(1) 17:8  
 solution(4) 8:19,24 23:5,6  
 solutions(1) 16:1  
 solve(1) 18:19  
 somebody(7) 40:1 52:16  
 58:14 61:19,21 76:15 87:1  
 somebody(1) 40:1  
 somehow(1) 9:23  
 someone(5) 7:24 23:8  
 52:13,19 61:18  
 something(16) 20:24,25  
 23:21,22 30:23 32:1,16  
 41:11 54:19 61:9 63:7  
 65:17 83:25 84:3 85:1,2  
 sometimes(14) 11:17 12:17  
 13:17 15:24 23:13 26:13  
 30:3 32:21 36:6 40:1,1  
 42:1 70:20 78:18  
 somewhat(1) 70:16  
 somewhere(1) 20:6  
 soon(2) 13:25 47:13  
 sort(7) 39:23 51:8 60:19  
 69:4,15 83:8,13  
 sought(1) 48:12  
 source(3) 15:9 74:8 88:7  
 southeast(2) 60:15 62:24  
 space(1) 17:19  
 spaces(1) 11:23  
 spare(1) 8:2  
 speak(3) 63:5 87:2 88:23  
 speaking(9) 26:23 35:16  
 47:19 49:17 53:15,24  
 83:15 86:18 88:19  
 special(1) 47:21  
 specialism(1) 47:20  
 specialist(5) 6:22,24,25  
 9:5,16  
 specialist(1) 47:13  
 speciality(1) 31:3  
 speciality(2) 2:11,12  
 specific(8) 54:16  
 55:16,18,20 56:22,23  
 66:17,18  
 specifically(4) 16:5 24:19  
 64:8 84:15  
 specified(1) 31:13  
 speculate(1) 50:15  
 speed(1) 33:11  
 spend(1) 36:1  
 spent(1) 34:2  
 split(1) 23:4  
 spoken(4) 62:15 63:15  
 65:22 88:13  
 spread(3) 5:10 14:21 24:22  
 spreaders(1) 74:1  
 spreading(1) 5:16  
 springs(1) 83:7  
 stabilisation(2) 5:25 6:3  
 staff(102) 3:5 4:19,20 5:21  
 7:12 8:2,7,14,16,25 9:8,21  
 15:3,6,11,12,16,18 17:17  
 19:16 21:23  
 22:4,6,10,11,11,16,20,21  
 23:3,9,11,19,24  
 24:7,10,15  
 25:8,9,12,13,16

26:2,3,8,8,10,12,15,16,17  
 27:9,16,19 23:30:2,3,17,25  
 32:14 33:7,9,17,19,20  
 34:6,18,21,25 36:14  
 37:3,5,9,10,15  
 39:12,14,19,21,40:25  
 44:12,14,14,20 45:2,3  
 47:12 53:12 71:20,23  
 72:15 73:2 75:2,17,18,22  
 76:4,23 77:8,14,20  
 staffing(7) 4:11,21 6:7 7:19  
 19:22 37:2 89:2  
 staffs(1) 34:2  
 stage(1) 6:9  
 stages(3) 24:6 79:24 81:2  
 standard(3) 28:16 37:19  
 67:21  
 standards(1) 70:6  
 stark(1) 36:6  
 start(14) 1:19,22 2:22 40:25  
 41:6 43:15 50:22 70:22  
 71:18 73:21 81:3 82:14  
 86:19 90:7  
 started(5) 20:20 25:8 76:3  
 88:1 89:2  
 starting(4) 89:23,25 90:3,10  
 statement(21) 38:3 45:15  
 46:4 48:9,14,25 49:2 51:22  
 53:9 59:17 69:7 73:12,13  
 75:16 79:18 81:24,25  
 83:18 87:18 89:11,19  
 stay(1) 35:4  
 stayed(2) 62:4 81:10  
 staying(1) 78:11  
 step(2) 24:4 39:15  
 stepping(1) 26:5  
 stick(1) 17:25  
 still(9) 42:3,22 56:7,10 64:6  
 72:10 88:18,20,20  
 stockpiles(1) 70:3  
 stockpiling(1) 18:9  
 stood(1) 28:9  
 stopped(6) 61:14 79:4,10,13  
 81:4 84:8  
 strain(1) 21:3  
 strathnaim(1) 48:3  
 streams(1) 32:6  
 street(1) 59:25  
 strength(1) 65:12  
 stress(3) 25:3 34:5,13  
 stretching(1) 22:20  
 strikes(1) 86:21  
 strong(2) 64:25 65:10  
 structure(2) 33:23 68:5  
 structures(1) 50:13  
 stuck(1) 69:18  
 students(8) 27:22,22  
 28:5,11,12,12,14 47:14  
 stuff(2) 17:19,20  
 subcommittee(1) 67:25  
 subcontinent(1) 60:15  
 substitute(4) 17:13,14,15  
 18:2  
 substitutes(1) 18:3  
 substitution(1) 17:16  
 successful(1) 42:1  
 sudden(1) 27:4  
 suddenly(2) 70:23,23  
 suffered(4) 24:16 56:11  
 84:13 88:15  
 suffering(4) 55:11,15 56:12  
 78:5  
 sufficient(2) 6:6 42:17  
 suitability(1) 70:10  
 suitable(1) 51:23  
 suitably(1) 52:9  
 suited(1) 13:20  
 supplied(1) 51:9  
 supplier(1) 70:25  
 supplies(5) 15:8 20:13  
 21:14,20 70:22  
 supply(9) 16:13,22  
 20:7,10,20 21:10,12 70:16  
 75:4  
 support(14) 3:23 4:24  
 5:2,25 16:25 17:24 22:1,23

23:1,4,9 34:4,14 40:6  
 supported(1) 66:24  
 supporting(1) 4:16  
 supportive(2) 86:3,9  
 suppose(10) 6:19 12:7 13:2  
 22:22 24:23 30:12 74:15  
 79:20 82:1 83:20  
 supposed(2) 28:25 33:6  
 supposing(1) 32:12  
 sure(19) 1:5 9:13 10:3,6  
 18:18 26:24 32:14  
 33:10,11 36:5 46:21 53:7  
 67:2,4 68:14 71:11 79:16  
 84:7 85:7  
 surgeries(2) 12:12 13:4  
 surgery(19)  
 12:4,5,6,7,8,9,10,14,17,18,20,22  
 13:8,12 78:20,20,22  
 surgical(7) 12:3 49:13,19,20  
 51:10,16,64:15  
 surprised(1) 49:17  
 survey(2) 27:6,15  
 surveyed(2) 53:3,4  
 surveys(2) 53:13,22  
 survive(3) 40:20,21,22  
 suspended(3) 28:18,18,19  
 switch(3) 19:13,15,18  
 symptoms(10) 37:25  
 55:17,19 56:3,4,6,25 75:5  
 80:4,6  
 syndrome(2) 55:25 56:5  
 system(4) 5:2 17:4 56:2,2  
 systems(2) 4:25 77:19

T

tablet(1) 55:20  
 tailored(2) 38:22 39:1  
 taken(5) 1:12 9:4 19:25  
 52:21 54:21  
 takes(12) 8:3,6 10:11,15  
 17:18 23:17 24:7,8 25:14  
 26:15,18 33:7  
 taking(6) 1:9 7:25 24:9 26:5  
 65:25 74:3  
 talk(8) 52:11 34:8 67:16  
 68:13,14 71:25 79:19  
 82:10  
 talked(1) 24:5  
 talking(8) 20:25 22:13  
 49:12 62:12 72:1,1,4 85:11  
 tank(3) 20:5,6,17  
 tanks(2) 20:8,9  
 taught(1) 71:10  
 teams(2) 30:18 58:21  
 technique(1) 19:13  
 telephone(6) 34:9,16  
 80:8,9,24 82:13  
 telling(3) 1:23 53:1 65:10  
 temporary(3) 13:21 14:6,8  
 ten(1) 60:13  
 tended(1) 60:18  
 tends(1) 57:10  
 tents(2) 13:22 14:6  
 term(3) 8:10,11 21:18  
 terms(26) 5:11 12:16 18:5  
 44:21 47:7 48:23  
 49:4,12,24 50:16 51:13,17  
 60:21 63:25 74:7,22 76:23  
 77:1 78:24 79:22 80:13  
 83:23 84:9,22 89:1,2  
 test(7) 52:14 54:8 55:16,18  
 56:22 70:5 74:24  
 tested(3) 69:11 73:22,23  
 testing(20) 52:7,11,12,13,20  
 69:13 73:14,18,21  
 74:12,13,20,23 75:1,7,9,14  
 77:12 80:2 81:2  
 tests(5) 80:1,2,3,6,14  
 thank(52) 1:13,20 2:21 3:11  
 4:1 6:5,15 10:17 12:2  
 13:19 15:2 16:13 18:21  
 21:23 23:21 24:14 27:2  
 29:6 30:1 31:22,23 33:14  
 36:5 37:1 40:9 42:8,15

44:1 45:6,7,8,17,23 46:3  
 47:18 48:9 55:1 57:19  
 59:14 66:10,12 84:18 85:8  
 89:8,9,16,17,18,19,20  
 90:11,12  
 thats(30) 9:17,25,25 10:9  
 12:15 16:4 18:11,18 23:10  
 31:14 34:21 37:17 38:3,17  
 41:2,10 48:4,15 54:25  
 62:10 67:13 74:24 75:13  
 78:7 80:22 84:25 85:2  
 88:22 90:4,9  
 themes(1) 10:25  
 theme(1) 53:25  
 therapies(1) 32:5  
 therapists(1) 57:5  
 therapy(2) 18:23 19:6  
 thereafter(3) 50:24 54:21  
 90:8  
 therefore(9) 7:23,25 16:18  
 25:2 26:18 64:4 73:24 74:5  
 89:21  
 theres(32) 4:15 10:10 13:15  
 18:12 23:7 25:9  
 26:11,12,17 32:20 33:24  
 39:2 41:11 44:15 53:25  
 55:18,18,19,20 56:4,22,23  
 60:2,22 64:6 69:4 71:9  
 81:2,25 87:20,22,23  
 theyre(11) 15:21 18:3  
 19:8,12 23:16 24:1,11  
 27:18 46:8 62:3 85:6  
 theyve(2) 17:23 56:14  
 thing(2) 42:8 87:25  
 thinking(4) 20:20 22:22  
 78:9 88:2  
 thinks(1) 82:11  
 though(1) 13:2  
 thought(5) 5:16 13:7 27:18  
 43:5 90:9  
 thoughts(2) 30:6,8  
 three(3) 22:17 76:20 87:13  
 through(22) 11:3 12:22  
 14:15,19,22 16:2,22 17:6  
 25:4 35:14,18 50:12 51:15  
 54:24 55:2 57:10 58:14,20  
 59:15 71:4 84:24 88:7  
 throughout(10) 10:24 12:12  
 16:14,18 17:4 35:11 79:2  
 85:17 86:2 87:7  
 thursday(1) 1:1  
 tickbox(1) 54:22  
 time(37) 5:13 6:20 8:3,6,24  
 14:4 15:14 17:11 25:14  
 26:15,18,18 33:6,7,9  
 34:2,4,13 37:16 38:21  
 42:18,21 48:16 50:2,19  
 57:6 62:8 65:15 67:3,24  
 69:23,24 75:10 76:6,15,21  
 83:14  
 timeconsuming(1) 82:16  
 times(8) 17:18 23:25 25:4  
 40:5 44:17 51:21 58:13  
 70:21  
 timetable(1) 89:23  
 today(4) 47:18 65:13  
 87:20,24  
 together(1) 68:2  
 told(5) 54:18,25 62:22  
 63:23 89:24  
 tomorrow(4) 89:22,25  
 90:2,10  
 too(2) 49:15 58:8  
 took(4) 5:17 14:4 58:18,19  
 topic(2) 55:10 85:20  
 touch(1) 83:18  
 touched(2) 18:17 27:19  
 touches(1) 39:3  
 towards(1) 83:21  
 track(1) 35:19  
 trade(1) 47:1  
 traditionally(1) 5:5  
 train(2) 24:7 71:7  
 trained(4) 4:12 24:8,10  
 71:16  
 trainees(1) 28:22

**trainers(1)** 24:9  
**training(20)** 2:6 19:16,22  
 21:23 22:2,22 23:7,25  
 27:19,22,24  
 28:18,22,23,25,29:3  
 71:6,14 88:13,14  
**transfer(9)** 5:8,19 7:10,17  
 8:3 9:4,11,15 43:12  
**transferred(5)** 6:1,4,17,20  
 7:6  
**transferring(4)** 7:11  
 14:12,13 43:11  
**transfers(5)** 5:17 7:18,23  
 9:22 43:10  
**translators(1)** 83:10  
**transmission(1)** 65:8  
**transmitted(1)** 67:11  
**transport(2)** 5:14,16  
**treat (5)** 29:17 44:25 45:4  
 55:21 62:12  
**treated (1)** 62:8  
**treating (1)** 39:3  
**treatment (9)** 54:3 55:14,20  
 56:21,23 78:4,17 80:17,25  
**trepidation(1)** 3:24  
**true (1)** 29:25  
**try (5)** 2:14 8:23 9:10 22:11  
 26:5  
**trying (9)** 9:1 18:5 26:7 27:7  
 33:11 63:16 80:5 84:6 90:1  
**turn (1)** 81:14  
**turning(1)** 23:15  
**turnover(1)** 25:9  
**tutorials(1)** 71:12  
**twelve (1)** 75:23  
**type (2)** 12:13 15:12  
**types (1)** 15:10  
**typical(2)** 23:25 40:11

---

**U**

**uk (16)** 4:8,8 19:5 46:8 53:6  
 57:20,24,25 58:6 60:13  
 66:4 67:13,14 70:1  
 85:12,16  
**ukgp(1)** 48:21  
**uki (1)** 46:20  
**ukwide(1)** 53:12  
**ultimately (1)** 86:25  
**unable(2)** 34:1 54:10  
**underlying(2)** 41:21 42:3  
**underresource(3)** 76:3,23  
 77:2  
**understand(6)** 9:13 30:4  
 32:16,18 55:17 65:16  
**understandable(1)** 79:17  
**understanding(5)** 50:7  
 84:23 87:9 90:4,6  
**understands(1)** 33:10  
**undertaken(1)** 54:23  
**unfavourably(1)** 63:6  
**union(1)** 47:2  
**unit (12)** 2:18 4:11,20 7:3  
 9:5 17:11 22:8 33:21  
 38:16,19 40:21 45:1  
**units(23)** 4:2 5:9 6:2,7 7:4  
 18:23 19:5,7,9,10  
 25:8,11,15 35:3 38:6,7,13  
 40:13,15,19 43:18,19  
 49:22  
**universally(1)** 38:13  
**universities(1)** 28:5  
**university(1)** 83:1  
**unknown(2)** 3:25 25:1  
**unlimited(1)** 44:9  
**unpredictability(1)** 13:16  
**unsatisfactory(1)** 51:4  
**unsuitable(1)** 52:21  
**unsure(1)** 50:9  
**until (7)** 5:18,25 6:4,8 27:18  
 90:11,14  
**untreated (1)** 62:12  
**unusual(1)** 89:22  
**unwell(1)** 34:1  
**updated(1)** 85:20  
**upon(5)** 24:2 39:4 55:8  
 67:21 77:11

**urban (1)** 48:7  
**used(7)** 15:9,21 18:25 20:3  
 21:6 64:23 65:12  
**useful(3)** 14:11 81:25 82:23  
**useless(1)** 51:16  
**using(10)** 3:4 19:10,25  
 20:16 49:20,20 69:9,21  
 70:20,21  
**usual(4)** 10:14 19:3 50:11  
 89:25  
**usually(12)** 5:7,8 6:3 19:15  
 20:5 21:9 22:13 28:12  
 32:20 33:8,21 39:22  
**utilisation(1)** 21:13  
**utilise (2)** 10:13 11:14  
**utilised(1)** 11:19  
**utilising(1)** 11:23

---

**V**

**vacancies(1)** 26:13  
**vacant (1)** 75:24  
**vacuum(1)** 20:5  
**valid (3)** 18:3 29:7 32:25  
**varied(4)** 14:15 17:6 24:22  
 35:14  
**variety(2)** 43:1 82:12  
**various(11)** 3:18 10:24  
 11:1,2 18:13 24:5,6 32:6  
 58:12 75:17 85:21  
**vast (1)** 38:12  
**vehicle(1)** 10:6  
**ventilation(3)** 14:7 88:3,7  
**ventilators(3)** 21:7,8,9  
**via (3)** 50:11 58:21 71:23  
**video(9)** 80:24  
 82:14,15,20,20  
 83:4,7,10,13  
**videoed(1)** 71:13  
**viewed(2)** 3:13 31:25  
**views(5)** 27:3 31:6,12,12  
 42:25  
**violence(1)** 84:11  
**visit (2)** 35:22 36:19  
**visitation(1)** 35:2  
**visiting(4)** 35:11,19 36:7,17  
**visits(1)** 33:15  
**visors(1)** 70:21  
**voice(1)** 30:5  
**voices(1)** 30:10  
**vulnerable(4)** 60:11 63:1  
 76:8 88:10

---

**W**

**waiting (4)** 12:8 77:24 78:2,3  
**wales(2)** 46:14,17  
**ward (1)** 5:4  
**wards(3)** 11:1 21:22 49:19  
**wasnt(15)** 5:20 7:8 9:5,9,19  
 14:16 15:23 16:22 17:7  
 28:16 40:6 48:22 68:9  
 73:22 79:8  
**wave (10)** 3:10 5:14  
 14:4,7,19 17:6,8 24:25  
 25:7 40:7  
**waves(5)** 6:12 21:7 25:22  
 28:15,24  
**way (12)** 1:11 8:5 23:7 34:21  
 50:4,11 68:2 69:22 73:15  
 76:23 77:21 87:15  
**ways(3)** 3:3 14:23 61:1  
**wear (1)** 15:15  
**wearers(1)** 71:7  
**wearing(3)** 36:15 49:14  
 51:14  
**wed (3)** 40:19 70:21 79:9  
**week (3)** 14:5 56:9 76:17  
**weekly(1)** 50:23  
**weeks(8)** 12:4 19:17 23:8  
 33:3,5 55:18 68:1,4  
**weight(1)** 78:12  
**welcome(2)** 3:14,24  
**welsh(1)** 46:7  
**went (6)** 13:5 36:17 65:15  
 68:4,6 74:25

**werent (10)** 28:24 39:16  
 54:24 59:20 62:5 71:13  
 73:23 74:5 75:1 79:25  
**west (1)** 7:16  
**weve (8)** 44:4 68:14 69:7  
 77:1 80:10 83:16 86:4 89:4  
**whatever(2)** 16:21 78:4  
**whats(4)** 4:5 12:5 46:10  
 47:19  
**whereas(1)** 64:9  
**whilst(3)** 4:2 9:1 47:18  
**white (1)** 52:4  
**whole(1)** 72:2  
**whose(3)** 2:3 55:1 71:7  
**widely(1)** 52:2  
**widen(1)** 83:11  
**widens(1)** 83:5  
**widespread(1)** 84:10  
**willingness(1)** 68:9  
**wished(1)** 22:8  
**wishes(1)** 40:18  
**witness(1)** 45:13  
**witnesses(2)** 1:7 89:15  
**woman(1)** 60:1  
**women(4)** 52:5,5 53:23  
 80:22  
**wonder(4)** 8:14 79:20 82:3  
 83:19  
**wondering(8)** 66:21 70:10  
 73:17 77:3 86:4,7,24 87:19  
**wont (2)** 42:1 59:14  
**work (34)** 2:4,18 3:4,5 6:14  
 10:8 13:16 15:4,14,17  
 21:19 26:20 27:18  
 28:16,17,24 39:7 47:22  
 53:14,20 55:4 56:10 62:19  
 64:11 66:6 72:16,22 73:25  
 74:3,25 76:17 84:18 89:13  
 90:2  
**worked(4)** 15:25 34:7 71:15  
 76:11  
**worker(1)** 51:12  
**workers(8)** 51:18 64:16  
 73:23 74:2,21 88:5,9,18  
**workforce(8)** 27:6,7,9 74:10  
 76:7,9 88:2,11  
**working(18)** 3:3,4,8 15:17  
 17:22 24:10,11,15 25:5  
 27:16 28:24 37:15 52:1  
 59:21,23 63:16 81:12 82:9  
**workplace(4)** 71:22,25 74:6  
 76:12,16  
**works (2)** 2:9 79:9  
**world (4)** 16:18 18:14 40:2  
 79:7  
**worried (2)** 20:19 53:14  
**worse(3)** 62:8 76:24,25  
**worsened(2)** 78:8 81:12  
**worsening(1)** 84:17  
**worst (2)** 76:5 89:1  
**wouldnt(6)** 5:22 18:6 29:5  
 44:6 77:22 78:5  
**wrong(6)** 31:3 51:8 64:5,5  
 65:11 79:5

---

**Y**

**yeah (16)** 7:13 23:2 27:15  
 32:18 48:15 58:19 59:7  
 61:11 67:1,7 68:17 69:6  
 72:9,17 75:22 78:7  
**year (1)** 79:6  
**years(12)** 2:13,14,20 3:19  
 4:9 7:22 19:17 25:13  
 80:10,21 83:17 85:4  
**yet (2)** 62:14 68:15  
**you'd (1)** 14:22  
**you'll (1)** 22:16  
**young(1)** 84:22  
**youre(25)** 12:9 17:19,20,21  
 24:9 32:24 33:6,21,22  
 41:16,17 45:21 47:18  
 50:14 53:1 60:9 63:8 66:19  
 67:9 72:7 73:17 83:23  
 85:11 86:23,24  
**you're (1)** 89:13

**youve(12)** 13:21 18:17 46:3  
 48:12 53:18 58:13 62:15  
 63:23 65:12 84:3 85:1  
 89:19

---

**1**

**1 (5)** 48:10 89:3,3 91:2,2  
**10 (1)** 70:5  
**1000 (1)** 48:4  
**10000 (1)** 47:24  
**1059 (1)** 45:9  
**1115 (1)** 45:8  
**1117 (1)** 45:11  
**120 (1)** 75:15  
**1227 (1)** 90:13  
**131 (1)** 79:19  
**132 (1)** 81:24  
**141 (1)** 83:18  
**15 (1)** 36:25  
**156 (1)** 85:8  
**160 (1)** 86:1  
**17 (2)** 48:25 49:2  
**17000 (1)** 47:2  
**18 (1)** 55:10  
**19 (3)** 27:24 51:22 53:9  
**1974 (3)** 55:4 64:11 66:6  
**1990s (1)** 2:10

---

**2**

**2 (3)** 4:22 5:5 48:10  
**20 (2)** 2:20 80:10  
**2000s (1)** 7:16  
**2013 (1)** 75:25  
**2015 (1)** 6:19  
**2018 (1)** 76:1  
**2019 (1)** 75:25  
**2020 (11)** 6:19 27:7 42:20  
 50:3 61:19,20 75:9,13  
 77:24 79:1 85:18  
**2022 (6)** 48:16 55:13,13 75:9  
 79:1 85:19  
**2023 (1)** 78:1  
**2024 (2)** 1:1 90:15  
**21 (2)** 1:1 57:19  
**22 (2)** 59:14 90:15  
**23 (1)** 85:4  
**24 (1)** 2:22  
**25 (1)** 26:3  
**2500 (1)** 48:1  
**26 (1)** 4:1

---

**3**

**3 (7)** 4:3,3,6,9 5:9,12,20  
**30 (3)** 31:2,5,16  
**3000 (2)** 47:3 48:1  
**32 (1)** 12:2  
**335000 (1)** 77:24  
**37 (1)** 13:21  
**38 (1)** 15:2  
**39 (1)** 16:13

---

**4**

**40 (1)** 60:19  
**41 (1)** 55:11  
**425 (1)** 26:2  
**45 (2)** 91:3,3  
**46 (1)** 24:14  
**47 (3)** 29:6 30:1 62:16  
**48 (2)** 33:14 36:5

---

**5**

**50 (1)** 2:13  
**52 (3)** 37:2 63:18,18  
**53 (2)** 63:21 67:9  
**55 (1)** 60:19  
**56 (1)** 26:1  
**58 (2)** 27:21 30:24  
**59 (2)** 31:4 69:8

---

**6**

**60 (2)** 2:14 37:24  
**68 (1)** 27:18  
**680000 (1)** 78:2  
**69 (2)** 71:18,20

---

**7**

**70 (1)** 72:25

---

**8**

**800 (1)** 76:2

---

**9**

**930 (3)** 90:3,10,15  
**945 (2)** 1:2 90:1  
**99 (1)** 82:13